



Report on UNICEF-Assisted Transport Operations

by
Cecil E. King
Joint Inspection Unit

Geneva
December 1973

REPORT
ON
UNICEF-ASSISTED
TRANSPORT OPERATIONS

by
Cecil E. King
Joint Inspection Unit

Geneva
December 1973

GE.74-1272

Table of Contents

	<u>Paragraphs</u>	<u>Pages</u>
INTRODUCTION		i - ii
SUMMARY OF PRINCIPAL CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS		iii - iv
Chapter I - GENERAL	1 - 19	1 - 9
Chapter II - THE SITUATION IN THE FIELD	20 - 102	9 - 44
A. INTRODUCTION	20	9 - 10
B. EASTERN MEDITERRANEAN	21 - 28	10 - 16
C. SOUTH CENTRAL ASIA	29 - 50	16 - 24
D. EAST ASIA AND PAKISTAN	51 - 70	24 - 30
E. EAST AFRICA	71 - 80	30 - 33
F. WEST AFRICA	81 - 90	33 - 37
G. LATIN AMERICA	91 - 96	37 - 40
H. HEALTH EQUIPMENT	97 - 102	41 - 44
Chapter III CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	103 - 149	44 - 59

Introduction

In a letter dated 17 July 1972, addressed to the Chairman of the Joint Inspection Unit, the Executive Director of UNICEF requested that the Unit undertake a survey of UNICEF-assisted transport operations.

It was subsequently agreed that the survey should be carried out in 1973 on a world-wide basis by Inspector C.E. King, who discussed the programme with the Executive Director and senior members of UNICEF headquarters staff during a visit to New York in October 1972. The Inspector's itinerary was as follows:

Jan 28 - Feb 17	Eastern Mediterranean region, with visits to Beirut (regional hq.), Cairo, Alexandria, Ankara and Istanbul.
Feb 18 - Mar 10	South Central Asian region, with visits to New Delhi (regional hq.), Lucknow, Varanasi, Bombay, Poona and Aurangabad.
Mar 11 - Mar 30	East Asia and Pakistan region, with visits to Bangkok (regional hq.), Indonesia and Republic of Korea.
Apr 2 - Apr 15	East African region, with visits to Nairobi (regional hq.), Tanzania, Malawi and Ethiopia.
Apr 24 - Apr 27	Headquarters office, New York.
May 16 - June 8	West African region, with visits to Abidjan (regional hq.), Mali, Liberia, Dahomey, Congo (Brazzaville), Chad and Cameroon.
Oct 5 - Oct 18	Latin American region, with visits to Peru (Lima area office) and Colombia (Bogota area office)
Oct 19 - Oct 29	Headquarters office, New York.

In all the regions visited, except Latin America, the Inspector was accompanied throughout his tour by the Regional Vehicle Management Adviser or, in the case of Indonesia, by the Vehicle Management Adviser attached to the UNICEF office in Djakarta. Unforeseen circumstances prevented a meeting with the Vehicle Management Adviser for the Latin American region, but the Inspector was able to meet the Regional Director during his stay in Peru.

The Inspector's report is attached. He takes this opportunity of expressing his warm appreciation of the efficient arrangements made for him by the Regional Vehicle Management Advisers and the other members of the UNICEF offices in the countries visited,

(ii)

and of the help and hospitality extended to him everywhere. He started his tour as an admirer of UNICEF's objectives; he ended it as an admirer, also, of the people engaged in carrying them out.

Summary of principal conclusions and recommendations

	<u>Paragraph</u>
1. Policy in regard to the replacement of UNICEF vehicles is in need of clarification.	19
2. The transport situation in Indonesia should be reviewed.	59
3. The extension of the duties of Vehicle Management Advisers to cover health equipment is reasonable, and assistance in this field should continue and if possible be intensified.	102
4. UNICEF transport policy is on the right lines but should be more flexible.	106
5. Africa to be given priority.	107
6. Process of disengagement in Latin America to continue.	103
7. Priorities to be reviewed within each region.	109
8. Need for economy in supply of project vehicles should be written into standing instructions to programme officers.	111
9. Regional Vehicle Management Advisers to be consulted on all aspects of transport requirements for projects.	111
10. Working of Circular EXD 2087 regarding duties and responsibilities of RVMA's should be revised.	112
11. Other measures to be considered aiming at economy in supply of project vehicles.	113
12. Potential advantages of purchasing locally assembled and/or locally manufactured vehicles to be borne in mind.	114-115
13. UNICEF should not undertake to supply spare parts except on recommendation of RVMAs. Priority to be given to poorer countries.	116
14. Existing policy in regard to establishment of Transport Management Organizations (TMOs) is sound but needs to be flexibly applied.	118
15. UNICEF-assisted workshops should continue to be equipped for preventive maintenance and light repairs only.	119
16. In general, commercial workshops and central workshops run by governments are not satisfactory substitutes for UNICEF-assisted workshops, but exceptions occur and advantage should be taken of them.	120-122
17. Cases of misuse of project vehicles should continue to be dealt with personally by the appropriate UNICEF representatives. Suggestions for countering misuse.	123-124

	<u>Paragraph</u>
18. UNICEF's policy of retaining ownership of all project vehicles should be reviewed in favour of a more flexible procedure.	125-130
19. Vehicle report forms should not normally be more frequent than six-monthly.	132
20. All forms etc. used in connexion with vehicle management to be simplified and standardized as far as possible.	132
21. Exclusive UNICEF control of vehicle workshops considered impractical. A better solution, when a workshop is in difficulties, is to appoint an expert to run it on a temporary basis.	134-135
22. Consideration to be given to possibility of making services of UNICEF-assisted workshops available to other UN organizations.	136
23. More attention should be paid to training of transport personnel. Possibility of enlisting co-operation of other UN organizations (e.g. ILO, UNIDO) should be studied and consideration given to the appointment of a training officer based at headquarters. Meanwhile RVMAs should continue their efforts to persuade governments to organize systematic training of transport personnel.	137-139
24. The system of RVMAs should be retained and strengthened by giving them assistants. A transport adviser should be appointed to the East African region. If the RVMA for Latin America is not replaced when transferred, arrangements should be made to continue transport assistance to those governments in need of them, e.g. by appointing a transport adviser to the Lima area office.	140-144
25. The advantages of using experts provided by UN or bilateral agencies, or by volunteer organizations, should be borne in mind.	145
26. The VMA at headquarters should also have an assistant, and be relieved of procurement work. He should remain a member of the Supply Division.	146
27. "Transport Officer" or "Transport and Equipment Officer" is suggested as a less cumbersome alternative to "Vehicle Management (and Equipment) Adviser".	147
28. A meeting of VMAs should be held as soon as convenient. It should be attended by senior headquarters staff.	148
29. The standing instructions and guidance relating to transport are in need of revision and consolidation. If the task is undertaken by the VMA at headquarters, he will need extra help.	149

UNICEF-ASSISTED TRANSPORT OPERATIONS

Chapter I

1. Since the beginning of UNICEF's activities in aid of children in 1946, the provision of vehicles (four-wheel and two-wheel) has been an essential part of its services. In the early days of "mass programmes" for the distribution of food and clothing and the inoculation of children against disease, and in the subsequent malaria eradication campaigns, the need was obvious. It is perhaps less obvious now that "mass action" has given way to more elaborate and longer-term programmes aimed at the development of basic health services and education and working with and through more highly developed and effective administrations than existed in many countries in the aftermath of Second World War. But the numerous UNICEF representatives and other officials in developing countries with whom the author of this report had discussions in the course of his investigations were unanimous that motorized transport is, and will remain in the foreseeable future, an indispensable component of UNICEF-assisted projects and programmes in developing countries. A doctor in charge of a group of rural clinics cannot visit them unless he has a vehicle at his disposal when he needs it. The same applies to a district nurse, or to a school inspector, or to a training centre whose pupils have to be brought in every day from their homes or taken to visit hospitals in the district. The need for vehicles is all the greater in countries where public transport facilities are non-existent, or at best inadequate and overloaded, especially in rural areas, where UNICEF's services are generally most needed.

2. Vehicles are, however, expensive and few developing countries possess the financial means of acquiring them in sufficient numbers to meet all their needs. Consequently, UNICEF has been obliged to provide from its own resources the vehicles necessary for the implementation of UNICEF-assisted projects and governments have come to regard UNICEF as the main if not the sole source of vehicles for such purposes.

3. According to figures supplied by the headquarters office, UNICEF expenditure on programme transport (i.e. vehicles, spare parts, equipment for workshops etc.) during the period 1958 to 1972 inclusive amounted to approximately \$76 million, or 17 per cent of total programme expenditure during the period. The figure for the three-year period 1970-1971 inclusive is \$21 million, or about 16 per cent of total programme expenditure.

4. The number of programme vehicles in use at the end of 1972 in the five regions under review (i.e. excluding Europe and North Africa) was nearly 19,000, with a replacement value of about \$60 million. They were distributed (in round figures) as follows:

Africa	3,440
East Asia and Pakistan	3,435
Eastern Mediterranean	3,610
Latin America	1,710
South Central Asia	<u>6,690</u>
	<u>18,885</u>

The number of vehicles in any one country ranges from over 6,000 in India to a few score or less in smaller countries; four of the Caribbean islands have one UNICEF vehicle each. There can be few countries in the developing world where UNICEF-provided vehicles, painted off-white and carrying the blue circular UNICEF badge or "decal", are not a familiar sight.

5. Unlike the rest of the equipment and other goods supplied by UNICEF in connexion with its programmes, vehicles (along with certain special items such as drilling rigs) are not donated but loaned to the governments concerned. Each vehicle supplied to a government is the subject of a formal document, known as a Vehicle Loan Agreement (VLA), which is signed by a representative of the government (usually by the appropriate Minister, e.g. of Health, Education etc.) and the UNICEF representative. The VLA identifies the vehicle (make and type, serial or chassis number, engine number, date of supply etc.); specifies the use to which the vehicle is to be put (normally by reference to the relevant project); relieves UNICEF of responsibility in connexion with accident claims etc.; provides for reimbursement in the event of loss; lays upon the governments concerned the responsibility for the establishment and maintenance, "in a manner acceptable to UNICEF", of "adequate facilities" for the operation, maintenance and repair of the vehicle, including a system of vehicle control records to which UNICEF will have access on demand, and the submission of semi-annual condition reports to UNICEF; and contains a number of other clauses of which the most important provide for (i) absolute UNICEF ownership of the vehicle "unless and until title thereto has been formally transferred to the government"; (ii) UNICEF's right to withdraw the vehicle, or transfer it to other projects, at UNICEF's discretion; and (iii) UNICEF's right to dispose of the vehicle by sale or transfer of title to the government in the event of its becoming obsolete or redundant.

6. A standard text for use in drawing up vehicle loan agreements was circulated to UNICEF representatives by the New York headquarters in 1965 (EXPRO 86 of 19 April 1965). In certain countries, a master loan agreement has been signed covering all vehicles provided by UNICEF after the date of signing; for each vehicle delivered the government concerned signs a receipt giving appropriate details, identifying the project for which it is to be used and referring to the master agreement.

7. Paragraph 5 above refers to the obligation undertaken by the government, under the terms of the VLA, to ensure that a vehicle provided by UNICEF is not only properly used but also properly cared for. The fulfilment of this condition, as the text of the agreement makes clear, implies the existence both of administrative machinery for controlling the operation of the vehicle (i.e. a transport organization) and of facilities for its regular maintenance and, when necessary, for repairing it (i.e. a workshop).

8. In many countries to which UNICEF supplied vehicles, it was soon found that official machinery for controlling the use of the vehicles either did not exist, or was ineffective; and that such facilities as existed for their maintenance and repair were inadequate and/or were either (in the case of government workshops) not available to the particular Ministries with which UNICEF was associated, or (in the case of commercial workshops) too expensive. To overcome these difficulties, UNICEF adopted a policy of encouraging and assisting the Ministries in question to set up and operate their own transport management organizations (TMO's) for controlling and servicing their vehicles, including those supplied by UNICEF, on the lines described below. The extent to which this policy has succeeded is the main concern of this report.

9. UNICEF's assistance to governments in respect of TMO's is usually based on formal agreements known as Transport Plans of Operation (Planops), on the analogy of the "Project Planops" signed by the government and UNICEF representatives for UNICEF-assisted projects. Since the first was signed in 1962, Transport Planops have been negotiated with some forty governments, usually represented by the Ministry of Health as the principal beneficiary of UNICEF aid and the main user of UNICEF-provided vehicles. Each Transport Planops is tailored to the particular circumstances prevailing in the country concerned, but the agreements have in common the following basic features, which are to be found in a standard text circulated to UNICEF representatives in EXPRO 86 of 19 April 1965:

- (a) a reference to the basic agreement between UNICEF and the government;
- (b) a statement of the objective of the plan, e.g. (to quote an actual example), "to ensure that vehicles operated by the government in health, education, nutrition and social services programmes, including in particular those projects to which UNICEF has provided or may in the future provide assistance, shall receive proper maintenance and repairs and be properly controlled so as to give maximum support to the services";

- (c) Under the heading "Plan of Action", the agreement provides for:
- (i) The establishment, by a given date, of a Transport Division within the Ministry concerned under a Director of Transport directly responsible to the appropriate senior official (e.g. the Director-General of Supplies and Equipment). The function of the Division is "to see to it that all vehicles used in the government's health etc. programmes, especially (but not necessarily exclusively) those used in programmes assisted by UNICEF, are kept constantly in good and safe operating condition so as to minimize vehicle breakdowns, to keep maintenance costs to a minimum by assuring timely repair of minor weaknesses before they develop into major vehicle failures, and to prolong the economically useful life of the vehicles to a maximum";
 - (ii) The training and testing of drivers;
 - (iii) The setting up and operation, on modern management lines, of one or more static workshops, a spare parts warehouse and one or more mobile maintenance units, as required.
 - (iv) The maintenance of vehicle control and performance records and of spare parts inventory control records;
 - (v) The provision of the necessary "fully qualified and competent" staff to assist the Director of Transport, i.e. workshop foremen, various categories of mechanics, a spare parts warehouse manager, a vehicle control manager and appropriate clerical staff. The Planops may stipulate that the governments will consult with UNICEF in the selection and appointment of the Director of Transport;
 - (vi) The provision by the Ministry of the necessary premises and facilities;
 - (vii) An annual Transport budget, forming part of the Ministry's overall budget;
 - (viii) Use of the TMO by other Ministries "for the maintenance and control of their UNICEF vehicles only", on mutually agreed financial terms.
- (d) A section headed "Commitments of UNICEF" provides for:
- (i) "Such continuing advice and counsel as may be required for the appropriate establishment and normal operation of the Transport Division", to be provided through the appropriate UNICEF area office and/or through

visits of the Transport Officer attached to the appropriate UNICEF regional office;

- (ii) The supply by UNICEF of specified tools and equipment for the workshop(s), of any mobile maintenance units specified in the agreement and of spare parts for UNICEF vehicles for a specified period (usually five years) on the basis of four per cent per annum of the original vehicle cost;
- (iii) The provision of further equipment, etc. by UNICEF to be considered "in conjunction with requests (by the government) for general assistance to specific individual projects", it being understood that such equipment is intended "for the direct use of the transport organization as a whole".
- (e) A section headed "Commitments of the Government" briefly recapitulates the commitments mentioned in sub-paragraph (c) (i) above, adding an undertaking by the government to provide any necessary tools, equipment etc., not furnished by UNICEF;
- (f) A final section provides, inter alia, that the agreement will remain in effect "until such time as UNICEF assistance (to the country concerned) shall have been completed, including such time as may be necessary for winding-up operations".

10. In addition to the general provisions summarized above, the Transport Planops contains special provisions related to the particular circumstances and requirements of the government and country (or province) concerned, e.g. the size and location of a workshop, the date by which it is to be completed, the value of UNICEF's annual contribution in respect of spare parts, etc. It may also include, in the form of annexes, detailed guidance on the organization of the TMO, the qualifications and duties of key personnel, model budgets, etc. UNICEF's undertaking to supply spare parts is usually made conditional on their being properly stored and accounted for, and in some cases the agreement commits the government to contribute to the cost of the spare parts on an increasing scale over a five-year period, its contribution reaching 100 per cent in the fifth year. A Planops may also include provision for the appointment of a transport consultant for a specified period (up to one year) to assist in the setting up of the TMO and in the training of personnel.

11. EXPRO 86 comments that "in spite of the fact that UNICEF has furnished a good deal of motor transport, projects are often hampered by lack of transport. One reason for this is that in many cases UNICEF vehicles are not being operated, maintained or repaired properly To overcome this problem UNICEF is currently encouraging and assisting governments to establish an efficient transport organization ..." A later paragraph points out that a "Plan of Operations concerning a transport organization does not mean that a transport organization will be regarded as a separate project. We will continue to regard this as subsidiary to, and part of, the project(s) which the transport organization exists to serve".

12. To assist in the implementation of UNICEF transport policy, transport officers were appointed to UNICEF headquarters and regional offices. The headquarters officer was appointed at the beginning of 1961 as a member of the staff of the Director of the Supply Division. Later in the year the first regional officer was appointed to the office of the regional representative for South Central Asia, in New Delhi, and similar appointments in the other regions followed during the next few years. The official title was subsequently changed to (Regional) Vehicle Management Adviser and, more recently to (Regional) Vehicle and Equipment Management Adviser. There are now RVMA's stationed in Beirut (Eastern Mediterranean region, extended to cover Turkey), New Delhi (South Central Asia), Bangkok (East Asia and Pakistan), Abidjan (West Africa, including Ghana and Nigeria) and Santiago (Latin America). (The former Adviser in East Africa left in 1970 for Abidjan and has not been replaced, but he continues to attend to East Africa when necessary, on an unofficial basis). The Advisers are assisted in a few countries by expatriate transport advisers or consultants, who may be attached to the UNICEF area office concerned (Djakarta) or work as temporary managers of TMO's (Bamako, Ndjamena, Monrovia). In Cameroon and Dahomey, assistance is being given in the training and the running of workshops by experts provided by the West German and Swiss technical aid organizations. In the Republic of Korea a member of the local staff is employed as Transport and Supply Assistant.

13. The duties and responsibilities of Vehicle Management Advisers are set out in a headquarters instruction to UNICEF representatives, EXD 2087 of 8 November 1967. This states that "it is part of the duties of a VMA to assist UNICEF programme staff and governments in determining the types of vehicles and transport equipment required for project implementation and assisting to develop or improve vehicle management. On the other hand, it is the primary responsibility of a UNICEF representative to negotiate with governments in regard to all requests for UNICEF assistance and to make recommendations for allocation of funds. A VMA in the field occupies the position of a

consultant/adviser ... the UNICEF representative usually delegates responsibility to the adviser for negotiations with appropriate government representatives in matters relating to vehicle management or transport organization, but the ultimate decision on the amount of assistance to be recommended and the number and types of vehicles etc. to be included in any particular recommendation is a programme issue".

14. The instruction further comments on the VMA's participation in the selection of vehicles for projects in the following terms: "The need for the advice and assistance of the VMA in deciding those issues is obviously variable. The extent to which it is necessary in each particular case to enlist the services of a VMA in determining transport requirements obviously depends upon the nature of the request and its related problems". The technical advice of the VMA should be sought "wherever any sizable recommendation is in view" for the disposal or replacement of a UNICEF vehicle.

15. The instruction further states that "VMA's have as their most important duty to encourage governments to develop or improve transport operations affecting UNICEF-assisted programmes" and that, if they encounter major obstacles in the pursuit of this objective, such as persistent failure on the part of a government to set aside adequate funds for the proper running of a TMO, the situation should be dealt with by the UNICEF representative concerned.

16. Finally, the instruction lays down that the allocation of a VMA's time is a matter for agreement between all concerned, including the Regional Director, who has the final say. A VMA may legitimately be asked "to assist in clarifying supply and equipment questions outside his normal functions", but such assignments should not interfere with his main work, nor should he have to spend too much time on minor routine work, such as dealing with requests for spare parts.

17. In addition to EXD 2087, referred to above, instructions and guidance both to RVMA's and to UNICEF representatives in the field on different aspects of the supply and maintenance of programme vehicles are to be found in a variety of other documents issued during the past fifteen years by the headquarters office. These include the Field Manual (now in process of revision), circulars in the EXPRO series, Transport Bulletins issued from time to time by the Vehicle Management Adviser in New York, the Operations Manual for Transport Officers, etc. The more important of these instructions (which are much in need of revision and consolidation) are as follows:

- (a) Advice to UNICEF field officers on how to determine the numbers and types of vehicles to be recommended for a project. This advice, which is to be found in certain parts of the 1961 Field Manual, is of a very general nature,

as is probably inevitable in view of the wide variety of conditions with which field officers have to cope, and deals only with Basic Health Services and malaria and leprosy programmes; but it does attempt to lay down rules and criteria, and indicates certain limits to be observed, in the provision of vehicles. Detailed advice on the selection of vehicle types in the light of varying circumstances (nature of work, operating costs, road conditions, climate, availability of spare parts, etc. etc.) is contained in the Transport Bulletins issued from time to time by the Vehicle Management Adviser in New York. (EXD 2087 reminds field officers that no advance undertaking should be made to governments regarding specific makes of vehicles);

- (b) Instructions regarding the disposal or replacement of vehicles when they have, either accidentally or in the normal course of events, reached the end of their useful life. The principal instructions regarding disposal are contained in Financial Circular No. 46, dated September 1968 on the composition, responsibilities and procedures of Property Survey Boards, and (in more detailed form) in Supplement No. 1 to the Circular, dated October 1969. The gist of these instructions is that:
- (i) a project vehicle may be transferred to a government when UNICEF has completed its assistance to the project;
 - (ii) a usable vehicle no longer needed for the particular purpose for which it was provided may be transferred to some other use within the project or to some other UNICEF-assisted project;
 - (iii) an obsolete vehicle may be transferred to a UNICEF- or government-supported vocational training institution, or sold, or salvaged for usable spare parts, according to circumstances, provided that the net proceeds of sale "are expected to be sufficient to justify the time effort and expense involved ...". Where, however, government regulations (including e.g. customs formalities) make the sale unprofitable, "the vehicle will be disposed of by transfer of title to the government".

18. The present status of the regulations summarized in the preceding paragraph is, however, not clear in view of a statement in Supplement No. 2 to Financial Circular No. 46, dated October 1972, that "a general review of procedures relating to programme vehicles is under consideration" and that meanwhile the instructions contained in the

Field Manual and in Circular EXPRO 86 are to be strictly observed. The reference to the Field Manual is presumably to Vol. II, Part VI, Section 6, Sub-section 01 (paragraphs 001-007), which deals with the Replacement and Disposal of Programme Vehicles, but these instructions are dated 1954. EXPRO 86, although more recent - April 1965 - is still three years older than Financial Circular No. 46, and is exclusively concerned with circulating revised standard texts of Vehicle Loan Agreements and Transport Planops (see paragraphs 6 and 9 above).

19. The most recent policy instruction regarding the replacement of project vehicles appears to be that contained in Circular EXPRO 10 of 19 January 1962, which states that "Vehicles for permanent services may be replaced where vehicles originally provided by UNICEF have been well used and well maintained". (Underlining as in original text). It is, however, stated in the 1961 edition of the Field Manual (Vol. I, Part XII) that "UNICEF does not replace motor vehicles for mother and child welfare services and provides them only on condition that the government will replace them." The two statements are not necessarily inconsistent, but it is recommended that UNICEF vehicle replacement policy should be clarified, and that if no replacement of vehicles is contemplated in regard to a particular project, this should be made clear in the project planops.

Chapter II

THE SITUATION IN THE FIELD

A. Introduction

20. In Chapter I are indicated, in summary form, the essential elements of UNICEF policy in regard to transport, and the administrative machinery (instructions and guidance to UNICEF representatives, appointment of Vehicle Management Advisers in New York and the regional offices, etc.) which has been set up to carry it out. The present chapter surveys the situation, and attempts to assess the progress achieved, in the six regions visited, i.e. the Eastern Mediterranean (Section B), South Central Asia (Section C), East Asia and Pakistan (Section D), East Africa (Section E), West Africa (Section F) and Latin America (Section G). (Section H deals with non-transport equipment). The assessment is based on exhaustive discussions with four of the five Regional Vehicle Management Advisers, who accompanied the writer throughout his stay in their respective regions;^{1/} on interviews with UNICEF regional and area representatives and members of their staffs and with officials in the Ministries concerned (in

^{1/} Unforeseen circumstances prevented a meeting with the RVMA for Latin America.

several cases with the Minister himself); with UNDP resident representatives and other senior UN officials in the majority of the twenty countries visited; and on visits to over thirty UNICEF-assisted vehicle management and repair workshops, and in some countries to additional workshops, both government-run and commercial.

B. Eastern Mediterranean

21. The RVMA, stationed in Beirut, is responsible for the eighteen countries in the region and also for Turkey, which is otherwise part of the European and North African region. The total number of UNICEF vehicles listed as operating in this area in December 1972 was about 3,600 representing an increase of 250 since the corresponding period of 1970. The vehicles were distributed as follows:

Iran	1,204
Turkey	996
Arab Republic of Egypt	490
Iraq	365
Sudan	181
Syria	120
Jordan	94
People's Democratic Republic of Yemen	45
Cyprus	35
Yemen Arab Republic	30
Saudi Arabia	20
Lebanon	18
Bahrain	11
Sultanate of Oman	7 (under order)
Total:	<u>3,616</u>

22. The above list represents about ten makes and many more models of vehicles, with four-wheel drive vehicles and small buses prominent in the passenger category.

23. Transport Plans have been concluded with Turkey (1966), Iraq (1969), Syria (1971) and Iran (1973). At the time of the Inspector's visit (early 1973), draft agreements were under discussion with the Government of Jordan and the Egyptian Family Planning Board, and requests for assistance in establishing transport organizations had been received from the Egyptian and Sudanese Ministries of Health. The Saudi Arabian Ministry of Health has also requested assistance in connexion with vehicle maintenance.

24. The situation in regard to the maintenance and repair of the vehicles shows wide variations between countries. In five of them (Bahrain, Cyprus, Jordan, Lebanon and Saudi Arabia) adequate commercial facilities are available to the Ministries concerned and the latter's responsibilities are limited to the proper operation of their vehicle fleets, including, of course, arrangements for their regular servicing by suitable local firms. In such countries, few if any problems arise for the RVMA. In other countries, the situation ranges from satisfactory to unsatisfactory, with a majority of the countries in question belonging to the latter rather than the former category. In a report dated May 1971, the RVMA comments that "many vehicles supplied by UNICEF are operating below economic minimum mileage". The principal obstacles to progress in these countries may be summarized as follows:

- (a) shortage of trained mechanics and other skilled workers - one of the more acute and intractable problems facing developing countries.
- (b) Lack of funds. Some of the countries in the region are by no means short of funds, but in others there is scarcely enough money to go round, and even in countries where financial stringency is not acute, government departments concerned with such matters as health and social welfare tend to have low priority in the allocation of funds. Moreover, unlike say, postal or bus services, they are not revenue-producing and are therefore wholly dependent for their cash needs on allocations by the Ministry of Finance. As a relatively novel and non-traditional institution, a transport organization also tends to have low priority.
- (c) Inadequate pay of government employees, particularly in the lower grades. The result of this is that a government transport organization cannot afford to take on skilled workers even if they are available; it therefore recruits unskilled men who, as soon as they have acquired a measure of skill, tend to disappear into private enterprise where they can command higher rates of pay. (In two of the countries visited by the writer the official wages paid to some personnel were being supplemented by means of indirect subsidies, this being the only way of retaining their services).
- (d) Apart from the lack of trained mechanics etc., there is an acute shortage in many countries of people with the managerial qualifications needed for running a transport organization or a vehicle workshop.

- (e) Lack of alternative facilities for the servicing of UNICEF vehicles. The possible alternatives to transport organizations set up with UNICEF advice and assistance are:

- (i) facilities organized on a commercial basis. These may be operated entirely by private enterprise or may be wholly or partly state-controlled. Reference has been made (see paragraph 24) to the existence of adequate commercially run facilities in five of the countries for which the RVMA in Beirut is responsible. Such facilities exist also in other countries in the area, but are restricted to the major cities; if they are efficient, their charges tend to be prohibitive for government departments which are short of funds.
 - (ii) Government facilities other than those set up with UNICEF advice and assistance. Government-run workshops for servicing official vehicles exist in most countries in the area, but they are almost always operated by individual organizations (e.g. the armed forces, the police, the Public Works Department, etc.) for their own vehicles, and their services are not in practice (even if they are in theory) available to other organizations or Ministries. In only two countries in the area (Sudan and the People's Democratic Republic of Yemen) are government workshops officially available for servicing UNICEF vehicles, and in the case of Sudan the Ministry of Health has applied to UNICEF for help on the grounds that the government workshop is unable to handle the increasing number of Health vehicles.
 - (iii) Facilities set up by UN organizations other than UNICEF. The only example in the area is the UNDP vehicle workshop in Taiz in the Yemen Arab Republic, where the expatriate supervisor and the local staff are paid direct by UNDP. The workshop is available for servicing the relatively small number (thirty) of UNICEF vehicles in the country.
- (f) Administrative and organizational weakness. This is in part a consequence of (d), but may also have other causes, e.g. jurisdictional conflicts between government departments, arbitrary exercise of authority etc.. A familiar consequence of such weakness is failure to translate plans into actual practice. Such failure is accompanied either by a state of confusion

due to lack of controls, or to excessive rigidity because the controls are too tight; sometimes there is a combination of the two. Another familiar symptom is reluctance on the part of officials to take decisions. All these situations make progress difficult, and hamper efficiency.

- (g) Shortage of spare parts and tools. With few exceptions these have to be imported and the necessary foreign exchange is often difficult to obtain. In some countries in the region, automotive spare parts and tools are virtually black market commodities, with the result that UNICEF supplies either disappear rapidly, or, in order to prevent their disappearance, are hoarded and not used at all. This poses problems for the RVMA, who in such a situation is understandably reluctant to recommend approval of requests for additional supplies. Even in countries where adequate arrangements have been made for the storage and distribution of spare parts, the provision in the Transport Planops committing the government to take over financial responsibility for their purchase over an agreed period (see paragraph 10) has usually remained a dead letter, and UNICEF continues to receive requests for spare parts, after the expiry of the agreed period, which it is difficult to turn down. In other words, UNICEF is spending more on spare parts than was foreseen when the Planops were negotiated, and a commitment originally intended to be limited threatens to become unlimited.
- (h) Failure to recognize the need for systematic preventive maintenance of vehicles. In some countries this need is understood, but in many others vehicle maintenance, even of the most elementary kind, tends to be neglected until a breakdown occurs. The problem is usually aggravated by careless driving, causing heavy wear and a high accident rate. The inevitable result is to further increase the pressure on repair facilities which are probably already inadequate, and to immobilize, for unduly prolonged periods, an unduly high proportion of vehicles awaiting repair. The natural course, in such circumstances, is to ask for a new vehicle rather than wait for an indefinite time for the old one to be repaired.
- (i) Inadequate reporting. The stipulation in each Vehicle Loan Agreement that periodical utilization and condition reports in respect of UNICEF-provided vehicles should be furnished by the government concerned (see paragraph 5) is seldom respected. When reports are submitted, it is usually only after several reminders from the RVMA or the UNICEF representative concerned, and

even then they may be mere copies of previous reports, and therefore unreliable. (One field officer told the Inspector that he had sent over 1,000 reminders to the local authorities.) This makes it difficult to determine what proportion of the UNICEF vehicle fleet in the country concerned is genuinely, as distinct from theoretically, operational without undertaking an expensive and time-consuming ad hoc survey. In a memorandum submitted for discussion at the annual regional staff meeting in 1971, the RVMA in Beirut comments that "the present standard of vehicle status reporting within the region is very poor both regarding ... contents and timing and gives very little information as to how UNICEF transport is being used ...". After pointing out certain apparent discrepancies in the official instructions regarding the frequency of such reports (the standard text for Vehicle Loan Agreements gives six months, but a later instruction from headquarters, NYT-1665, of 14 June 1966, allows for up to twelve months, and an instruction dated 9 September 1969 (NYT-3416) suggests three months), the memorandum proposes the introduction of an amended system based on 3-monthly reports to be collected from users of UNICEF vehicles by UNICEF field and area offices. The writer was informed that the system was introduced in 1972. It remains to be seen whether it brings about a much needed improvement.

- (j) Misuse of vehicles. In addition to abuse due to bad driving and negligent maintenance (see (h)), a vehicle can be misused: (i) personally, e.g. when the official in charge of it uses it for private journeys, and (ii) officially, e.g. by an authority other than that to which the vehicle is allocated, or for official purposes other than those specified in the relevant agreements. Stories of such misuse are current in most countries, although the evidence is seldom good enough to justify a formal complaint. A related but subordinate problem is that of the misuse of UNICEF-supplied spare parts for the repair of non-UNICEF vehicles.
- (k) A preference for four-wheel drive vehicles, even when these are used exclusively in surroundings which do not call for four-wheel drive, such as towns. Since four-wheel drive vehicles are more expensive to buy and to run than two wheel drive vehicles of equivalent capacity, the preference sometimes needs to be resisted.

25. Not all the nineteen countries for which the RVMA in Beirut is responsible require his continuing services, but those that do keep him fully occupied. While UNICEF's advice and assistance in matters of transport are primarily concerned with the

utilization and maintenance of UNICEF vehicles, the Transport Planops make it clear that the transport organizations set up in accordance with their provisions are not solely intended to care for UNICEF vehicles only; indeed, it would be unrealistic to expect them to do so, and ideally they should service all vehicles operated by the Ministry or Ministries carrying out programmes of interest to UNICEF. The RVMA is thus involved in problems of organization, management, training etc., which extend beyond his immediate concern with the actual vehicles, spare parts and other equipment furnished by UNICEF.

26. The importance of training, both for drivers and for mechanics, is obvious, and it is not surprising that the RVMA devotes a good deal of his attention to training questions. His work programme for 1973 contains nine references to various aspects of training (organization of technical courses, on-the-job training, improvement of training departments in transport organizations, etc.) in four countries of the region. During the winter of 1972-1973 he was able to arrange for a group of mechanics from the Sultanate of Oman to undergo a course of training offered by Middle East Airlines in Beirut. Details of the course were worked out between the RVMA and the officials concerned, and the scheme was given favourable publicity in the Beirut press. A report dated May 1972 contains detailed recommendations for assisting the establishment and operation of a training centre in Oman; this is now in hand. Other proposals for providing training for mechanics etc. from Oman in Sudan and Turkey were being pursued. Arrangements were also made, at the request of the Syrian authorities, for an instructor from Turkey to provide training for some twenty mechanics in Syria. In 1972, a training department for drivers and mechanics were organized within the transport directorate of the Ministry of Health in Iraq and a two-week technical training course, arranged by the RVMA and conducted by an expert sent by a firm of vehicle manufacturers at its own expense, was also attended by students from the UNICEF-assisted transport organizations in Morocco and Syria. A similar course was held in Turkey in addition to local training courses, and more are planned. (The Director-General of the Ministry of Health in Ankara specifically mentioned to the Inspector assistance in training as one of the RVMA's services for which the Turkish authorities were grateful.) Finally, the RVMA distributes instructional material in Arabic translation, some of it written by himself; the writer saw three pamphlets addressed to transport directors and workshop managers giving detailed guidance on preventive maintenance, transport management and the calculation of technical manpower requirements for a transport organization.

27. At the time of drafting of this report, plans were in hand for a UNICEF Regional Transport and Equipment Management Conference to be held at Teheran in September 1973. The conference was to be hosted by the Iranian Government and attended by participants from most of the countries in the region. It will clearly have considerable educational value.

28. In a memorandum to the Regional Director dated January 1973, the RVMA submitted his work programme for the year. This involved visits to six of the countries of the region (Iran, Syria, Oman, Egypt, Iraq and Turkey) in order of priority. A following memorandum states that "Demands on VMA services in the region are steadily increasing and reaching a point where a one-man VMA operation is not enough to render a full range of assistance to the countries with on-going TMO projects and simultaneously catering for a desirable expansion and extension of such services to all countries within the region. The time and capacity limit has for instance made it necessary to concentrate on six countries only in 1973, of which three are on-going projects, one newly started and two in an advanced preparatory stage. Seven countries in the region (excluding Lebanon but counting the United Arab Emirates as one country) cannot be included in the visit schedule due to lack of time." These considerations led the RVMA to recommend the appointment, through the Swedish Government's development aid organization, of an "Associate Field Officer" to act as his assistant. The duties proposed, and the qualifications needed, are specified; the intention is that the assistant should devote a good deal of his time to visiting countries in the region in order to give on-the-spot advice and assistance in connexion with training, the layout of workshops and installation of equipment, etc. The Inspector understands that the Swedish Government has been invited to furnish a suitable candidate.

C. South Central Asia

Introduction

29. The region covers five countries, ranging geographically from Mongolia to the Indian Ocean. The UNICEF vehicles listed in the region at the end of October 1972 were distributed as follows:

India	6,201
Afghanistan	236 (plus 58 on order)
Sri Lanka	201
Nepal	46
Mongolia	3 (plus 6 motor cycles)
<u>Total:</u>	<u>6,687</u>

30. Since his appointment to New Delhi in April 1971, the RVMA has paid two visits each to Afghanistan and Nepal for the purpose of drafting and signing Transport Planops and for other work in connection with the setting up of UNICEF-assisted transport maintenance organizations, and one visit to Sri Lanka. Within India, he has visited ten or eleven of the States, some of them more than once, and further visits are planned both in India and to other countries in the region.

31. According to figures supplied to the writer in New Delhi, expenditure on transport in the region (i.e. on vehicles, spare parts, tools and equipment and cash for training courses etc.) rose from \$905,000 or about 13.5 per cent of total programme expenditure in 1970, to \$2.42 million, or 51 per cent in 1972. The latter figure is, however, inflated by the fact that a majority of the vehicles imported in 1971 were diverted to emergency relief work in connexion with the Bangladesh crisis, their cost being subsequently reimbursed by the High Commissioner for Refugees, so that additional vehicles had to be ordered in 1972 to fill the gap. Allowing for this, the average for the two years 1971 and 1972 might be about 25 per cent.

India

32. The present report is mainly concerned with India which, at the end of March 1973, accounted for 93 per cent of UNICEF-provided vehicles in the region, or about 6,720, an increase of 8 per cent over the 1972 figure. They were distributed as follows:

Madhya Pradesh	753
Uttar Pradesh	724
Maharashtra	674
Andhra Pradesh	612
Tamil Nadu	498
Mysore	447
Gujarat	425
Orissa	320
Bihar	300
Kerala	289
Rajasthan	288
Punjab	271
West Bengal	269
16 other States and territories	851
	<hr/>
	6,721
	<hr/>

33. Of the above total about 5,800 vehicles are imported, and the remaining 900 are of Indian manufacture (see paragraph 34(b) below). Of the imported vehicles, 1,672 were over 10 years old at the end of 1972; 179 were over 15 years old, and 3 over 20 years old. Owing to the widespread failure (despite frequent reminders from UNICEF) to furnish the periodical vehicle utilization and condition reports required by the vehicle loan agreements, it is uncertain how many of these vehicles are in service. It is estimated in New Delhi that at least 20 per cent (i.e. 1,160) are off the road and that many of these are beyond economic repair. On the other hand, old and even ancient vehicles still in use are a common sight in India. In one Government transport organization visited by the writer the average age of the vehicles was 9 years, and all of them seemed to be in working order.

34. In addition to its sub-continental size, India differs from the other countries in the region in two respects of importance from the point of view of this report:

- (a) Its states and union territories have their own governments, including Ministries of Health and other government departments in charge of UNICEF-assisted programmes. Since 1963 fifteen of them have established State Health Transport Organizations (SHTO's) on the lines laid down in a revised Planops agreed between UNICEF and the central Government in that year. In 1965 a Central Health Transport Organization (CHTO) was established in New Delhi under the control of the Directorate-General of Health Services in accordance with an addendum to the revised Planops, agreed between UNICEF and the Ministry of Health.
- (b) India manufactures its own vehicles and does not permit the commercial importation of vehicles manufactured abroad. Until 1972, UNICEF supplied imported vehicles in connection with UNICEF-assisted programmes in the various states and territories. In that year, a decision to stop the supply of imported vehicles and to supply Indian-manufactured vehicles was put into effect. Of the 6,720-odd UNICEF vehicles referred to in paragraph 32, about 5,800 were imported, covering 9 makes and over 20 models. The balance, mainly jeeps, were ordered from the Indian manufacturers under a contract signed in March 1972 and renewed in February 1973. It is estimated that about 1,000 of these Indian-manufactured vehicles will have been ordered by the end of 1973. Payment is made in US dollars, the prices (allowing for savings on freight etc.) being comparable with those paid for

equivalent imported vehicles. From the point of view both of UNICEF and of the Indian authorities receiving the vehicles, this arrangement has substantial advantages:

- (i) UNICEF is relieved of the obligation to supply spare parts for the vehicles, since parts are obtainable locally;
- (ii) The range of Indian-manufactured vehicle types and models is relatively narrow and their design is simpler and less subject to change than is the case with most imported vehicles, so that they are familiar to drivers and mechanics everywhere and relatively easy to service;
- (iii) So long as present production rates are maintained, delivery can be effected within 8 weeks or so of call-forward, instead of 12 to 18 months needed for imported vehicles. Payment in US dollars means that UNICEF's orders rate as export orders, thus ensuring high priority.

35. The decision to purchase only Indian-manufactured vehicles after 1972 will progressively reduce UNICEF's existing obligations in regard to the supply of spare parts for imported vehicles over the next 5 years; these obligations will be terminated by the end of 1977, i.e. 5 years after the last vehicles were imported in 1972.

36. A further important change of policy in regard to UNICEF transport was made in 1972-1973. In a letter addressed to the Ministry of Education and Social Welfare dated February 1973, the Director of the India Programme Service at UNICEF office in New Delhi proposed that title to all UNICEF-provided vehicles in India, whether imported or bought from Indian manufacturers, should be transferred to the Government of India after 5 years. The letter forwarded a draft agreement to this effect, which provided inter alia that the Government of India should continue to use the vehicles in the projects for which they were provided, or in some other project of interest to UNICEF, and should "eventually dispose of them in accordance with its own standard procedures". UNICEF, for its part, would undertake to replace condemned vehicles within the 5-year period in accordance with existing criteria and procedures and to supply spare parts for imported vehicles "at the rate determined in the UNICEF Operations Field Manual". UNICEF will replace a vehicle after five years "provided the vehicle is required to service a continuing UNICEF support to a permanent on-going staff training school or a main disease-control campaign ..." and provided also that the old vehicle is returned to UNICEF "in a reasonable condition for sale".

37. Reference is made in paragraph 34 to the setting up of health transport organizations in 15 of the Indian States. How far have these attained their objectives in regard to the control and servicing of their UNICEF-provided and other vehicles?

38. The response to UNICEF's efforts over the past decade to obtain the co-operation of the authorities in setting up effective machinery is, at first sight, disappointing. Of the 15 SHTO's only two were reported at the time of the writer's visit (February-March 1973) to be working efficiently by the standards laid down in the relevant Planops. The following quotations from a number of reports, some by the RVMA and his predecessor on their periodical visits to the various states, others by UNICEF field officers, illustrate some of the difficulties:

- "Purpose of contact: to activate the dormant SHTO".
- "Quality of drivers: poor". (A frequent comment).
- "No training and clarification programme in operation".
- "Rate of improvement: very slow".
- "Spare parts warehousing: very poor".
- "Inventory control of tyres and batteries: poor".
- "The SHTO is beset by labour troubles".
- "The mobile maintenance unit is not being used except on rare occasions due to lack of staff."
- "When a vehicle in Agra needs a new battery, it remains off-road while delivery is taken from Calcutta".
- "Spare part needs were made out only when actual failures occurred ..."
- "No advance planning was done (as) it was felt ... that everything would be supplied by UNICEF whether an item was locally available or not".
- "The Health Department received a Bedford and a jeep in 1960. Both have been extensively used, but are now off-road ... The (jeep's) battery and electric wiring have disappeared."
- "Control and supervision of technical staff are virtually nil."
- "The lack of availability of spare parts is prompting cannibalization in an attempt to keep vehicles in service."

39. All these defects, and many more, were apparent to the writer during his three-week visit to India in early 1973. They can be seen as symptoms of underlying deficiencies and weaknesses similar to those observed in the Eastern Mediterranean region (see paragraph 24): financial stringency, lack of trained personnel at the level required to manage transport organizations and to man vehicle maintenance and repair workshops; widespread failure to recognize the need for, and the advantages of, systematic operational control and preventive maintenance of vehicles; a somewhat rigid and slow-moving administrative machinery which has yet to adapt itself fully to new tasks and changed conditions; vast inhabited areas not yet provided with modern roads, etc..

40. But the picture has its brighter side. The RVMA's reports, which are detailed and thorough, and on standardized lines, contain references to progress made in the staffing and running of this or that transport organization or workshop; to the good quality of the repair work or the good working atmosphere in others; to new and better premises under construction or planned; and so on. The writer had the opportunity to visit one of the two more successful workshops. This, with the help of 20 mobile maintenance units, and an operational staff of 177, looks after some 1,400 vehicles operated by the Public Health Department, of which UNICEF has provided a little over 600, the State just under 600 and USAID a little over 200. These vehicles are distributed over the 26 districts of a state bigger than New York, New Jersey and Pennsylvania combined, the minimum for a district being 24 and the maximum 177. Two regional workshops are planned and the necessary premises are being put up. The central workshop also services vehicles operated by other authorities dealing with health matters, and the Director is willing to extend his list of clients to non-health ministries, on a reimbursement basis, provided he is authorized to take on any necessary additional staff in order to ensure continued priority for health vehicles. Although many of the buildings have been improvised pending construction of permanent buildings, the workshop is capable of undertaking all vehicle repairs except those involving electro-plating. There is a stock of spare reconditioned assemblies (engines, gear boxes etc.) to replace damaged units and so enable the latter to be repaired without immobilizing the vehicle. Detailed, comprehensive and up-to-date Cardex records are maintained, so that an accurate calculation can be made of the cost of each job; each vehicle has its own file, recording its maintenance and repair history; spare parts movements are recorded; and so on. The Director runs maintenance courses for users of vehicles as well as for their drivers and technical courses for his supervisory personnel and suitability tests

are imposed on drivers. He has written a memorandum on vehicle maintenance, which has been translated into the vernacular for the benefit of drivers.

41. The SHTO described above presented a striking contrast to its counterpart in another state also visited by the writer, where progress was obviously impeded by difficulties arising out of shortage of funds and of trained staff, especially at the supervisory level, lack of appropriate buildings, and administrative complications. But progress, albeit slow and irregular, is nevertheless being made, and the writer sees no technical reason why what is achieved in one state should not, in time and mutatis mutandis, be achieved in others. It is largely a question of a sense of purpose and the right kind of leadership. The fact that an All India Conference of State Health Transport Organization officers took place in 1972 is evidence of the interest which is being taken in the transport problem in official circles.

42. Reference was made in paragraph 40 to the willingness in principle of the Director of a SHTO to service and repair vehicles operated by departments other than the Ministry of Health. The Inspector was informed that in New Delhi, on the other hand, the Ministry of Health appeared to have adopted a policy of discouraging the servicing by the Central Health Transport Organization of vehicles used by other Ministries, and that a similar situation existed in other States. The matter is of obvious importance to UNICEF in India, a substantial number of whose vehicles (about 25 per cent of the entire UNICEF fleet) are being operated by four other Ministries responsible for UNICEF-assisted programmes in the fields of applied nutrition, village water supplies, family and child welfare and education. It seems unsatisfactory, especially in view of the agreement referred to in paragraph 34(a), that such vehicles should be denied the service of UNICEF-assisted transport organizations. The matter has been taken up with the authorities concerned.

43. UNICEF hopes to get all Ministries to agree to use official Health Transport Organizations to pay for their services by the time the next 5-year plan is introduced in 1974.

44. The 1965 agreement regarding the establishment of a Central Health Transport Organization in New Delhi, referred to in paragraph 34(a) states that the objectives of the project are:

- (a) To take over from UNICEF the task of providing co-ordination as between the various SHTO's and of giving them such assistance or guidance as may be necessary;

- (b) To establish a spare parts storage department for UNICEF and other vehicles engaged in the health programmes;
- (c) To organize training and refresher courses, seminars etc. in vehicle and spare parts management, preventive maintenance and repair work and also in the maintenance and repair of non-transport health equipment for the personnel both of the Central and of the State Health Transport Organizations.

45. The functioning of the proposed organization is described in considerable detail and there are a number of annexes dealing with staff requirements, training schedules, accommodation requirements and running costs. UNICEF undertakes to supply tools and instructional equipment and to give favourable consideration to the provision of further assistance in the form of instructors for training, stipends to trainees and spare parts for UNICEF vehicles "with the exception of certain seldom-used items and those materials readily available in India". The RVMA is to give continuing advice and assistance.

46. It is difficult on the strength of a necessarily short visit to assess the extent to which the objectives of the CHTO have been achieved. It is clear that many obstacles to progress still exist, owing, in particular, to financial stringency, and to the shortage of trained and qualified staff, especially on the technical side, and of adequate premises. Much remains to be done, for example, in regard to the relationship between the Central and the State Organizations. As provided for in the 1965 agreement, the CHTO has taken over the distribution of spare parts for UNICEF vehicles in India, but difficulties regarding their warehousing and accounting have yet to be resolved. There was also evidence that the necessary procedures to enable the SHTO's to order spare parts from New Delhi had not been fully established. There should, however, be a considerable improvement when badly needed office, workshop and storage space is available.

47. The training section appears to be well-equipped and well-organized, although the writer understood that some States find it difficult to send trainees to New Delhi, partly owing to language difficulties. The section caters for drivers and store-keepers. The training of mechanics does not appear to be widespread.

48. As in other regions, requests to UNICEF for vehicles to be written off are dealt with by a Property Survey Board, composed of the appropriate officials. Each request includes or should include a report (with photograph in the case of accident damage)

by the Director of Transport or other recognized technical official of the State concerned. The RVMA makes a recommendation to the Board on each vehicle, and if possible the vehicle is seen by him or by a UNICEF representative (e.g. a field officer) before being finally written off.

Other Countries in the Region

49. As reported in paragraph 30, the RVMA has, since his appointment in 1972, visited all the countries of the region except Mongolia. He has assisted with the negotiation and drafting of a Transport Planops in Afghanistan signed in February 1973 by the Deputy Minister of Health. This provides for the setting up by the Ministry for Health of a Transport and Equipment Maintenance Organization (TEMO) in Kabul with a staff of 75. The TEMO will service not only vehicles (including UNICEF vehicles) operated by the Ministry, but also UNICEF vehicles operated by other ministries or government agencies. Detailed advice by the RVMA on the staffing, operation and financing of the TEMO is included in the agreement in the form of annexes. This includes a strong recommendation that the TEMO should operate with a single, centralized budget, under its own control, replacing the system hitherto in force under which funds for the maintenance and repair of vehicles, as well as for their operation, (i.e. drivers' wages and travel allowances, petrol, oil etc.) were divided up among the various sections and programmes controlled by the Ministry. Detailed advice is offered on how to estimate costs, allowing for overheads, incidental and unforeseen expenditure, acquisition of new vehicles etc.

50. In Sri Lanka, to which a UNICEF representative has recently been appointed, there has been delay in building a Ministry of Health Vehicle Workshop because of lack of funds, but the Government is now able to provide funds for the purpose. The UNDP representative has asked that the proposed transport organization should also service UNDP vehicles; this has been approved in principle, and an agreement is being drafted, in consultation with UNICEF under which UNDP will provide spare parts and pay an agreed service charge. Repairs will at first be limited to light work, but major repairs are contemplated eventually. A similar arrangement is being planned in Nepal.

D. East Asia and Pakistan

51. The Regional Vehicle Management Adviser in Bangkok covers the following countries or territories, and is responsible for the vehicles shown below (in each case the number of vehicles is given as at the end of 1972):

Country	4-Wheeled Vehicles	Motor Cycles etc.	Boat Motors
Indonesia	1,373 ^{a/}	1,455	-
Thailand	679	1,250	-
Burma	496	446	35
Malaysia	207	508	69
Philippines	192	1,504	-
Republic of Korea	189	-	-
Republic of Vietnam	141	134	-
Khmer Republic	70	222	1
Laos	24	9	2
Other territories (Singapore, Hong Kong, S. Pacific)	66	-	-
	3,437	5,528	107

^{a/} Including 8 miscellaneous vehicles (tractors, bulldozers, etc.)

52. About 16 makes of four-wheeled vehicles are represented, some of them with up to 5 different models. About 1,690 or nearly 47 per cent, have four-wheel drive. In addition to four-wheeled vehicles there are large numbers of motor cycles, mopeds and scooters; this is no doubt partly a consequence of financial stringency, but also reflects the fact that in virtually all the countries of the region there is no social prejudice (such as exists in other parts of the world) against women riding mopeds or bicycles. (The women in this case are mostly midwives who play an important role in family planning programmes.) Geography explains the presence of boat (mostly outboard) motors.

53. Planops have been signed with Thailand (1965), the Philippines (1966), Indonesia (1968) and four provinces of West Pakistan (1971). The RVMA's visits to countries in the region (apart from Thailand) have averaged about eight per annum during the past 5 years and take up an estimated 50 per cent of his time. He is assisted in Indonesia by a Transport Adviser attached (as an international contract officer) to the UNICEF office in Djakarta, and in Korea by a member of the local staff of the Seoul office who serves as Transport and Supply Assistant. He has no activity in Bangladesh, Indo-China (i.e. Khmer Republic, Laos and Vietnam) or the very small territories, but the situation in this respect may of course change. The RVMA's verbal advice is supplemented by a series of manuals etc., written by him, on the various aspects of vehicle management and maintenance in which great emphasis is laid on preventive maintenance.

54. Conditions and standards in regard to the operation, maintenance and repair of UNICEF vehicles vary widely throughout the region. The main obstacles to progress seem to be:

- (a) Lack of financial resources, including foreign exchange. As previously explained (see paragraph 24 (b)) this lack may be both absolute in the

sense that a government is generally short of funds, and relative in the sense that even where funds are (theoretically) available, financial priorities often do not favour government departments concerned with public health and other social matters. One of the most familiar consequences of financial stringency, whether absolute or relative, is a tendency to hang on to over-age (and therefore uneconomical) vehicles for fear that they may not be replaced.

- (b) Lack of trained managerial and technical personnel.
- (c) Unfamiliarity with the concept of systematic preventive maintenance of vehicles - extending in some cases to an apparent reluctance on the part of officialdom to become involved with the running of garages and workshops. Allied with this is the widespread failure to submit regular vehicle reports to UNICEF, which thus has difficulty in keeping check of the proportion of listed vehicles actually capable of being used.
- (d) Political and other non-technical factors.

55. The way in which a combination of such difficulties as those summarized above can impede progress was brought home to the writer during a visit to Indonesia which included trips to provincial centres in East Java and Sumatra. A Transport Planops signed in 1968 provides for the establishment, under the Ministry of Health, of Transport Organizations with properly equipped repair shops in Djakarta and 6 provincial cities, plus 5 mobile maintenance units in remote areas. A central spare parts store is provided for in Djakarta. The staffing and functions of the Central Transport Organization and its provincial counterparts are spelt out in the usual way, and in addition to giving "advice and counsel" UNICEF undertakes (subject to executive board approval) to supply any necessary tools and equipment, including the mobile maintenance units and certain other vehicles, in addition to equipment already supplied in connexion with individual projects. This commitment includes spare parts at the level of 5 per cent of the ex-factory value of each UNICEF vehicle for the initial year, and 4 per cent for each of the succeeding four years. Provision is made, however, for the phasing out of UNICEF's spare parts assistance after 5 years. The Indonesian Government undertakes inter alia to furnish monthly reports to UNICEF on the operation and condition of each UNICEF vehicle, and to see to it that drivers are properly trained and tested. (There is no explicit reference to the training of other personnel, but it is clear from the text that only trained mechanics are to be employed in the workshops.)

56. In fact, the Planops briefly summarized in the preceding paragraph has scarcely been implemented. In Djarkarta there is no workshop and virtually no transport organization; although there is a spare parts store, the administrative work in connexion with requests for spare parts from users of UNICEF vehicles in the provinces is performed by UNICEF. One of the more obvious reasons for this state of affairs is lack of official funds; hitherto the Ministry of Health has received barely enough transport funds to cover the day-to-day running expenses of its vehicles. Both in the capital and in the provinces, vehicles are looked after by their drivers, who display remarkable ingenuity in dealing with breakdowns; repairs beyond their resources are entrusted to commercially-run workshops, which are to be found in most towns. (The writer visited such a workshop in a small town in Sumatra, where he found major repairs being effected with the help of modern machines). There are a few Ministry of Health workshops in the provinces (originally established in connexion with the anti-malaria campaign), but they are poorly equipped and users of Government vehicles prefer, if possible, to use commercial facilities. In principle, the Ministry of Health has access to workshops run by the armed forces and other Government departments (e.g. the writer was informed that there was a well-run municipal workshop in Surabaya), but their services have to be paid for and are not cheaper than those offered by commercial firms. The mobile maintenance units have been unable to operate because of the lack of crews with the necessary qualifications. It is estimated that about 50 per cent of the Ministry of Health's vehicle fleet is off the road.

57. A special feature of the transport situation in Indonesia is that, apparently in accordance with old-established tradition, an official to whom a vehicle is allocated is expected to make himself personally responsible for its maintenance and repair and is even permitted, under Government regulations, to buy the vehicle after 5 years. There is thus a built-in preference for the kind of ad hoc and highly flexible arrangements for servicing one's vehicle, which private enterprise seems better able to provide than a Government-run organization, however efficient. One competent observer expressed the view to the Inspector that vehicles thus cared for on a personal basis benefit from better maintenance than they would otherwise receive.

58. The high degree of decentralization of the administration in Indonesia (with a corresponding diminution of authority in the provinces) and the inaccessibility of many of its rural areas (there are several thousand inhabited islands) are also part of the picture.

59. In the Inspector's opinion, the 1968 Planops has not fulfilled the hopes placed upon it, and a review of UNICEF transport policy in Indonesia in the light of the circumstances summarized above is desirable. The first step should be a comprehensive survey of the situation in regard to all health vehicles - their origin, age, location, utilization, condition, etc.. The Inspector was informed that such a survey was, in fact, planned as part of an IDA/UNFPA population project requiring a fleet of 500 four-wheel vehicles, 3,000 motor cycles or motorized bicycles and 7,000 bicycles. The object of the survey will be to find out how many vehicles are available for the programmes before any more are bought. Over-age vehicles, and those beyond economical repair, should be sold or otherwise disposed of.

60. The Inspector was informed in Djakarta that the Ministry of Health's budget for the Central Transport Organization had been increased from Rpa. 40 million, in 1971-1972 to nearly Rpa. 80 million in 1972-1973, and was to be further increased to Rpa. 100 million in 1973-1974. This is to be welcomed, especially as the increase coincides with the end of the 5-year period during which UNICEF has supplied spare parts free of charge (see paragraph 55); in a letter to the Ministry of Health and other interested Government departments dated March 1973, the UNICEF representative has proposed that his office should discontinue the supply of tyre tubes and batteries, both of which are now produced locally.

61. On the training side, UNICEF has been assisting the authorities with the organization of one-month courses for mechanics, of which five or six have been held during the past three years. These are, however, felt to be inadequate and UNICEF has offered assistance in organizing training courses for managers, mechanics, spare parts staff and drivers. Unfortunately, there is an understandable reluctance on the part of the authorities concerned to invest scarce funds in the training of men who, once trained, tend to disappear into the much more lucrative private sector, and it is difficult to arrange courses for a worthwhile number of trainees - all the more so as the latter are generally unwilling to spend more than a short time away from home.

62. In the Republic of Korea, there is also an acute shortage of funds, but the general atmosphere is perhaps best illustrated by the fact that, during the Inspector's visit, a ceremony took place at the Ministry of Health in which the Minister presented medals and citations to three drivers from the provinces which had won the trophy for the best preventive maintenance unit of the year. The Transport Planops, signed in 1970, provides for the setting up of preventive maintenance units only, and not full-blown repair workshops. Visits to five of the provinces left the Inspector with the impression that this modest but realistic programme is well on the way to being achieved. He was informed that the cities of Seoul and Pusan (as distinct from the provinces of

which they are part) and the island province of Chejudo are keen to follow the example of the remaining provinces by setting up preventive maintenance units to service the vehicles (including those provided by UNICEF) employed in connexion with health programmes. Several high officials in the provincial Governments assured him that an increasing proportion of their official vehicles were being regularly serviced and that the system had already led to substantial reductions in expenditure on repair bills. When major repairs nevertheless become necessary, they are carried out in workshops run by the Department of Home Affairs, which are usually in close proximity, or in commercially-run workshops.

63. Financial difficulties were also evident in Thailand, where the Inspector had the opportunity to discuss their problems with a senior official of the Department of Medical and Health Services in Bangkok and the Chief of the Medical and Health Transport Division. Their Bangkok workshop deals with a large variety of vehicles and is capable of a wide range of repairs, but there is no provision in the Department's budget for vehicle maintenance and repair, so that the workshop depends on cash payments from the users of the vehicles - a situation which is a source of frequent disputes and delays. The concept of preventive maintenance appears to be relatively unfamiliar in Thailand, but progress is being made.

64. In the Khmer Republic, negotiations for the signature of a Planops have been held up by the political situation. The RVMA reports that the Health Authorities have implemented most of his recommendations, but that their sphere of operations has been limited to the capital and its immediate surroundings.

65. In Laos, where the small number of UNICEF vehicles (24 plus 9 motor cycles) does not justify the setting up of a separate workshop, the RVMA obtained in 1967 the agreement of the manager of the USAID vehicle workshop to assist the Health Department, but no action appears to have been taken by the latter. Owing to the local situation, the authorities are unable to look after vehicles stationed outside the capital.

66. In Vietnam the situation has hindered the development of a preventive maintenance system on lines recommended by the RVMA, but USAID have helped the Health Department to establish a repair shop with a spare parts store and training centre. The situation should, of course, improve with the restoration of peaceful conditions.

67. In Burma, UNICEF receives an annual grant from the Government for the purpose of arranging for the commercial servicing and repair of UNICEF vehicles, using spare parts supplied by UNICEF.

68. In Malaysia, UNICEF vehicles are serviced by the Public Works Department, which looks after all government civilian vehicles. The RVMA reports that, in view of the high servicing charges and the delays in getting vehicles attended to, the Health Department is considering setting up its own transport organization.

69. So far as is known no separate UNICEF-assisted arrangements for servicing UNICEF vehicles exist - or are necessary - in the remaining territories included in the East Asia and Pakistan regions of UNICEF (i.e. the South Pacific territories, Hong Kong and Singapore).

70. As in other regions, the writer heard various stories about the misuse of UNICEF vehicles. In most cases such misuse, while known or at least strongly suspected, cannot be proved, and the power of UNICEF representatives to intervene is correspondingly limited. A typical case came to the writer's attention in a large provincial town which he had occasion to visit. Next to his hotel was an office building said to belong to the Ministry of Health, and in the parking lot, on two successive days, were five or six UNICEF vehicles. They could have been there for some conference of field supervisors, but it was difficult not to suspect that they were being used by Ministry officials for their home-to-office transport. This was perhaps an example of the tendency for UNICEF vehicles to be concentrated in urban areas, despite the fact that UNICEF-assisted projects are mainly intended for rural areas.

E. East Africa

71. The UNICEF map of Africa, south of the Sahara, is divided into three regions, Eastern (with regional headquarters in Nairobi), Western (Abidjan) and Ghana/Nigeria (Lagos). The former regional vehicle management adviser in the Eastern region left in 1970 on transfer to the Western region and has not been replaced in Nairobi, but his services continue to be available to the Eastern region when necessary and on an informal basis. He accompanied the Inspector throughout his visits to both regions. (He also visits Ghana and Nigeria, where there is no permanent adviser.)

72. The Eastern region comprises 14 countries, including Madagascar and Mauritius, with an estimated total of 1,189 UNICEF 4-wheel vehicles, ranging from less than 10 in Botswana to about 255 (plus 60 motor cycles) in Tanzania. Ten of the countries are on the United Nations list of the 25 least developed among the developing countries.

73. A Transport Planops was signed in Somalia in 1965 and a draft Planops (to replace a previous agreement signed in 1966) is being discussed with the Government of Ethiopia. The reason why Planops have not been signed with the other countries in the region is

that most of them already possess transport organizations for servicing their official vehicles. The Inspector visited two such organizations in Malawi and Tanzania, both of which are subordinate to the Ministry of Public Works or its equivalent. The principle on which they operate is that all Government-owned vehicles are hired by the users from the official transport organization at a rate per mile based on the make and type of the vehicle. The user of a vehicle on a semi-permanent basis (e.g. from year to year) is required to send it to the workshop at stated intervals for servicing; the cost of this, together with that of any necessary repairs, is provided for in the hire charge, which is therefore all that the user has to pay, except that failure to send a vehicle in for maintenance at the proper date incurs an additional charge.

74. In Malawi, where the Government transport organization is known as the Plant and Vehicle Hire Organization (PVHO), a problem has arisen as a result of a Government ruling to the effect that if a vehicle donated or run by an outside agency, such as UNICEF, participates in the PVHO scheme, the hire charges must be paid by that agency and not by the Ministry using the vehicle. For UNICEF to pay the hire charges for its own vehicles would, however, run contrary to its established policy of requiring the receiving Government to undertake their upkeep at its own expense (with UNICEF assistance in the form of spare parts, etc.). The problem is complicated by the fact that the hire charges are rather high, being calculated so as to cover not only the PVHO's overheads and operating expenses, but also the eventual replacement of each vehicle after three year's use, and the purchase of additional vehicles; thus the current rate for hiring a standard 4-wheel drive station wagon (including driver and fuel) is about 12.5 US cents per mile, giving a total for 20,000 miles (i.e. a normal year's use) of \$2,500, or nearly the cost to UNICEF of a new vehicle. The matter is under discussion between UNICEF and the Government of Malawi. Meanwhile the PVHO will service UNICEF vehicles (other than Volkswagens, which have to be sent to the local VW agent) against payment by the users of an ad hoc charge; this, however, like the hire charge, is rather high.

75. In addition to the PVHO network of one central and 12 regional workshops, the Ministry of Works in Malawi runs a training centre at Zomba where the syllabus includes courses for auto-mechanics and drivers. The latter are divided into three grades, with pay differentials. Entrants to the starting grade must pass a test.

76. Visits to the central workshop, to one of the regional workshops and to the training centre left the Inspector impressed by the efficiency of the operation as a whole. It is, however, expensive, partly because of the decision that it should be self-financing, and partly on account of the high proportion of expatriates at present

employed. On the other hand, once the latter have been replaced by Malawian nationals and the vehicle replacement and purchase fund has been built up, it should be possible to stabilize the charges to vehicle users at a less onerous level.

77. The vehicle problem is different in Tanzania, where a fleet of some 6,000 Government vehicles (plus about 2,000 bulldozers, graders and similar machines) is increasing at a rate of about 9 per cent per annum. The growing pressure on the Public Works Department's Workshop in Dar-es-Salaam and on its 18 regional workshops has been to some extent relieved by the setting up, by certain major vehicle users such as the armed forces, the Ministry of Water Development and Power, etc., of their own facilities; but the Director of the Dar workshop told the Inspector that he had 3,000 Government vehicles demanding attention, whereas his capacity was 300. His difficulties are aggravated by a very high accident rate, lack of funds and foreign exchange, an acute shortage of qualified personnel, both on the management and the mechanical side, lack of vehicle standardization - there are said to be 48 different makes and models of Government vehicles - and excessively slow administrative procedures, e.g. for ordering spare parts. But these and many other problems are being examined by Government-appointed committees and task forces, whose recommendations, if adopted, should lead to substantial improvements. (The Inspector was informed that the Ministry of Health had also requested UNICEF to undertake a survey of the Ministry's transport requirements.) Meanwhile, it is difficult to estimate the number of UNICEF (and other Government) vehicles which are off the road and/or unfit for further service, but the proportion is by all accounts a high one. There appears to be insufficient control over the use of Government vehicles by the ministries concerned, with the result that a vehicle tends to "belong" to its driver, who may or may not be conscientious about having it serviced. In spite of these various handicaps, however, UNICEF vehicles appear to be reasonably well maintained.

78. The Inspector visited the National Industrial Training Centre on the outskirts of Dar-es-Salaam, where it was interesting to learn that the most popular trade among the 1,000-odd trainees is that of motor mechanic. The syllabus provides for basic and in-plant training and includes a vehicle driver training course, with theoretical and practical instruction, including vehicle maintenance and repair, and tests. (The Director of the Government vehicle workshop, however, prefers to do his own "on-the-job" training of drivers and mechanics.)

79. Apart from the ever-present problem of lack of funds, the maintenance of the 150-odd UNICEF vehicles in Ethiopia has encountered special difficulties arising out of the fact that the Ministry of Health vehicle workshops in Addis Ababa and the provinces,

while efficiently run, have been virtually monopolized in recent years by the Ministry's Malaria Eradication Service (MES), most of whose vehicle fleet is financed by USAID, although MES also uses a few UNICEF-provided vehicles. At the time of the Inspector's visit (April 1973), however, it seemed likely that the situation was about to improve as a result of vigorous efforts by the UNICEF representative. Both the Minister of Health and the General Manager of MES assured the Inspector of their intention to see to it that UNICEF vehicles were accepted for servicing by the Ministry's workshops on an equal footing with MES and other Government vehicles, and the latter produced a copy of an instruction which he had issued to this effect. During a visit to the Addis Ababa workshop, where all major repairs are carried out, it was learned that four mechanics had been appointed to the Ministry, at its expense, to supplement the MES personnel. The Inspector saw a newly erected shed for storing UNICEF-supplied spare parts, which are properly controlled, and some UNICEF-provided vehicles and items of equipment. Once it is clear that the Ministry's workshop services are available to all UNICEF vehicles, the way should be open for the signature of a new Transport Planops to replace, or supplement, the somewhat outdated 1965 Agreement.

80. The UNICEF representative in Addis Ababa plans to arrange for the display in all UNICEF vehicles of printed notices, in English and Amharic, to the effect that the vehicle is UNICEF property and must be properly looked after and used only for the purposes specified in the relevant project agreement.

F. West Africa

81. The Western African region, covered from Abidjan, comprises 19 countries, of which the RVMA has visited 10, some of them five or six times. Nine of them have UNICEF-assisted transport organizations and a tenth country has asked for help in setting one up. The total number of UNICEF programme vehicles in the region is approximately 1,780. The figures for individual countries range from 175 (Ivory Coast) to 15 (Equatorial Guinea). The RVMA is assisted by experts engaged on contract in Chad, Liberia and Mali; Swiss experts are also helping to run Government workshops in Dahomey, Cameroon and Upper Volta. As mentioned in paragraph 71, the RVMA pays periodic visits to Ghana and Nigeria, which form a separate region, where some 470 UNICEF vehicles are listed.

82. Some of the figures quoted in the preceding paragraph are approximate because, in the absence of reliable vehicle reports, the precise number of permanently, as distinct from temporarily, incapacitated vehicles can only be estimated. A vehicle-by-vehicle survey carried out in Mali in late 1972 revealed that 70 out of 187 listed

vehicles were unserviceable and probably beyond economical repair. In Chad, the Workshop Director estimated that 40 per cent of UNICEF vehicles were no longer fit for service.

83. Six of the countries in the region are on the United Nations list of the 25 least developed among the developing countries. The Inspector visited three of these, and retains a lasting impression of their poverty in terms of material and financial resources, rendered even more acute, in the case of two of them, by a catastrophic drought. To be told that a Government vehicle workshop cannot find the cash to buy lubricating oil for testing engines would normally provoke disbelief; on this occasion, it did not.

84. This financial anaemia is accompanied and aggravated by an acute shortage of trained personnel at all the relevant levels - transport manager, workshop supervisor, mechanic, driver. The concept of preventive maintenance seems to have made little headway. In these circumstances it is not surprising that the RVMA has felt obliged to recommend various forms of assistance, additional to what UNICEF normally provides. Reference has already been made (see paragraph 81) to the engagement of experts on short-term contracts in certain countries, and to the assistance received from Swiss technical assistance organizations. The Inspector had the opportunity of meeting most of the persons concerned in their places of work, and is in no doubt about the value of their contribution to the UNICEF transport operation in West Africa. They are capable not only of running a workshop or a training course, but also of demonstrating how to do a job on the actual work bench. Being on the spot, they can exert a direct and continuous influence which the RVMA, with a continent and 35 countries to cover, cannot be expected to do. There is scope in Africa for further appointments of this kind.

85. Other forms of assistance, additional to that normally offered by UNICEF, are necessary in certain cases, such as Chad where UNICEF is paying Frs.CFA 50,000 per month into a revolving fund to enable the Ministry of Health workshop to buy essential supplies of oxygen, acetylene gas, paint, etc..

86. The following list illustrates the difficulties with which directors of Government workshops in West Africa have to contend. It is based on visits to both UNICEF-assisted and other Government workshops in five countries of the region and on discussions with their directors and others concerned:

- (a) Few Government departments send in their vehicles to the workshop for regular servicing. (The idea of making this compulsory is being discussed in at least two of the countries in the region).

- (b) Major repairs beyond the capacity of the workshop have to be carried out in a commercial workshop, but the Ministry concerned often will not, or cannot, pay the latter's charges - which are admittedly extremely high. Commercial firms will seldom give credit to Government departments.
- (c) Government pay for mechanics is too low, and as soon as they have acquired experience, men disappear in order to find jobs in the private sector, where they can earn two or three times as much, or to set up their own garages. In one country the Inspector was told that government pay, in addition to being very low, was up to six months in arrears. The official per diem allowances for visits to rural areas are also too low, with the result that men refuse field assignments. Drivers, too, are poorly paid and therefore have no incentive to give good service.
- (d) The Government provides only about two-thirds or less of the minimum annual sum needed to keep the workshop going. There is often no money to pay for oil for testing engines, let alone spare parts, tyres (which are often particularly expensive) and batteries. One result is that vehicles awaiting repair are sometimes "cannibalized" in order to get other, more urgently needed, vehicles back on the road. (In one country, the Minister of Health assured the Inspector that he would personally do his utmost to obtain adequate funds from his Government.) In at least two cases, the Inspector found that Government workshops were able to keep going only by accepting work from private vehicle owners who paid cash.
- (e) So long as individual ministries can lay hands on the necessary funds, they prefer to send their vehicles to commercial workshops where, although the bills are much higher, the delays are less.
- (f) There is often no-one in the parent ministry to whom the Workshop Director can take his troubles.
- (g) There are too many different makes and models of vehicles in the Government fleet, which makes it difficult to get spare parts. (In one workshop, the writer saw a UNICEF-provided 25-seater bus, apparently in good condition, which had been immobilized for about 12 months owing to lack of spare parts due to the vehicle being of an unusual make.)
- (h) There is a good deal of misuse of vehicles. This is difficult to control, especially when the offender is an influential person. (Two well-authenticated cases of such high-level misuse were reported to the Inspector;

in one of them, a new 5-ton truck, misused for private purposes, was abandoned on the roadside after an accident and had not been collected or repaired at the time of the Inspector's visit, a year later; by then all removable parts had disappeared.)

- (i) The procedure for selling unwanted vehicles is too complicated. The only way to dispose of them is to keep them for cannibalization purposes.

37. The above list is not intended to be exhaustive and it excludes such familiar obstacles to progress as political instability and lack of co-ordination between Government departments (e.g. there is reluctance to accept the idea of a "pooled" vehicle workshop serving more than one ministry). Progress is certainly difficult. But this is not to say that there is no progress. On the contrary, the Inspector repeatedly came across evidence that UNICEF's efforts over the past years are beginning to bear fruit, and that its ideas on how to look after vehicles so as to get better and longer service out of them are making an impact. It is not so much a question of statistics as of a general impression, built up from many things seen and heard, that Governments, and Ministries of Health in particular, are themselves making an effort: thus in two cases, more money was being allocated to the transport organization; in another, a senior official with administrative experience had recently been put in charge; in a third, a new transport organization was being established on lines recommended by the RVMA, under a highly qualified Director, with an adequate budget and good buildings and equipment; in yet another, the Inspector noted that "the wall chart shows 68 UNICEF vehicles. The stock cards for spare parts are checked and found in good order. The spare parts store is well organized and tidy. There are stocks of oil". The extent and speed of progress naturally vary greatly from one country to another, but the Inspector doubts if there is any country in the region where some progress has not been made, even if it is only slight.

88. The need for training, especially of mechanics, is generally recognized, although here again there are wide differences of achievement. Government technical training institutes exist in two of the countries visited, and there are also privately-run training centres. The Swiss Development Aid authorities are providing, or have undertaken to provide, experts to organize training centres and to conduct training and refresher courses for mechanics in three countries. The newly-established transport organization referred to in the preceding paragraph includes a driver training and testing centre, under a qualified supervisor, and the Director of the organization is bound by his terms of reference to organize the training of the personnel in preventive

maintenance and spare parts control, management and cost control, etc. He plans to write a manual dealing with these various aspects of the work. He is also responsible for training his national counterpart, who will in due course take over from him. UNICEF is providing a slide projector and other training aids.

89. Apart from the shortage of suitable instructors, a major difficulty in the field of training is to retain personnel once they have acquired a reasonable degree of skill; in most countries rates of pay in commercial workshops are at least double those obtaining in Government workshops. As a result, the Government workshop tends to have only low quality staff. Only one of the Governments in the region appears to be able to pay its employees as much as they could get in the private sector. High illiteracy rates are also a serious obstacle to organized training, although this need not and does not prevent practical "on-the-job" instruction by an expert.

90. Most French-speaking countries in West Africa have an official vehicle workshop or garage administratif dating from pre-independence times and intended to service all Government vehicles. They have not, however, proved capable of absorbing the growing number of Government vehicles - hence the need in almost every country for a separate transport organization to look after UNICEF-provided and other vehicles used by ministries responsible for executing UNICEF-assisted programmes. Such enquiries as the Inspector was able to make, including visits to garages administratifs in three countries, led him to the conclusion that this need still exists; in particular, officials of Government departments using UNICEF vehicles were emphatic that they could not rely on the garage administratif since it was overloaded and incapable of giving health vehicles the priority they needed. Similar views were expressed by the UNDP resident representative in three of the countries visited; they preferred to have their project vehicles attended to by a UNICEF-assisted workshop if possible. Nevertheless, the possibility of using official vehicle maintenance and repair workshops other than those set up with UNICEF assistance should be borne in mind in considering future policy; this aspect of the question is further discussed in Chapter III.

G. Latin America

91. The responsibilities of the Regional Vehicle Management Adviser in Santiago extend over Latin America, excluding the Central American area (Guatemala, San Salvador, Honduras, Costa Rica, Nicaragua, Panama and British Honduras), but including the English-speaking islands of the Caribbean - a total of over 20 countries. UNICEF-assisted Transport Organizations and maintenance and repair workshops exist in 11 of these (Bolivia, Chile, Colombia, Cuba, the Dominican Republic, Ecuador, Guyana, Haiti, Paraguay,

Peru and Surinam), but Transport Planops have been signed only with Bolivia, Colombia, Cuba and Peru. At the time of the Inspector's visit (October 1973) the distribution of UNICEF-provided vehicles in the region was approximately as follows:

<u>Lima area</u>		
	Argentina	-
	Bolivia	57
	Chile	11
	Paraguay	58
	Peru	47
	Uruguay	<u>7</u>
	<u>Total</u>	180
<u>Bogota area</u>		
	Colombia	241
	Ecuador	48
	Guyana	11
	Venezuela	6
	Jamaica	8
	Surinam	-
	Trinidad	
	and Tobago	6
	Barbados	3
	Other	
	islands	<u>6</u>
	<u>Total</u>	329
<u>Mexico City area</u>		
	Cuba	170
	Haiti	134
	Dominican	
	Republic	68
	Mexico	<u>12</u>
	<u>Total</u>	384
<u>Brazil</u>		<u>96</u>
	<u>Total</u>	96
<u>Guatemala City area</u>		
	Guatemala	145
	El Salvador	140
	Panama	52
	Belize)
	Costa Rica) 92
	Honduras)
	Nicaragua) <u> </u>
	<u>Total</u>	<u>429</u>
<u>Total for Latin America</u>		<u><u>1,418</u></u>

92. The above total covers about 15 different makes of vehicles. In addition, there are approximately 240 UNICEF-provided motor cycles, 160 boats and 1,000 outboard motors.

93. There have been substantial reductions during the past 2 or 3 years in the numbers of UNICEF-owned vehicles operating in Latin America. These reductions were due to the transfer to the governments concerned of considerable numbers of vehicles originally loaned for malaria eradication programmes from which UNICEF has since withdrawn. The Inspector was informed that the transfer process would be completed throughout the region by the end of 1973. He was shown copies of formal agreements relating to the transfer of vehicles during the period 1970-September 1973 to the governments of Argentina (254 vehicles and 3 drilling rigs), Bolivia (81 vehicles), Chile (249 vehicles and 2 drilling rigs), Paraguay (179 vehicles), Peru (270 vehicles) and Uruguay (40 vehicles). Each agreement embodies an undertaking by the government concerned to continue to use the transferred vehicles for the programmes for which they were originally supplied.

94. Similar transfers, on a comparable scale, have been effected in other countries in the region, with the result that the total of UNICEF-owned vehicles operating in the region (approximately 1,400 including over 400 vehicles in Central America where the RVMA has no responsibilities) is only a fraction of what it was four or five years ago, and is small in relation to the size of the region and the number of countries contained in it. A substantial majority of the vehicles were, at the time of the Inspector's visit, less than 5 years old and new vehicles had recently been received, or were on order, in a number of countries. In each country these vehicles are divided among a number of Ministries and there are no large fleets of UNICEF-owned vehicles under the control of a single authority, as was the case with the malaria programme vehicles. In his report for 1972, the RVMA stated that 93% of the total UNICEF fleet in Latin America was reported by the governments concerned to be in good operating condition. While this figure may be on the optimistic side, the Inspector derived the definite impression from his visit to two of the countries of the region (Peru and Colombia) and from the numerous reports and documents made available to him in respect of the other countries of the region, that, with two or three exceptions, the situation in regard to the operation of UNICEF-provided vehicles in Latin America is good. For example, the government transport organizations which he visited in Lima and Bogota compared favourably with the best of their counterparts in the rest of the world. Even in the High Andes two workshops were seen which, despite certain deficiencies in equipment and administrative controls, were in better shape than most of the field workshops seen in other regions. Shortage of funds and of foreign exchange, although often

referred to by officials as an obstacle to progress, does not appear to be as acute as in other regions; for example, most Ministries appear to dispose of adequate funds for the running of their official transport organizations and for the purchase of spare parts, and it is no longer necessary for UNICEF to supply these, except, in certain cases, on a reimbursable basis. Similarly, Ministries seem able to pay for such specialized repair work as has to be entrusted to commercial firms, despite the comparatively high charges made for such services. Standards of administrative and technical competence appear, on average, to be higher than in other regions. The RVMA has been active in promoting training, with outstanding success in Cuba, where a permanent transport training centre, the first of its kind in Latin America, was opened earlier in the year in premises made available by the Ministry of Education. The Cuban Ministries of Education and Health are participating jointly in the running of a transport organization set up in 1970 with UNICEF assistance; the RVMA in March 1973 reported that this was "in extremely good working order".

95. Vehicles are being manufactured in several Latin American countries and assembled in others. In most cases, such vehicles are considerably more expensive than the same vehicles imported free of duty; but the Inspector was informed that UNICEF was buying Brazilian-manufactured Volkswagens on favourable terms for distribution in Latin America, and that Renault vehicles manufactured in Argentina had been purchased for use in Chile. With increasing prosperity, the time seems to be approaching when the governments of the economically more advanced countries will be able to satisfy their needs for vehicles without external assistance.

96. To sum up, the general conclusion drawn by the Inspector from his visit to the Latin American region is that, with the exception of a few of the smaller countries where weaknesses due to lack of funds and/or administrative and technical know-how are still apparent, UNICEF-owned programme vehicles are being adequately cared for, and that the time is approaching when UNICEF should be able to relieve itself of its obligations in regard to their maintenance. Indeed, the process has already begun with the transfer to governments of the vehicle fleets employed in the anti-malaria programmes, referred to in paragraph 93, for which UNICEF no longer has any responsibility. It seems logical that the much smaller number of vehicles remaining in UNICEF ownership should be dealt with similarly in those countries which have shown themselves capable of maintaining them without further UNICEF assistance. It is relevant in the context to note that the number of field trips made by the RVMA in Santiago has dropped from 16-17 (during each of the years 1968, 1969 and 1970) to 8 in 1971 and 5 in 1972. (In April 1973 the RVMA was temporarily assigned to Vietnam for special duties.)

H. Health Equipment

97. As a result of recommendations by the Vehicle Management Adviser in New York following a visit to India in 1962, it was decided that government transport organizations set up with UNICEF assistance to maintain and repair health services vehicles should be encouraged to extend their activities to medical and other health equipment, in addition to transport. In a letter to field representatives (EXD-1971 of 9 June 1966), the Deputy Executive Director, Operations, referred to concern which had been expressed by some members of the Executive Board at finding pieces of UNICEF equipment either unused or out of repair during their visits to hospitals etc. in the field. The letter requested field representatives to make such arrangements as they could for institutions etc. receiving UNICEF equipment to advise them of any damage and suggested that the best long-term solution was to have repairs to "non-transport" health equipment carried out by transport organizations. A circular from the Director of the Supply Division to all field offices (SUPP/1 of 1 August 1966) confirmed this proposal, but suggested as alternatives that governments should be encouraged either to use commercial facilities if these were available, or to expand existing government facilities, for the maintenance and repair of small equipment. The circular also discussed arrangements for the provision of spare parts for UNICEF-supplied equipment, which ranges from hypodermic needles, through baby-scales and dentists' chairs to sterilizers and similar apparatus.

98. During his visits to the various UNICEF regions the Inspector met one or two UNICEF officials who expressed doubt whether the maintenance of health equipment was a suitable task for the Regional Vehicle Management Officers, who, after all, are transport experts. These doubts do not, however, seem to be shared by the RVMA's themselves, all of whom are actively concerned with the matter and see in it a logical extension of the essential objective of their function, i.e. to ensure that as far as possible equipment made over by UNICEF to governments is properly used and cared for.

99. There is an important difference between health equipment and vehicles: as noted in Chapter I (paragraph 5), UNICEF retains full ownership of vehicles supplied to governments in connexion with UNICEF-assisted programmes, whereas other supplies (with the exception of items with a unit value of \$1,000 or more) become the property of the receiving government on delivery. This does not, however, affect the right of a RVMA, as a UNICEF officer, to seek the co-operation of governments in carrying out measures designed to improve the care and maintenance of hospital and other health equipment. This appears to be generally accepted by governments, and it has also been accepted in

a number of countries that responsibility for looking after such equipment should rest with the transport organization set up to deal with UNICEF and other health service vehicles.

100. The Inspector, being primarily concerned with vehicles and the problems arising out of them, did not attempt any systematic survey of the situation in regard to health equipment, nor would he have been able to do so in the time available. But the nature of the problem soon became clear; in certain countries substantial quantities of items of medical and other health equipment furnished by UNICEF are left to rust unused for one, or a combination, of the following reasons:

(a) Unfamiliarity and lack of know-how

A slide projector or an electrically-driven pump arrives in, for example, a rural community centre, but no-one has the courage or the initiative to plug it in and see if it works. Often there is no accompanying operating instructions or service manual, or else it is in an unknown language. Or the equipment is used for a time but then breaks down, and no-one knows how to fix it, although the trouble may be quite simple, e.g. a burnt-out fuse. The Dean of an important teaching hospital in India told the Inspector that a recent survey had shown that 40 per cent of the hospital's electrical equipment was out of order, mostly because of trivial defects which a man with a little training and a screwdriver, could put right without difficulty.

(b) Lack of spare parts and absence of local servicing facilities

Agents for imported equipment, if they exist at all, are often unable or unwilling to service it, and those that do are usually concentrated in major cities. In one provincial centre, the Inspector was told that the elementary repair of a refrigerator had cost more than its original purchase price, owing to the expense incurred by the agent in travelling from his place of work, several hours away by road. A piece of equipment sent to an agent for repair may not come back until weeks or months later, and then in a worse condition than before. This state of affairs often leads hospitals etc. to duplicate their important equipment as a safeguard against breakdowns.

(c) Lack of funds

The Inspector visited a village hospital which was without running water. UNICEF had supplied piping to enable water to be brought in from a neighbouring spring; some of this had been laid, but the rest lay rusting in the hospital courtyard as the municipality had run short of cash to pay for the necessary labour. Where facilities and spare parts are available from commercial firms, hospitals etc. are nevertheless often unable to make use of them because of lack of funds.

(d) Donor ignorance

Some equipment is delivered without adequate regard to local conditions, and proves unsuitable. The Inspector heard of a case where electrically-driven pumps, supplied by UNICEF, had been delivered to a village where there was no electricity. A more spectacular example (which did not however concern UNICEF) was a lavishly equipped mobile medical clinic which was unusable because it was too big for the country's roads.

101. The Inspector was impressed by a UNICEF-assisted project which he came across in one of the Indian states. The project manager, who had an office in the State Health Transport Organization and a few assistants provided by the local health department, had surveyed the situation in regard to the maintenance and repair of health equipment, in six districts of the state in question, and had produced a report recommending the creation of maintenance crews, who would tour the region in specially equipped vehicles. If, as seems likely, these recommendations are put into effect, it will be for UNICEF to decide, in the light of its investment in health equipment in the region and other relevant factors, whether to give further assistance, e.g. by providing vehicles. The Inspector also found evidence of official interest in the systematic maintenance of health equipment in a number of other countries visited; in all of these the organization responsible was the transport organization in the Ministry of Health, and in at least three of these countries the transport organization's training syllabus covered health equipment.

102. The need and scope for UNICEF intervention in the field of health equipment obviously depends on a number of variable factors, such as the amount of equipment involved, the extent to which local authorities rely on commercial facilities or bilateral aid or have developed their own maintenance facilities, and not least the nature of the equipment: in countries where UNICEF assistance is limited to relatively

simple equipment (e.g. baby scales, hospital beds etc.) the problem of maintenance scarcely arises. But the Inspector's observations left him in no doubt that in many developing countries the maintenance and repair of health equipment is a serious problem and that UNICEF is well placed to give effective help, including material assistance in appropriate cases, through the intermediary of its Vehicle Management Advisers. Such help is obviously a good investment for UNICEF as well as for the country concerned, and the Inspector recommends that it be continued and, so far as possible, intensified.

Chapter III

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

103. This chapter will attempt to answer two main questions:

- (a) How far has UNICEF's transport policy succeeded?
- (b) What measures are needed to remedy any shortcomings?

104. It may be convenient to briefly recapitulate the basis and objectives of UNICEF's transport policy, as understood by the Inspector, and of the methods adopted by UNICEF to achieve those objectives:

- (a) Vehicles (ranging from bicycles to 25-seater buses) have been from the start, and continue to be, necessary for the carrying out of UNICEF programmes in the field.
- (b) UNICEF has from the start found it necessary, and continues to find it necessary, to supply some or all of the vehicles needed for projects. It does so on terms which are embodied in a formal agreement with the government concerned, known as a Vehicle Loan Agreement (VLA). Under the terms of the VLA, UNICEF retains ownership of the vehicle until it is written off or otherwise disposed of by mutual agreement. The VLA commits the receiving government to employing a UNICEF-provided vehicle only for the purposes for which it was provided, as laid down in the relevant "Project Planops", to looking after it properly, to keeping control records to which UNICEF has right of access, and to furnishing UNICEF with regular reports about the vehicle's condition. All UNICEF vehicles are painted off-white and display the UNICEF "decal".
- (c) The proper use and maintenance of a vehicle fleet require systematic management. In order to ensure this, UNICEF assists a government department responsible for carrying out UNICEF-assisted programmes to set up

a Transport Management Organization (TMO), under a qualified Director of Transport. His task is to ensure that the vehicles under his charge are properly driven and operated, regularly serviced, and repaired when necessary. Where the necessary maintenance and repair facilities are not available, either on a governmental or on a commercial basis, the TMO must set up its own facilities - i.e. a central workshop, capable of carrying out preventive maintenance, and light repairs, supported by provincial workshops and/or maintenance vehicles as appropriate. The government undertakes to provide the necessary premises and to make the necessary financial provision in its budget. UNICEF assistance takes the form of detailed and continuing technical advice on the construction, staffing and running of the TMO; the provision of tools and equipment; making available the temporary services of experts, especially for the organization of training courses; and providing spare parts for existing UNICEF vehicles within fixed limits and over a fixed period of time (usually five years). Provision may also be made for further assistance in connexion with new UNICEF-assisted projects. These arrangements and mutual commitments are embodied in formal agreements known as Transport Planops. Since 1962, Planops have been signed with forty countries, most of which continue to receive UNICEF transport management assistance of one kind or another. Such assistance is also given in certain countries where Planops have not been signed. In the remaining countries or territories, UNICEF-provided vehicles are maintained without UNICEF assistance.

- (d) In order to be in a position to provide the necessary advice to UNICEF on the selection of vehicles for specific projects, and to governments on the setting up and operation of TMO's, Vehicle Management Advisers (VMA's) have been appointed at the headquarters office in New York, and at five regional headquarters (Abidjan, Bangkok, Beirut, New Delhi and Santiago; the VMA in Abidjan also covers the Ghana/Nigeria region and, so far as his normal duties permit, East Africa). In a few countries, additional experts are employed on contract, or have been provided from bilateral aid sources, to help with the setting up and/or management of TMO's, the organization of training courses etc.
- (e) The responsibilities of the VMA's have been extended to cover hospital and other health equipment furnished by UNICEF in connexion with UNICEF-assisted projects. Their full official title thus became "Vehicle and

Equipment Management Advisers" and, where governments were willing to add the maintenance of health equipment to the responsibilities of their UNICEF-assisted TMO's, the latter became TEMO's.

105. The overall picture which emerges from the Inspector's notes, summarized in Chapter II, is one of a few countries where TMO's have made such good progress as to have become virtually self-supporting; of a few others where progress to date has been poor; and a majority in between where some progress has been made, but more needs to be done. In regional terms, Latin America has advanced furthest, and Africa has the furthest to go.

106. Despite many shortcomings, the general situation is not discouraging. On the contrary, a remarkable effort has been and is being made, and is beginning to bear fruit. The Inspector believes that it has been on the right lines, and that the various alternative policies which might (at least in theory) have been adopted (e.g. setting up TMO's entirely under UNICEF control, hiring vehicles from commercial firms, leaving governments to rely on existing facilities etc.) would have been found prohibitively expensive and/or otherwise unsatisfactory. Accordingly the recommendations which follow do not call for any fundamental changes, with the possible exception of the terms on which UNICEF vehicles are to be provided (see paragraph 129 below); they are designed to make existing policy and procedures more flexible and to adapt them to changing circumstances. It is also the Inspector's hope that they will lead to net savings in UNICEF expenditure on transport, and so release resources for other programme activities.

Priorities

107. As already stated (paragraph 105) Africa is more in need of transport assistance than the other regions, taken as a whole, and should therefore be given priority.

108. In view of the progress which has been made in Latin America (see Chapter II, Section G), the Inspector recommends that the process of disengagement already begun with the transfer to Latin American Governments of vehicle fleets supplied for anti-malaria campaigns should continue and if possible be accelerated, so far as this can be done without prejudice to continuing needs.

109. Internal priorities should be reviewed within each region with a view to ensuring that as much as possible of the available resources in the field of transport goes to those countries most in need of it.

Supply and selection of vehicles

110. The Inspector does not dispute that vehicles continue to be essential to the implementation of UNICEF-assisted projects, as indeed of most activities involving local travel by officials, nor that UNICEF should continue to provide vehicles to governments which cannot obtain them from other sources or afford to buy them from their own resources. This, however, still leaves open the question of how to determine the number, make and type of vehicles to be recommended for any given project. In this connexion, the criticism is sometimes heard that UNICEF has been over-generous in the supply of vehicles, and stories are also current about unsuitable vehicles being recommended, and supplied, without consultation with the RVMA, or even against his advice.

111. The Inspector recognizes the difficulties. The number and type of vehicles to be allocated to a project obviously cannot be decided by rule of thumb, or by reference to a ready-made formula. It is a question of judgment, in which many factors have to be taken into account, not all of them purely technical. The programme officers with whom the Inspector discussed the problem appeared to be well aware of the need for exercising economy and restraint in the allocation of vehicles to projects, and for relating the supply to the receiving government's capacity, both financial and administrative, to ensure their proper use and adequate upkeep. They know that the governments themselves contribute substantially to the cost of UNICEF-assisted projects and therefore have a direct interest (without, perhaps, always recognizing it) in a healthy transport situation. But the Inspector is of the opinion that the need for economy and restraint should be more clearly brought out in the instructions regarding the preparation of UNICEF-assisted projects than is the case at present, and above all that programme officers should be reminded of the need to consult the RVMA from the start on all questions relating to the supply of transport. The latter's expertise and knowledge of the local transport scene will enable him to draw attention to factors which may be highly relevant to e.g. the question of how many vehicles should be recommended for a particular project; he can, for example, provide a realistic assessment of a government's capacity to take on the additional workload involved in maintaining the new vehicles, including a reasonably accurate estimate of the financial cost. Similarly, on the question of makes and types, he can provide comparative running costs and other data which could help to influence the government in the direction of a rational choice (e.g. in favour of two-wheel drive as a substitute for the popular but expensive (and often unnecessary) four-wheel drive).

112. From this point of view the Inspector considers that the wording of circular EXD 2087 on the duties and responsibilities of VMA's (summarized in paragraphs 13-16) is in need of revision, particularly the first of the sentences quoted in paragraph 14 which (taken with the sentence preceding it), appears to give the programme officer discretion as to whether or not to consult the RVMA on transport requirements for a project. The Inspector fully accepts that (as quoted in paragraph 13) "the ultimate decision on ... the number and types of vehicles etc. to be included in any particular recommendation is a programme issue"; clearly, the programme officer, or his superiors, must have the right to override the RVMA's advice if necessary, but only after obtaining it; it should not be ignored. The Inspector has heard it argued that it is for the programme officer alone to decide how many vehicles should be recommended for a project, the RVMA being solely concerned with their makes and types. This is surely a misconception; numbers and types cannot be dissociated in this way. It is only fair to add that in practice, the RVMA's seem to enjoy excellent relations with their colleagues on the programming side.

113. Some specific suggestions to which consideration should be given are that:

- (a) when a project is formulated, the government should be urged to include in its budget for that project the cost of running the vehicles allocated to it;
- (b) a Project Planops should include a list of UNICEF vehicles to be allocated to the project, with an indication of the specific purpose for which the vehicle is being supplied;
- (c) a summary of the transport component of a project (number, make, type and planned utilization of the vehicles) should be included in the relevant UNICEF file;
- (d) project evaluation should, where possible, cover the transport element along with other aspects of the project under review;
- (e) the possibility of hiring instead of buying vehicles not required for continuous use, e.g. buses for taking trainees on periodical field trips, should be borne in mind. Facilities for hiring vehicles are growing in many developing countries; here too, the RVMA can advise.

Locally assembled vehicles

114. A factor of potential importance in the selection of project vehicles is the growing number of vehicle assembly plants in developing countries. Locally assembled vehicles are as a rule substantially more expensive, as a result of import tax payable

on the knocked-down parts, than the same models imported duty-free; but if the price differential can be overcome through exemption from tax and by other means, there may be advantages in buying such vehicles, since they are familiar to local mechanics and spare parts are likely to be locally available. Where UNICEF continues to import vehicles these should be, as far as possible, of the same make and model as locally assembled vehicles. The question should be kept under review by RVMA's.

Locally manufactured vehicles

115. Some developing countries are manufacturing motor vehicles, and it seems likely that others will do so as time goes on. Wherever this is the case, serious consideration should be given to the possible advantages of supplying locally manufactured rather than imported vehicles. This is already being done in India (see paragraph 34(b)) and in Latin America (see paragraph 95). Each case will need to be examined on its merits and from the point of view of long-term as well as short-term advantages and disadvantages.

Spare parts

116. UNICEF has incurred substantial expenditure over the years on spare parts for its programme vehicles. This has been necessary because of their non-availability or high cost in most developing countries. The situation is, however, changing; parts have become or are becoming more readily available in many developing countries and more governments can afford to buy them. The Inspector recommends that UNICEF should undertake no commitment to supply them except on the recommendation of the RVMA. In the poorer countries UNICEF should not only continue to provide small parts as necessary, but extend its aid to the more expensive items such as tyres, batteries, spare engines etc..

117. In some countries where spare parts of satisfactory quality are in short supply, UNICEF assists by providing imported parts on a reimbursable procurement basis. Similar arrangements may be possible in other countries.

Transport Management Organizations

118. The Inspector considers that the basic aims of UNICEF transport management policy - i.e. (i) the establishment, within the government department concerned, of a Transport Section under a Director of appropriate seniority, (ii) the setting up, where necessary, of central and provincial vehicle workshops staffed and equipped to undertake regular preventive maintenance and light or non-specialized repair work, (iii) the systematic training of transport personnel, including drivers and mechanics and (iv) the allocation of adequate transport funds as a separate item in the budget of the ministry concerned

(with pooling arrangements where more than one ministry is involved) - are correct and require no modification. At the same time it is clear that the policy must be flexibly applied to meet a wide variety of different conditions and limitation in the field, and that the task of setting up a Transport Management Organization is very different in a relatively advanced country from what it is in a country where financial resources are lacking and there is an acute shortage of administrative and technical skills. This need for flexibility is, of course, well understood in the field, where it is, so to speak, a condition of survival, although it does not perhaps always meet with the same understanding at headquarters, where problems have to be viewed in a global perspective. (The Inspector met several examples of such flexibility during his tour, ranging from the decision to supply only locally manufactured vehicles in India to the payment of a modest cash subsidy to an African TMO to enable it to acquire essential supplies of lubricants, paint etc.)

119. The Inspector fully endorses the emphasis laid on preventive maintenance in instructions relating to UNICEF transport policy, and by the RVMA's in their discussions with government officials. A logical consequence of this is that assistance in respect of vehicle workshops should aim at establishments designed to carry out preventive maintenance and light repairs, and this policy should continue in force. UNICEF should not supply major specialized automotive machine shop equipment such as crank shaft grinders, cylinder head planers, etc..

120. The suggestion has been made that the servicing and, where necessary, the repair of UNICEF-provided vehicles should normally be entrusted to commercial firms on a contract basis, thus dispensing with the need to set up government-run workshops. While such arrangements may be necessary in isolated cases, the Inspector believes, on the basis of his enquiries, that they would be unacceptable in the great majority of cases, partly because of the high cost of commercial services in most developing countries, and partly because such services are not necessarily more efficient or reliable than those provided by an official workshop. But where adequate commercial services are available on acceptable terms, governments should be encouraged to make use of them.

121. In the countries visited, the Inspector also enquired into the possibility of making use of other official or semi-official workshops, where they exist, as a substitute for UNICEF-assisted workshops. Examples are to be found in certain English-speaking countries in Africa, where the Ministry of Works or its equivalent runs a central workshop for all, or the majority of, government vehicles, which can also service UNICEF

vehicles, Similar establishments, known as "garages administratifs", exist in French-speaking Africa, but these are for the most part overloaded as a result of the steadily increasing number of government vehicles needing attention, and incapable of giving adequate service to users of UNICEF-provided vehicles. The latter are also reluctant to entrust their vehicles to a central organization, for fear that this would lead to their losing control over them. Similar objections apply to the use of workshops run by the armed forces, municipal transport organizations etc., which in any case are normally inaccessible to outside organizations.

122. The Inspector did, however, see two or three "non-UNICEF" government workshops which appeared to him to be reasonably well run. In such cases, some form of co-ordination between them and UNICEF-assisted transport organizations, perhaps of an informal kind to begin with, might be of advantage to both parties. RVMA's should keep such possibilities in mind.

Misuse of vehicles

123. The Vehicle Loan Agreement (see paragraph 5) formally commits the receiving government to using a UNICEF vehicle solely for the purpose for which it was provided. The Inspector's impression is that by and large this undertaking is respected and that cases of flagrant misuse are not numerous. When they do occur, either on the personal level (misuse for private purposes) or on the official level (misappropriation for unauthorized official use), UNICEF instructions make it clear that the matter is one to be dealt with by the UNICEF representative personally. This, in the Inspector's view, is clearly the right approach, since such cases are usually delicate. The consensus in the field is that such intervention, provided it is well-founded and tactful, and carried out at a suitably high level, usually has a good effect.

124. Other possible measures for checking misuse are:

- (a) to encourage governments to institute police checks on UNICEF vehicles, e.g. at weekends (as is already the practice in many countries);
- (b) to display a notice on or in each vehicle to the effect that it is to be used only on official business in connexion with a named programme (see paragraph 80 for an example).

Vehicle Loan Policy

125. The question of intervention by UNICEF against misuse of its vehicles raises an issue which is, and has been for some time, a subject of debate within the organization. The issue is whether project vehicles should be provided on loan, as at present, or

transferred to governments either on delivery (as is normally done in the case of supplies and equipment other than vehicles) or after a certain number of years. The principal arguments used by those in favour of transferring vehicles on delivery are as follows:

- (a) Retention by UNICEF of ownership of vehicles supplied by it is inconsistent with its declared policy of encouraging and assisting governments to accept responsibility for their proper utilization and maintenance;
- (b) it is also inconsistent with the policy of transferring to governments, on delivery, all other supplies and equipment (with the exception of certain special items such as drilling rigs) and of making cash payments to governments (e.g. training grants etc.);
- (c) A clause in the Basic Agreement concluded between UNICEF and each country to which it provides assistance entitles UNICEF to recover supplies which are not used for the purposes laid down in the relevant Project Planops, so that in transferring vehicles along with other supplies, UNICEF would not be handing them over unconditionally;
- (d) UNICEF field offices are responsible for supervising and collecting information about UNICEF-provided vehicles in their area. The administrative work involved in keeping track of scores or hundreds of vehicles scattered country-wide and among a number of different authorities, in dealing with requests for spare parts, and eventually in disposing of the vehicles, is both time-consuming and (in view of the persistent failure of many governments to send in the necessary reports) frustrating, and imposes a heavy burden on hard-pressed field staff;
- (e) To the extent that the measures devised by UNICEF to ensure the proper utilization and maintenance of its project vehicles fail to work out in practice, UNICEF lays itself open to criticism (especially from the auditors) on the grounds of failing to meet its obligation to look after its own property, and of accepting responsibilities which it cannot discharge. Transfer of title would obviate such criticism.
- (f) Transfer of title would have a beneficial psychological effect on governments, who would be likely to take greater care of vehicles which were their own property and to be more strict about their proper use by their officials.

- (g) UNICEF's power to persuade governments to make good use of UNICEF-provided vehicles ultimately rests not on legal ownership, nor on its right to reclaim equipment under the Basic Agreements, but on UNICEF's prestige as a friend and partner in a joint endeavour, and as a source of valuable and continuing aid to developing countries.

126. The supporters of the existing policy of retaining title to vehicles argue that:

- (a) The 20,000-odd^{2/} UNICEF project vehicles throughout the world represent a major investment which it is UNICEF's duty to protect, and compared with which the cost of any additional staff needed to cope with the administrative work involved would be small;
- (b) To hand vehicles over as gifts would involve the surrender of UNICEF's right to protest against their misuse, and seriously weaken UNICEF's influence in persuading governments to take proper care of them.
(Instances are quoted when UNICEF vehicles, seized in the course of military operations, were recovered by UNICEF on the strength of its legal ownership of them);
- (c) Transfer of title would involve loss of income from the sale of discarded vehicles;
- (d) It would not necessarily be welcome to user Ministries, some of whom regard UNICEF ownership of their vehicles as a safeguard against their having to surrender control of them to some other government agency;^{3/}
- (e) UNICEF's world image, as symbolized by the familiar vehicle "decal", on its background of off-white paint, would fade away.

127. In order to meet some of the objections summarized in the preceding paragraph, and especially sub-paragraph (b), there is considerable support for a compromise proposal which would involve UNICEF's retaining title to vehicles for a fixed period only, and then handing them over to governments. There are differing opinions as to how long the period should be; some are in favour of five years, as has been proposed to the Indian Government (see paragraph 36); others think that the period should vary

^{2/} Including about 1,400 in Europe and North Africa

^{3/} The Inspector can confirm that some Ministries take this view

according to the type of vehicle (e.g. four, five and six years respectively for light, medium and heavy vehicles); yet others argue in favour of a maximum delay of two years. The main reasons given for the shorter period are (i) that it is during the first two years of its life that a vehicle is most vulnerable to misuse and (ii) that a longer period, e.g. five years, would create the undesirable impression that UNICEF regarded a five-year old vehicle as no longer worth keeping.

128. Finally, it has been suggested to the Inspector that UNICEF should relinquish title to vehicles on delivery, but in the context of:

- (a) a more restrictive policy regarding their supply; e.g. governments could be required to pay for half the total number required for a particular project;
- (b) more stringent terms regarding use and maintenance than those at present laid down in Project Planops and Vehicle Loan Agreements - including, for example, undertakings by governments that they would make adequate (and specific) budgetary provision for maintenance in respect of each vehicle, and that they would supply, or pay for, its eventual replacement;
- (c) more stringent enforcement of these terms; e.g. UNICEF should be prepared to withdraw a vehicle in the event of gross misuse or neglect.

129. The Inspector's conclusion, in the light of his discussions and enquiries, is that ownership of project vehicles is not essential to the implementation of UNICEF's transport policy, and that on balance both UNICEF and the developing countries would probably benefit from a change in the existing policy. But a policy of handing over vehicles on delivery might not be appropriate in every country, and in the Inspector's view a survey should be made of the probable effects of the various alternatives in each country before a decision is made. Such a survey would probably reveal that in a considerable number of countries, vehicles could be transferred to governments on delivery without harmful consequences, and with some, or perhaps even all, of the advantages summarized in paragraph 125 (d), (e) and (f); but that in other countries it might be advisable to delay transfer for a period on the lines referred to in paragraph 127, or in some cases even to retain the present loan arrangements for the time being. In other words, the present policy should be replaced by a more flexible one. The Indian experience (see paragraph 34 (b)) may provide useful pointers.

130. The Inspector further recommends that any decision in favour of a policy of transferring vehicles to governments on delivery, or after a fixed term, should not be taken in isolation but should be accompanied by measures to minimize or avoid commitments to

replace vehicles (see paragraph 20) and to restrain the supply of new vehicles (see paragraph 111), while continuing to give assistance in the field of vehicle management to governments in need of it.

131. The transfer of vehicles to governments, whether on delivery or at a later date, would be subject to the same conditions, mutatis mutandis, as apply at present to loaned vehicles, i.e. the government would undertake to use them only for agreed purposes etc..

132. So long as UNICEF vehicles are provided on loan, it will be necessary to continue to request governments to submit periodical condition reports. The Inspector recommends that these should not normally be more frequent than six-monthly; shorter periods tend, in his view, to be self-defeating. The reports should be as simple as possible - and this applies to all the numerous forms and reports required in connexion with vehicle management; they should be standardized and simplified as far as possible.

133. The suggestion has been made that, after a period during which UNICEF would retain ownership of a vehicle, the government concerned would have the option to purchase it at a set price and against an undertaking to keep it in good repair and to continue to use it only for programme implementation. Another proposal is that, instead of providing the actual vehicles, UNICEF should finance their purchase by the government by means of a low-interest or interest-free loan. The Inspector feels that a discussion of these and similar proposals lies outside the scope of this report.

UNICEF-managed workshops

134. A UN official in the field suggested to the Inspector that UNICEF should consider setting up and running its own vehicle workshops, with personnel recruited and paid by UNICEF, in countries where the establishment of government workshops encounters particular difficulties due to lack of financial and human resources. The official added that he would be glad to send his own project vehicles to such a workshop, which might not be cheaper, but could hardly fail to be better, than the services at present available to him.

135. The suggestion has obvious attractions, but the Inspector shares the opinion of the RVMA concerned that it would be impractical, both on grounds of expense and because it would create difficulties in regard to co-ordination with the Ministries concerned. A more practical alternative (for which provision is made in some Transport Planops) is for UNICEF to appoint and pay a suitably qualified person on a temporary basis to manage a workshop until the government concerned is able to assume full responsibility. This course has been adopted with success in several countries.

Use of official workshops by other UN organizations

136. Reference has been made (see paragraph 50) to an arrangement in Sri Lanka whereby UNDP, in agreement with the Ministry of Health and UNICEF, will be able to avail itself of the services of the UNICEF-assisted vehicle workshop in return for the payment of an agreed service charge and the provisions of any necessary spare parts. The Inspector has the impression that there is scope for an extension of the Sri Lanka arrangement to other countries and perhaps to other UN agencies, and recommends that UNICEF representatives, in concert with their RVMA's, should be invited to explore the possibilities in discussion with UNDP resident representatives and other interested agencies, both UN and bilateral. It would of course be necessary to obtain the agreement of the national authorities concerned before any scheme involving the use of UNICEF-assisted vehicle workshops by "outside" customers could be put into effect; but if the latter are willing to contribute financially, the scheme is likely to be attractive from the government's point of view.

Training

137. More attention should be paid to training. The model Transport Planops (see paragraph 9) mentions only driver training, but the Operations Manual for Transport Officers includes in its list of their responsibilities the training, or arranging for the training, of transport directors, spare parts managers, vehicle control managers, workshop foremen and mechanics in addition to drivers. The problem seems to the Inspector to be part of the wider problem of industrial training which is of concern to other UN organizations, such as ILO and UNIDO, and he recommends that the possibilities of enlisting their help in tackling it should be investigated. In this connexion, the Inspector is informed by ILO that ILO Vocational Training Projects with an automotive training component exist in the following countries:

Botswana
Ethiopia
Indonesia
Iraq
Libyan Arab Republic
Madagascar
Panama
Sudan
Western Samoa
Zaire

138. Meanwhile, the RVMA's should continue and, if possible, intensify their efforts to persuade governments to organize systematic training of drivers, mechanics, store-keepers etc., and UNICEF should continue to assist by supplying suitable equipment and literature. The seminars for directors of transport etc. which are organized from time to time by the RVMA's on a region, sub-regional or country basis appear to the writer to have a high educational value, and should also be continued. They should be held as often as circumstances - including financial resources - permit, although the recommendation in the Operations Manual for Transport Officers that they should be held annually seems unrealistic.

139. Consideration should be given to the appointment of a Training Officer to assist the VMA at headquarters in New York and the RVMA's to organize and promote systematic training in vehicle management and maintenance. The Training Officer should spend as much time as possible in the field, and should aim at enlisting the co-operation of other UN organizations as suggested in paragraph 137.

Vehicle Management Advisers

140. The importance of the part played by the VMA's, at headquarters and in the field, in the formulation and implementation of UNICEF transport policy needs no emphasizing. In addition to their professional qualifications, they have built up an impressive fund of specialized knowledge of the problems of transport in developing countries, based (in the case of the regional advisers) on frequent visits to countries in their regions and the creation of an extensive network of personal contacts. There are only five of them in the field, each responsible for numerous countries in an area of continental size, and working with little or no professional assistance. (At the time of the Inspector's visit, the RVMA in Beirut had applied for an assistant from a bilateral source and experts were serving on contract in Indonesia and two countries in West Africa; the RVMA in New Delhi had applied for an assistant but the request had been turned down.)

141. The Inspector recommends that the VMA's should be given reinforcement. The need is most urgent in Africa, where the Adviser for the West African Region, in addition to covering the separate Ghana/Nigeria Region, is still called upon to help in East Africa, where he formerly served. UNICEF transport problems there are not as numerous or formidable as in West Africa, but they are more than the RVMA can fairly be expected to handle from Abidjan, and the situation justifies the appointment, for a period of, say, two years (renewable if necessary), of a Transport Adviser in Nairobi.

142. In Latin America, the Inspector understands that the RVMA in Santiago will not be replaced when he leaves or transfers to another post at the end of the year. This is justifiable in view of the progress which has been made in most of the region in the field of transport management, but there are still a few weak spots in Latin America and the Inspector recommends that arrangements be made to ensure that further advice and assistance is available to those governments in need of them. A possible solution might be to appoint a Transport Adviser on a two-year contract to the Lima Area Office.

143. Suggestions have been made that the RVMA's should be replaced by a network of advisers at the Area or even at the country level. The Inspector does not favour these alternatives, partly because they would be expensive, but also because the breadth of outlook and variety of experience gained by an adviser at the regional level are too valuable an asset to be thrown away. There is also a danger that an adviser at the country level would become too involved with the running of the local TMO which would not be to the latter's benefit in the long run.

144. In the light of the above considerations, the Inspector recommends that the RVMA system should be retained, but strengthened by giving each RVMA an assistant capable of doing the routine work and holding the fort during the RVMA's absence on tour. In view of the importance of training (see paragraph 137), it would be an advantage if he specialized in training problems; he could also concern himself with non-transport equipment.

145. The possibility, and advantages (especially financial), of engaging or persuading governments to engage, experts provided by other UN agencies or bilateral agencies, or by volunteer organizations, should be borne in mind. The Inspector was impressed by the work being done by the "bilateral" experts helping to run vehicle workshops in Africa. (He was also impressed by the UNICEF volunteers whom he met in a number of countries; although not experts, they were making themselves very useful in transport matters - checking on vehicle utilization, helping over spare parts problems etc..) Attention is drawn in this connexion to the arrangement in Monrovia, where an expert appointed to set up and launch a TEMO was recruited and is paid by ILO.

146. The VMA at headquarters should also have an assistant. There appears to have been a tendency in recent years for him to become increasingly involved in procurement matters, to the detriment of his other work. Except to the extent that it calls for the VMA's technical advice, such work should be dealt with by the procurement officer, leaving the VMA to devote his time to questions of transport policy and the functional supervision of, and supply of information to his regional colleagues. The Inspector

understands that the present Adviser is due to retire shortly; his successor should make a point of visiting the UNICEF regions as soon as possible in order to make himself acquainted with their respective transport problems and characteristics, and the reasons why rules and procedures appropriate to one region (or country, or even province) may not be so in another. It seems appropriate that he should remain a member of the staff of the Supply Division.

147. It has been represented to the Inspector that the title "Vehicle Management Adviser" or "Vehicle and Equipment Management Adviser" is rather cumbersome and should be replaced by a shorter one. For what it is worth, he offers "Transport Officer" (the old title), or "Transport and Equipment Officer" (or Adviser in either case).

148. The Inspector recommends that a meeting of VEMA's (or TEO's) should be held at the earliest convenient date. The last one took place in Beirut in 1965. The agenda should include discussion of broad questions of transport policy in the light of the comments and recommendations made in this report, on which the VEMA's should in any case be invited to submit their views. The meeting should be attended by senior headquarters officials; from this point of view it might be convenient to hold it in New York.

Revision of transport instructions

149. Any changes in UNICEF transport policy that may be decided upon as a result of this report will require corresponding amendments to the relevant instructions. As pointed out in paragraph 17 and 18, these are in any case in a somewhat confused state; many of them are obviously out of date, and the status of some of them is unclear. The considerable task of revising, bringing up to date and (where possible) consolidating the standing instructions and guidance both to UNICEF representatives and to VEMA's will presumably fall to the VMA at headquarters; in that case he will certainly need extra help.