

**REVIEW OF MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION IN
THE WORLD METEOROLOGICAL ORGANIZATION
(WMO)**

Prepared by

Cihan Terzi

Joint Inspection Unit

Geneva 2007



United Nations

JIU/REP/2007/11

Original: ENGLISH

**REVIEW OF MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION IN
THE WORLD METEOROLOGICAL ORGANIZATION
(WMO)**

Prepared by

Cihan Terzi

Joint Inspection Unit



United Nations, Geneva 2007

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Review of management and administration in the World Meteorological Organization (WMO) JIU/REP/2007/11

Objective: To undertake a comprehensive review of the administration and management of the World Meteorological organization (WMO) with a view to providing guidance for the improvement of governance, oversight, results-based management, organizational structure, human resources management, information management and the budget process.

Main findings and conclusions

Governance

- Review of the governance structure in WMO revealed that status of the Executive Council should be clarified as intergovernmental body with necessary amendment in the Convention. In addition there are some ambiguities in the legal instruments relating to the respective responsibilities of Congress and the Executive Council for planning, programming and budgeting, which need to be addressed.
- The Organization has made significant progress in the implementation of results-based budgeting (RBB); however there is still much to be done. In order to implement full-scale results-based management (RBM), RBB should be developed further and integrated into the organizational culture, aligning all parts of the Organization with a results approach. In this context, the programme structure needs to be reviewed and streamlined with a view to aligning it with the Strategic Plan and RBM.

Technical cooperation and regional activities

- The programmes for technical cooperation and regional activities, including the programme for least developed countries, could be improved by instituting comprehensive country/regional needs assessments to provide a base on which these programmes could be further developed. Systematic needs assessments should indicate regional needs, possible risks, and opportunities and thus provide a concrete base for high-impact multi-country project development, rational resource allocation, and resource mobilization.
- Comprehensive needs assessments should be complemented with the creation of a best practice function in the secretariat to detect and disseminate best practices, a country/regional feedback mechanism to follow-up on progress and help measure the achievement of expected results, and a resource mobilization strategy to guide and facilitate the efforts for raising necessary resources.
- The functions of the WMO offices in the field need to be broadened. These offices should actively participate in regional needs assessments, project development and resource mobilization, and follow-up on progress. The results approach should be embedded in the work process by the requirement for results-based planning and periodic reporting to headquarters.

General management issues

- The regulatory framework is fragmented and in need of updating. The respective responsibilities of departments, as well as work processes, need to be clarified, formalized and documented to improve accountability. In addition, there are opportunities to improve the efficiency and productivity of WMO meetings by streamlining, reducing the number and length of meetings.
- Currently there is too much flexibility for transfers between budget appropriation parts. Furthermore, management applies a zero lapse factor in the preparation of the budget. These are inherent risk factors in the implementation of the budget and should be revised accordingly.
- The new information system does not yet function efficiently. There are widespread complaints and resistance among staff to its implementation. Staff survey responses indicate that there is a need for clear guidelines and adequate training for staff. As the information system is a crucial element for efficiency and the internal control process, the issue requires focused attention and commitment from top management.

Human resources management

- The staff survey shows that the staff's perceptions of the management of human resources are far from positive, particularly with regard to the transparency of recruitment, the fairness of promotions and performance related issues. This situation may have an adverse impact on organizational performance, and needs to be urgently addressed through the close cooperation of management and staff.
- The efforts of WMO to promote equal opportunities for women in meteorology and hydrology are not reflected in the gender distribution of the secretariat at the Professional level and above, which is still far below the parity goal set by the General Assembly in 1997. The secretariat needs a policy to improve gender balance that includes efforts to attract more women for fellowship and training programmes.
- There is no formal policy for geographical distribution at the Professional level and above and hence imbalances persist in the representation of regions. A policy should be developed as a matter of priority to enable WMO to move towards equitable geographical representation.

Oversight

- Internal oversight has been considerably strengthened since 2003 with a concomitant rise in the number of audit recommendations, but management needs to improve its implementation rate. Furthermore, additional steps could be considered to consolidate the independence of the oversight function.
- An ethics function should be established to oversee the implementation of the recently issued Code of Ethics of WMO.

Recommendations for consideration by legislative organs

Listed below are the recommendations for consideration by Congress and the Executive Council. Other recommendations proposed for consideration by the Secretary-General can be found in the body of the report.

- **Congress should clarify the status of the Executive Council as an intergovernmental body and should modify the Convention accordingly.**
- **The Executive Council should submit a proposal to the sixteenth Congress for its approval that sets out the respective responsibilities of Congress, the Executive Council and the secretariat for the Strategic Plan, the Programme and Budget, and the Operational Plan, as well as any related changes to the WMO legal instruments.**
- **The Executive Council should submit a proposal to the sixteenth Congress for a WMO Strategic Plan for the four-year financial period comprising a strategic plan and a programme and budget outline, for its review and adoption.**
- **The Executive Council should adopt a Programme and Budget for each biennium.**
- **Congress should delegate sufficient authority to the Executive Council to enable it to determine and/or modify financial and other operational regulations. To this end, the Executive Council should prepare and submit a proposal to the sixteenth Congress.**
- **The Executive Council should give clear direction with regard to results-based management and should request the Secretary-General to expedite the transition to a results-based structure and culture, aligning all parts of the Organization with RBM, taking account of the benchmarks formulated in the respective reports of JIU.**
- **The programme structure of WMO should be rationalized to align it with the WMO Strategic Plan. In this regard, the Executive Council should request the Secretary-General to commission an independent study on this issue to be submitted to the Executive Council.**
- **The technical commissions should set up a cross-commissions working group to review the current structure with a view to rationalizing it, taking into account the conclusions of the independent study referred to in recommendation 7 above.**
- **The Executive Council should request the Secretary-General to initiate comprehensive country/regional needs assessments in cooperation with the regional associations and the countries, with particular emphasis on the least developed countries, which would feed into the regional strategic plans, the WMO Strategic Plan, and the Programme and Budget. In this regard, the Executive Council should invite member countries to provide the necessary**

cooperation and support.

- **The Executive Council should request the Secretary-General to submit for its consideration a long-term strategy to reduce the cost of international meetings. The strategy should include proposals, inter alia, to reduce the number and length of meetings, including reducing the number of working groups.**
- **The Executive Council should change the basis for transfers between budget appropriation parts from a percentage of the total maximum expenditure authorized for the four-year financial period to a percentage of the relevant biennial budget appropriation part.**
- **The Executive Council should grant the Secretary-General authority to make transfers between budget appropriation parts limited to 5 per cent of the lesser appropriation amount. It should also require him to seek the prior approval of the President for any transfer above this limit, and to report to the Financial Advisory Committee the reasons for such transfers and the implications for the programme and budget.**
- **The Executive Council should request the Secretary-General to prepare programme and budget proposals based on a realistic lapse factor.**

CONTENTS

| | <i>Page</i> | |
|--|-------------------|----|
| EXECUTIVE SUMMARY..... | iii | |
| ABBREVIATIONS..... | viii | |
| <i>Chapter</i> | <i>Paragraphs</i> | |
| I. INTRODUCTION..... | 1-8 | 1 |
| II. GOVERNANCE..... | 9-42 | 2 |
| A. Governance structure and cycle of Congresses..... | 9-14 | 2 |
| B. Measures to improve governance between Congresses..... | 15-17 | 3 |
| C. Governance of the planning cycle..... | 18-27 | 4 |
| D. Executive Council authority regarding regulations..... | 28 | 6 |
| E. Results-based management..... | 29-42 | 7 |
| III. DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AND REGIONAL ACTIVITIES..... | 43-54 | 12 |
| A. Country/regional needs assessment..... | 43-45 | 12 |
| B. WMO offices in the regions..... | 46-49 | 13 |
| C. Resource mobilization..... | 50-53 | 14 |
| D. Dissemination of best practices..... | 54 | 15 |
| IV. GENERAL MANAGEMENT ISSUES..... | 55-73 | 16 |
| A. Regulatory framework..... | 55-58 | 16 |
| B. Meetings..... | 59-61 | 18 |
| C. Budgetary issues..... | 62-69 | 19 |
| D. Information systems..... | 70-73 | 21 |
| V. HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGEMENT..... | 74-82 | 24 |
| A. Strategy, policies and practices..... | 74-75 | 24 |
| B. Composition of the secretariat: selected issues..... | 76-82 | 25 |
| VI. OVERSIGHT..... | 83-87 | 28 |
| A. Internal oversight..... | 83-85 | 28 |
| B. Ethics function..... | 86-87 | 28 |
| VII. STAFF SURVEY: OTHER KEY FINDINGS..... | 88-90 | 30 |
| ANNEXES | | |
| I. Overview of action to be taken on recommendations..... | | 32 |

ABBREVIATIONS

| | |
|-------|---|
| CEB | United Nations System Chief Executives Board for Coordination |
| DCR | Development Cooperation and Regional Activities Department |
| FINAC | Financial Advisory Committee |
| HR | human resources |
| ICAO | International Civil Aviation Organization |
| IOO | Internal Oversight Office |
| IRM | Integrated Resource Management |
| ISSAC | Information Systems Strategy Advisory Committee |
| ITU | International Telecommunication Union |
| JCRF | Joint Climate Research Fund |
| JIU | Joint Inspection Unit |
| LDCs | least developed countries |
| NMHSs | national meteorological and hydrological services |
| RAs | regional associations |
| RBB | results-based budgeting |
| RBM | results-based management |
| RP | Regional Programme |
| TCs | technical commissions |
| TCOP | Technical Cooperation Programme |
| VCP | Voluntary Cooperation Programme |
| WHO | World Health Organization |
| WMO | World Meteorological Organization |

I. INTRODUCTION

1. During the last decade, United Nations system organizations have introduced reforms in pursuit of greater efficiency in resource use and improved performance. The legislative bodies of the organizations have required the secretariats to streamline substantive and administrative programmes and structures, and renew management systems, with an overarching emphasis on achieving results and demonstrating impact. Against this background, the Joint Inspection Unit (JIU) initiated in 1999 a series of reviews of the management and administration of the specialized agencies and other United Nations system organizations. A review of the World Meteorological Organization (WMO) was included in the JIU work programme for 2006.
2. In response to a request by the WMO Secretary-General for a review of the financial control systems and procedures of the WMO secretariat, JIU submitted in 2004 a confidential management letter to the Secretary-General containing recommendations on WMO internal controls that were to be regarded as a first step towards a more detailed review of WMO management and administration, which is the subject of this report.
3. The present review covered management and administration in WMO headquarters and regional offices. In accordance with the internal standards and guidelines of JIU and its internal working procedures, the methodology followed in preparing this report included a preliminary review, questionnaires, interviews and in-depth analysis. A follow-up questionnaire to the 2004 management letter and a detailed corporate questionnaire were sent to WMO management. On the basis of the responses received, the Inspector conducted interviews with WMO senior management and staff representatives, and subsequently sought the views of WMO staff through a survey distributed electronically. During the fifteenth session of Congress, he also held meetings with representatives of some Members. As part of the review, the Inspector undertook a mission to a WMO Office in the field. Comments from WMO on the draft report have been sought and taken into account in finalizing the report.
4. The survey, comprising 61 questions, was sent to all WMO staff (323 in total). The maximum and minimum response rates to the survey questions were 116 and 92 respectively, or 36 and 28 per cent of the total number of staff. The response rate, as well as the distribution of responses among different categories of staff, was sufficient to provide findings that were statistically representative of the views of all staff in the organization.
5. This report contains strategic recommendations addressed to both the WMO legislative bodies and the Secretary-General. The Inspector will also address to the Secretary-General a confidential management letter following up on the JIU 2004 confidential management letter, and a management letter with additional issues and recommendations from the review.
6. In accordance with article 11.2 of the JIU statute, this report has been finalized after consultation among the Inspectors so as to test its conclusions and recommendations against the collective wisdom of the Unit.
7. To facilitate the handling of the report and the implementation of its recommendations and the monitoring thereof, annex I contains a table specifying those recommendations that require a decision by the WMO legislative bodies and those that can be acted upon by the Secretary-General.
8. The Inspector wishes to express his appreciation to all who assisted him in the preparation of this report, and particularly to those who participated in the interviews and so willingly shared their knowledge and expertise.

II. GOVERNANCE

A. Governance structure and cycle of Congresses

9. The WMO Congress is the general assembly of delegates representing Members and as such is the supreme body of the Organization. Among its functions, Congress determines general policies for the fulfilment of the purposes of the Organization, as well as regulations prescribing the procedures of its various bodies.

10. In addition, it elects the President and three Vice-Presidents of the Organization who shall also be President and Vice-Presidents of Congress and the Executive Council.¹ Congress shall normally be convened at intervals as near as possible to every four years, although an extraordinary Congress may be convened under certain conditions.²

11. The Executive Council is the executive body of the Organization and is responsible to Congress for the coordination of programmes and the utilization of budgetary resources. The Council consists of the President and Vice-Presidents of the Organization, the presidents of the regional associations, and 27 directors of meteorological or hydrometeorological services of Members of the Organization. The Council normally holds a session at least once a year, although an extraordinary session may be convened under certain conditions.³ Members of the Council are required to act as representatives of the Organization and not as representatives of particular Members.⁴

12. The WMO governance structure also comprises regional associations (RAs) and technical commissions (TCs). Regional associations are composed of WMO Members, the networks of which lie in or extend into the region. The six RAs are required, inter alia, to make recommendations to and promote the execution of resolutions of Congress and the Executive Council, and coordinate meteorological and related activities in their respective regions.⁵ Technical commissions, which may be established by Congress, consist of technical experts to study and make recommendations to Congress and the Executive Council on any subject within the purpose of WMO. Members of the Organization have the right to be represented on the eight TCs.⁶

13. Very few organizations of the United Nations system convene meetings of their supreme legislative body at intervals of greater than two years. JIU has found this practice to be an impediment to effective decision-making in its management reviews of the International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO) and the International Telecommunication Union (ITU) and in both cases has recommended that the periodicity be reduced to two years.⁷ The Inspector has been similarly concerned that the four-year interval between WMO Congresses might be an obstacle to addressing issues in a timely and effective manner, inhibiting the capacity of the Organization to respond to Members' needs. However, the governance system includes a complex system of delegation of authority to the other governing bodies, as well as the

¹ See WMO Convention, art. 4 (b).

² See WMO Convention, arts. 7, 8 and 10.

³ *Ibid.*, arts. 13, 14 and 15.

⁴ *Ibid.*, art. 6 (b).

⁵ *Ibid.*, art. 18.

⁶ *Ibid.*, art. 19.

⁷ JIU/REP/2007/5, recommendation 2 (a) and JIU/REP/2001/3, recommendation 1 (a).

possibility for Congress to make decisions by correspondence or convene an extraordinary session, somewhat mitigating these concerns.

14. As there is provision for extraordinary sessions, Congress could be convened at intervals closer to two years without needing to change the Convention. The Inspector raised the issue of biennial Congresses with his interlocutors, and the proposal received support from some who considered that decision-making would be improved. Others thought that, due to the scientific nature of the work, which entails long lead-times, the four-year interval between Congresses should be retained. However, concerns were widely expressed about the cost implications, which was a major issue for representatives of Members. Furthermore, such a change would ultimately need modifications in the Convention, but it would appear difficult to achieve the required consensus. The Inspector has therefore concluded that changing Congress to a two-year cycle is not feasible at the present time, but that Members should consider the issue in the future, in the light of the experience from the implementation of the recommendations of the present report and practices of other United Nations system organizations.

B. Measures to improve governance between Congresses

Executive Council

15. In the period between Congresses, the Executive Council exercises wide-ranging delegated powers. As members of Council act in their personal capacities, the Members of the Organization are not represented in this governing body, limiting their involvement in governance issues between Congresses, and raising questions about the representativeness of the decisions of Council. The fifteenth Congress in 2007 endeavoured to address this issue by, *inter alia*, requesting the Executive Council to invite Members to attend, as observers, its sessions and those of its relevant subsidiary bodies, and make public all its non-confidential documents.⁸ The Council will provide an assessment of these changes and recommend actions to the sixteenth Congress. The Inspector found that these measures constituted an important step in enhancing the transparency and inclusiveness of the Council.

16. However, the Executive Council still cannot be considered an intergovernmental body, because according to article 6 (b) of the WMO Convention, its members remain representative of the Organization, not of the Members of WMO. While the Convention sets out parameters for the geographical distribution of seats in the Executive Council in order to maintain a reasonable regional balance, this is not sufficient, in the light of article 6 (b), to ensure that the Council represents the overall membership. Furthermore, article 6 (b) is not in line with the practice of most United Nations specialized agencies,⁹ and should be changed accordingly. In this respect, the Inspector notes that the World Health Organization (WHO) amended its Constitution in 1998.¹⁰ The implementation of the following recommendation is expected to enhance the effectiveness of WMO governance.

⁸ Resolution 7.4/5 (Cg-XV).

⁹ See for example ITU Constitution, art. 7 (b), International Maritime Organization Convention, art. 18, and United Nations Industrial Development Organization Constitution, art. 9, para. 4 (a).

¹⁰ Art. 24, Constitution of the WHO.

Recommendation 1

Congress should clarify the status of the Executive Council as an intergovernmental body and should modify the Convention accordingly.

Financial Advisory Committee

17. Congress established the Financial Advisory Committee (FINAC) in 1987 with a restricted membership and a mandate to advise Congress and the Executive Council on budgetary and financial matters.¹¹ The Fifteenth Congress agreed to revise the purpose, functions and composition of FINAC, opening it to all WMO Members, with a core membership comprising the President of WMO and the presidents of the WMO regional associations.¹² Among its functions, FINAC will advise on the adequacy of the linkage between the results-based budget and the WMO Strategic Plan, and on the adequacy of regular and extrabudgetary resource allocations against expected results. It will seek to formulate its recommendations through consensus, and will make its reports available to all WMO Members. The Inspector fully supports these reforms, which will ensure transparency and wide representation, and facilitate the planning, programming and budgeting process. To the extent that FINAC has full membership, wide participation and consensus-based decision-making, its recommendations should be accepted by the Executive Council as the decisions of the whole membership of the Organization.

C. Governance of the planning cycle

18. The Inspector has found that ambiguities and inconsistencies exist in those parts of the WMO legal instruments that relate to the respective responsibilities of Congress and the Executive Council for planning, programming and budgeting, and believes that clarifications are urgently required.

19. Congress determines the maximum expenditure that may be incurred by the Organization during the following four-year financial period on the basis of estimates submitted by the Secretary-General after prior examination by, and with the recommendations of, the Executive Council.¹³ The Executive Council also examines the programme and budget estimates for the following four-year financial period prepared by the Secretary-General and presents its observations and recommendations thereon to Congress.¹⁴ However, the actions of Congress on the programme and budget estimates for the four-year financial period are limited to authorizing the maximum expenditure; it does not adopt a detailed programme and budget.

20. The authority delegated to the Executive Council to approve biennial budgets, appropriations for each of the two biennia comprising the financial period, and transfers between appropriation parts is set out in the appropriate legal instruments.¹⁵ These instruments do not, however, provide linkages between the four-year programme and budget estimates submitted to Congress and the biennial programme and budget estimates submitted

¹¹ Resolution 29 (Cg-X).

¹² Resolution 10.1/4 (CG-XV).

¹³ WMO Convention, art. 23 (a).

¹⁴ *Ibid.*, art. 14 (b).

¹⁵ WMO Convention, art. 23 (b) and WMO Financial Regulations, arts. 3, 4, 6 and 7.

separately to the Executive Council. While the biennial programme and budget is adopted by the Executive Council, the four-year budget is not adopted by any governing body. Whether the Executive Council has the authority, besides approving appropriations, to modify programmes is a question not answered in the regulations. The Inspector also notes that as the Executive Council meets immediately after Congress, there is insufficient time for the Secretary-General to prepare programme and budget estimates for the first biennium of the financial period; programme and budget estimates are submitted to the Executive Council only for the second biennium.

21. In general, there are no clear or consistently established responsibilities for the adoption of the programme and budget and the recently developed planning instruments. As the supreme body of the Organization, Congress adopts the Strategic Plan. It does so through specific resolutions, but there is no formal provision for this in the legal instruments, which should be revised accordingly. Similarly, provision should be made in the legal instruments for the appropriate governing body to adopt the WMO Operational Plan.

22. Effective and efficient functioning of an organization requires a clear division of responsibilities between all the stakeholders. This was seen as a critical benchmark in the JIU series of reports on managing for results in the United Nations system.¹⁶ The implementation of the following recommendation is expected to improve management through enhanced governance of, and accountability for, the planning, programming and budgeting cycle.

Recommendation 2

The Executive Council should submit a proposal to the sixteenth Congress for its approval that sets out the respective responsibilities of Congress, the Executive Council and the secretariat for the Strategic Plan, the Programme and Budget, and the Operational Plan, and any related changes to the WMO legal instruments.

23. WMO has shortened its long-term planning horizon for the next financial period with the introduction of a four-year strategic plan that takes a horizontal approach to WMO objectives, expected results and key performance indicators. The Inspector is of the view that this should be complemented with coherent biennial programming and budgeting. Under current practice, as noted above, the Executive Council following the Congress does not adopt a full-scale biennial programme budget, but only a short list of appropriations for the first biennium. The absence of a detailed programme budget with expected results and performance indicators for the first biennium compromises the assessment of programme performance and is inconsistent with the adoption of a full programme and budget for the second biennium.

24. Under biennial budgeting, detailed programme and budget estimates for the four-year financial period would not be necessary. Instead, the WMO Strategic Plan to be adopted by Congress should contain not only a four-year strategic plan but also a four-year programme and budget outline to shape the general framework of the biennial budgets. This would enhance the governance and oversight role of Congress. There should be clear delegation of authority from Congress to the Executive Council for the adoption of the biennial programme

¹⁶ JIU/REP/2004/6, benchmark 2.

and budget within the framework of the strategic plan, the outline, and the maximum expenditure level set by Congress. Biennial programme budgeting also facilitates annual budget appropriations as decided by the Executive Council in 2006.¹⁷

25. The scheduling of the Executive Council session following Congress should allow sufficient time for the Secretary-General to prepare detailed programme and budget proposals for the first biennium, and for its review by FINAC and the Executive Council. Biennial budgeting also entails more frequent communication within RAs and TCs, and more effective feedback.

26. WMO currently prepares a four-year operational plan for the four-year financial period. With the move to biennial budgeting, the operational plan should cover a concurrent two-year period and be clearly linked to the biennial programme and budget to facilitate the implementation of results-based budgeting (RBB). The operational plan should be adopted by the Executive Council.

27. These suggested arrangements, combined with the advisory role of FINAC on strategic plan and budget linkages and increased transparency and representativeness in the Executive Council and FINAC, should provide the Organization with a modern and relatively flexible programme and budget structure. The implementation of the following recommendations is expected to improve management through enhanced effectiveness of planning, programming and budgeting.

Recommendation 3

The Executive Council should submit a proposal to the sixteenth Congress for a WMO Strategic Plan for the four-year financial period comprising a strategic plan and a programme and budget outline, for its review and adoption.

Recommendation 4

The Executive Council should adopt a Programme and Budget for each biennium.

D. Executive Council authority regarding regulations

28. Under the Convention, Congress has the authority to determine the regulations of the Organization.¹⁸ Considering the wide ranging responsibilities of the Executive Council, however, strict implementation of this authority would inhibit flexibility in the Organization and is unnecessary. The Inspector is of the view that under biennial budgeting, as proposed, it would be appropriate to delegate authority to the Executive Council for financial and other operational regulations. To the extent that FINAC has full membership and wide participation, and as its mandate covers the financial regulations, its recommendations in respect of these regulations would reflect the decisions of all members and should be enacted

¹⁷ EC-LVIII/Doc. 4.1(1).

¹⁸ WMO Convention, art. 8 (d).

by the Executive Council. The implementation of the following recommendation is expected to improve management through enhanced effectiveness of the programme and budget process.

Recommendation 5

Congress should delegate sufficient authority to the Executive Council to enable it to determine and modify financial and other operational regulations. To this end, the Executive Council should prepare and submit a proposal to the sixteenth Congress.

E. Results-based management

Transition to results-based management

29. In 2003, the WMO Congress decided that RBB should be introduced into the WMO system in a gradual and incremental manner, and that the design of the programme objectives should be in the context of the WMO Long-term Plan.¹⁹ While the resolution was couched in terms of RBB, Congress recognized that the secretariat would need to move to a system of results-based management (RBM).²⁰ The Inspector has reviewed the implementation of results-based management in WMO, including the relevant reports of the internal and external auditors. Some findings are briefly summarized below, while other findings and recommendations will be included in the management letter to be submitted to the Secretary-General.

30. In his report to the Executive Council in 2006 on programme performance for 2004-2005, the Secretary-General identified obstacles in moving to a results-based approach. There was a need to establish a framework to better link biennial achievements with the objectives of the long-term plan, to refine objectives, expected results and performance indicators, to improve the collection of performance information, and to enhance staff skills. He also observed that strengthening of results-based performance management was not resource-neutral and that consideration would need to be given to the optimal volume of resource inputs needed if the results-based culture was to become a permanent feature of the secretariat's structure.²¹

31. The WMO External Auditor, in his 2005 report on the implementation of results-based budgeting and management, identified a number of areas for improvement, including the need to provide clear links between objectives and performance measures, as had been stressed by JIU in its 2004 series of reports on RBM.²² The External Auditor also found that performance indicators in the 2004-2007 Programme and Budget and the proposals for 2008-2011 were not sufficiently specific, measurable, achievable, relevant or time bound (SMART), and suggested that a training strategy was required to embed the RBM process within the organizational culture of WMO. The implementation of results-based budgeting was also audited in detail by the Internal Oversight Office (IOO) of WMO in 2006.

¹⁹ Resolution 31 (Cg-XIV).

²⁰ Resolution 31 (Cg-XIV, annex 1).

²¹ EC-LVIII/Rep. 5.1, appendix, para.1.5.

²² EC-LVIII/Rep. 4.1(1), appendix B, paras. 16-41.

32. The Inspector recognizes the considerable efforts and the progress made towards the implementation of results-based budgeting in the Organization. The strategic plan and the budget have been structured on a results-based format and expected results have been refined. Although there have been notable improvements, problems identified earlier by the Secretary-General and the internal and external auditors need to be further addressed.

33. The responses to the JIU survey of WMO staff also indicate that the Organization has made progress in moving to a results-based approach, with more than 60 per cent of all respondents saying that they were familiar or somewhat familiar with the concept of RBB in WMO (table 1 below). As might be expected, staff in the Professional category and those having managerial responsibilities responded more positively (82 and 78 per cent respectively were familiar or somewhat familiar), while more than 50 per cent of General Service staff said that they were not familiar with the RBB concept.

34. Almost one third of respondents thought that the WMO objectives and expected results were not clearly communicated, although this was felt more strongly by the General Service category (49 per cent). Only 10 per cent thought that the WMO expected results and key performance indicators were realistic and achievable, but more than 50 per cent thought that this was somewhat the case. Some 55 per cent said that the goals of their work unit were clearly defined, a view that was held evenly across all categories of respondents. Some 58 per cent thought that the work unit did not receive adequate resources to meet those goals, with substantive/technical staff feeling this most strongly (74 per cent).

35. In general, the JIU survey results show that the results-based approach is relatively better understood by staff in the Professional category, by those performing substantive/technical functions and by those with managerial responsibilities. While this might be expected, particularly in the transitional stages of a move to RBM, a results-based approach must be understood and accepted by all staff if the full benefits are to be achieved by the Organization. The Inspector was informed that RBM training had been provided to senior managers, and that for other categories of staff it was being provided through briefings and documentation in the context of budget preparation and programme implementation. He has concluded, however, that there is a need to develop training further based on a strategy and plan that identifies problems and needs. A comprehensive training programme should be devised that takes account of the differing needs of the various staff categories as the Organization moves forward to full adoption of RBM.

36. Interviews and survey results indicate that although there has been significant progress in the implementation of RBB, the results approach has still not sufficiently permeated all levels of the Organization and a results-oriented culture is lacking among staff. Some 47 per cent of survey respondents believed that there was no common conceptual understanding of RBB in the Organization, a view that was held fairly evenly over different categories of respondents. Some 16 per cent considered RBB and RBM to be the same concepts, but one third said that they did not know, rising to more than 60 per cent for the General Service category. While only 12 per cent considered that the introduction of RBB had resulted in changes in the working practices of their offices, 37 per cent considered it had not. Moreover, 51 per cent of respondents stated that they did not know if the implementation of RBB would improve the overall performance of WMO.

37. Management has the responsibility to ensure that the results approach cascades down from the top level of the Organization to the individual level through the establishment of results-oriented work plans and performance assessments. In this regard, the lack of a consistent and effective monitoring, evaluation and reporting system remains a serious concern. Performance assessment has been undertaken by consultants, and has generally been

output oriented. Furthermore, the absence of true biennial programme and budgeting has not been conducive to the establishment of an effective performance assessment and reporting mechanism.

Table 1
RBB/RBM: perceptions of WMO staff
(per cent of responses)

| Survey question | Response options | | | |
|---|------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| | Yes | Some-what | No | Don't know |
| Are you familiar with the concept of RBB in WMO? | 32.7 | 28.6 | 28.6 | 10.2 |
| Do you consider that RBB and RBM are the same concepts? | 16.3 | 32.7 | 17.4 | 33.7 |
| In your opinion, is there a common conceptual understanding of RBB in WMO? | 6.1 | 21.4 | 46.9 | 25.5 |
| Are WMO's objectives and expected results clearly communicated to you? | 31.6 | 35.7 | 30.6 | 2.0 |
| Do you find WMO's expected results and key performance indicators realistic and achievable? | 10.3 | 51.6 | 17.5 | 20.6 |
| Are the goals of your work unit clearly defined? | 54.6 | 24.7 | 19.6 | 1.0 |
| Does your work unit receive adequate resources in order to meet its goals? | 13.1 | 25.3 | 57.6 | 4.0 |
| Has the introduction of RBB resulted in changes in the working practices of your office? | 12.4 | 22.7 | 37.1 | 27.8 |
| Will the implementation of RBB improve the overall performance of WMO? | 19.4 | 15.3 | 14.3 | 51.0 |

Source: Responses to JIU survey of WMO staff.

38. The concept of RBB endorsed by Congress in 2003 emphasized the use of the logical framework, the justification of resources by results, and the infusion of performance measurement into the budgetary decision-making process.²³ While this definition identified key elements, it would need further elaboration to reflect a comprehensive approach to RBM. In particular, the human resources policy of the Organization should be fully integrated into results-based management. Furthermore, the Inspector considers that the problems highlighted by his review, notably the lack of a common understanding or ownership of RBM in the Organization, need to be addressed at the policy level. The Executive Council should

²³ Annex 2 to Resolution 31 (Cg-XIV), para. 11.

give clear direction with regard to RBM concepts and policy, and the guidance provided by the JIU benchmarking framework could assist WMO in this regard.²⁴ This benchmarking framework was endorsed by the General Assembly at the recommendation of the Committee for Programme and Coordination.²⁵ Moreover, the United Nations System Chief Executives Board for Coordination (CEB) invited United Nations system organizations to endorse the JIU benchmarking framework and to use it as the chapeau for the implementation of RBM.²⁶ The implementation of the following recommendation is expected to improve management through enhanced efficiency by speeding up the implementation of results-based management in WMO.

Recommendation 6

The Executive Council should give clear direction with regard to results-based management concepts and policy, and should request the Secretary-General to expedite the transition to a results-based structure and culture, aligning all parts of the Organization with RBM, taking into account the benchmarks formulated in the respective reports of JIU.

Alignment of programme structure with RBM

39. For the 2008-2011 financial period, the WMO strategic plan and the programme and budget are both based on expected results, whereas the WMO secretariat operating plan is programme and activity based. The Inspector found that there was not a sufficiently clear or measurable link between the secretariat operating plan and the expected results and performance indicators in the strategic plan, and that the operating plan was not in line with RBM. JIU has emphasized the need for an organization's programmes to be aligned with its long-term objectives for the effective implementation of RBM.²⁷ It pointed out that this might require regrouping and reformulating programmes to provide better focus for the work of the organization within the framework of the long-term objectives identified, thereby avoiding a strategic disconnection in programme planning.

40. The Inspector was informed that the WMO programme structure dates back several decades, apart from two cross-cutting programmes that have been introduced more recently – the WMO space programme and the WMO disaster risk reduction programme. The departments and offices of WMO closely correlate with the programme structure. The introduction of RBB in the Organization has not been accompanied by the realignment of programmes with the results approach. As the expected results of the strategic plan and the programme and budget cut horizontally across the various programmes, there is considerable scope for rationalization and streamlining of the programme structure, and hence the departmental structure.

²⁴ “Managing for Results in the United Nations system: Overview; Part I: Implementation of results-based management in the United Nations organizations; Part II: Delegation of authority and accountability; Part III: Managing performance and contracts” (JIU/REP/2004/5, 6, 7 and 8).

²⁵ General Assembly resolution 60/257.

²⁶ CEB/2005/HLCM/R.6.

²⁷ JIU/REP/2004/6, benchmark 4.

41. In the forthcoming financial period, additional cross-cutting activities are planned, and the governing bodies are supportive of these changes. The fifteenth Congress noted that the Executive Council endorsed the alignment of the WMO programme structure with the strategic plan so as to guide more effectively the development of the WMO programme and budget.²⁸ In adopting the strategic plan for 2008-2011, Congress requested the Executive Council, the regional associations, the technical commissions and the Secretary-General to adhere to the direction and priorities set forth in the strategic plan and to organize their programme structures and activities so as to pursue the top-level objectives and achieve the expected results.²⁹ Congress agreed that the common alignment of the WMO programmes with the WMO strategic plan for 2008-2011 and beyond should commence soon after its fifteenth session. It requested the Executive Council to take a lead role in that process and assign the presidents of the technical commissions with the task of monitoring and reporting on the progress with this alignment on an annual basis.³⁰ In view of the differing positions of WMO senior staff on changes to the programme structure, as well as existing workloads, the Inspector believes that an external review of the programme structure and the corresponding departmental structure would facilitate restructuring in line with RBM.

42. The Inspector is of the opinion that the rationalization and realignment of the WMO programme structure is of fundamental importance to secure the strategic direction of the Organization and improve efficiency. As the technical commissions are closely aligned with the present programme structure, it would be necessary to review their mandates and terms of reference in parallel, with a view to identifying cross-cutting approaches and opportunities for rationalization. At the very least, meetings of closely related technical commissions should be scheduled conjointly. The implementation of the following recommendations is expected to improve management through enhanced efficiency of strategic planning, programming and budgeting in WMO.

Recommendation 7

The programme structure of WMO should be rationalized to align it with the WMO Strategic Plan. In this regard, the Executive Council should request the Secretary-General to commission an independent study on this issue to be submitted to the Executive Council.

Recommendation 8

The technical commissions should set up a cross-commissions working group to review the current structure with a view to rationalizing it, taking into account the conclusions of the independent study referred to in recommendation 7 above.

²⁸ Resolution 6.2/1 (Cg-XV).

²⁹ Ibid.

³⁰ Cg-XV/PINK 6.2, appendix A, para. 6.2.9.

III. DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AND REGIONAL ACTIVITIES

A. Country/regional needs assessment

43. The regional associations, as well as the technical commissions, have a key role to play in WMO programmes and long-term planning.³¹ In this regard, the RAs recently started preparing regional strategic plans for the enhancement of meteorological services in their respective regions, and the WMO regional offices are tasked with follow-up on the implementation of these plans.³² The Inspector is of the view that regional strategic planning is currently weak and too dependent on ad hoc inputs from individual countries in the regions and would benefit from a more systematic approach. To this end, each RA should establish a task group to undertake a comprehensive assessment of each country in the region that would feed into a systematic regional needs assessment and hence the regional strategic plan.

44. Under the regional programme, the WMO secretariat should provide assistance to the RAs in the preparation of the country and regional needs assessments. Secretariat activities under the WMO programme for the least developed countries (LDCs) would also be important in this regard, particularly the development of the WMO country profile database that was initiated in order to promote synergies between Members, the secretariat, cooperating partners, funding agencies and other stakeholders.³³ The Inspector finds it imperative that the secretariat expedite the collection of detailed country information to enhance the content of this database so that it can become an effective tool for country needs assessment, and particularly for programme planning for the LDCs.

45. Enhanced country/regional needs assessments would improve the input of the RAs in the preparation of the WMO strategic plan, programme and budget, as well as the work of the TCs. It would also facilitate the preparation in the regions of high-impact cross-country projects that could be integrated into WMO programmes and used as a basis for resource mobilization. To monitor progress in meeting country/regional needs, the secretariat should develop a mechanism for continuous feedback from the countries and regions that would facilitate the measurement of expected results. The feedback mechanism could be in the form of a cascade system from national to regional level and from regional to global level. The implementation of the following recommendations is expected to improve management through enhanced effectiveness of the WMO regional programme.

Recommendation 9

The Executive Council should request the Secretary-General to initiate comprehensive country/regional needs assessments in cooperation with the regional associations and the countries, with particular emphasis on the least developed countries, which would feed into the regional strategic plans, the WMO Strategic Plan, and the Programme and Budget. In this regard, the Executive Council should invite member countries to provide the necessary cooperation and support.

³¹ WMO General Regulations 173 and 190 specify respectively that these shall normally be agenda items for RA and TC sessions.

³² WMO Service Note No. 37/2006, annex 1.

³³ Cg-XV/Rep. 7.3, appendix, para. 15.

Recommendation 10

The Secretary-General should develop a country/regional feedback mechanism to facilitate measurement of the achievement of expected results.

B. WMO offices in the regions

46. The Regional Programme and the Technical Cooperation Department were merged in 2006 into the Development Cooperation and Regional Activities Department (DCR). Following a stakeholder survey, the functions and structure of the new department were rationalized and streamlined with the aim of improving services to Members. To enhance the integration of the WMO offices in the regions and the WMO secretariat, it was decided that the directors of the regions would be located at headquarters and visit Members in their respective regions in a systematic manner. It was expected that the WMO offices in the regions would be more integrated in the resource mobilization and advocacy processes of WMO.³⁴

47. While these reforms are timely, the Inspector believes that they do not go far enough. He has identified shortcomings in the functioning of the WMO offices in the regions that need to be addressed, including the lack of detailed activity plans or performance indicators that suggests a disconnect between the activities of these offices and the Organization's strategic planning, programming and budgeting. Furthermore, there is no systematic, regular reporting by the offices in the regions to headquarters regarding their activities, achievements, performance or lessons learned. To some extent, the small size of the offices in the regions constrains their sphere of action to that of liaison office, and they lack operational responsibilities in respect of project development and implementation.

48. The JIU survey results indicated that 30 per cent of WMO staff considered that the activities of WMO offices in the field were useful for the achievement of the objectives and expected results of the Organization, with another 23 per cent considering that they were somewhat useful. The Inspector is of the view, however, that WMO has not made optimal use of its offices in the regions and, at this point in time, their value-added to the Organization is questionable.

49. Within the framework of the new strategy for DCR, WMO offices in the field could be better utilized. Apart from the enhanced role already envisaged in advocacy and resource mobilization, these offices should participate actively in the assessment of the national meteorological and hydrological services (NMHSs) of the countries of the region and the regional needs assessment. Guided by these assessments, the offices should initiate project development, particularly multi-country and regional projects that could contribute to regional development. They should also follow-up on implementation and document improvements in the countries and regions. The implementation of the following recommendations is expected to improve management through enhanced effectiveness of the WMO offices in the regions.

³⁴ WMO Service Note No. 37/2006, para. 4.

Recommendation 11

The Secretary-General should ensure that each WMO office in the field prepares a detailed annual plan with activities and performance indicators that is aligned with the Strategic Plan and the Programme and Budget, and makes quarterly reports thereon to headquarters. The report should include, inter alia, activities undertaken, planned activities, targets and actual results, and improvements in the countries/region in terms of WMO expected results.

Recommendation 12

The Secretary-General should ensure that WMO offices in the field participate actively in the preparation of the country/regional assessments, prepare follow-up reports on all relevant issues in the countries/region, initiate project development and implementation, and proactively undertake resource mobilization activities.

C. Resource mobilization

50. The Technical Cooperation Programme (TCOP) aims at bridging the gap between advanced and developing NMHSs of WMO Members by assisting them in developing appropriate services and infrastructure of significant socio-economic benefit. This is facilitated, inter alia, through the mobilization of resources from various national and international sources.³⁵ The fifteenth Congress reiterated that the TCOP was an essential and high priority activity for the implementation of the scientific and technical programmes of WMO.³⁶

51. The Regional Programme (RP) facilitates the development and implementation of regional policies and strategies to strengthen the role and operation of NMHSs and relevant regional centres to enable them to contribute to the sustainable development of their respective countries and regions. The RP cuts across the other major WMO programmes via regional aspects that address regional priorities and particular needs of Members. It provides support to the six regional associations and their subsidiary bodies, organizing regional activities and mobilizing resources.³⁷

52. The Inspector recognizes the importance of both the TCOP and the RP for capacity development in countries and regions, but finds that these programmes are not based on systematic needs assessment, but rather on ad hoc demands of countries or regions. A comprehensive needs assessment approach, as proposed in recommendation 9 above, would allow the secretariat and the RAs to better identify needs, as well as the potential for high-impact regional projects. Within a development context, this would enable the TCOP and RP to provide optimum benefits for the regions. It would also enable WMO to implement an effective resource mobilization strategy and encourage donors to contribute more funding.

³⁵ Secretariat Operating Plan 2008-2011, Cg-XV/Doc 6.2(2), para. 2.7.1.

³⁶ Cg-XV/PINK 3.7, appendix A, para. 3.7.2.

³⁷ Secretariat Operating Plan, op. cit., para. 2.8.1.

53. Traditionally most extrabudgetary funding has been received under the Voluntary Cooperation Programme (VCP), a sub-programme of TCOP. The VCP is used to fund relatively small-scale projects and overall the volume has been fairly constant. WMO is now seeking to fund new activities and larger scale projects and needs to attract funding from other sources such as the World Bank and the European Union. The recently created Resource Mobilization Office in DCR is a first step, but the Secretary-General needs to move swiftly to develop a formal resource mobilization strategy to help secure funding. This is imperative in view of the constraints of zero nominal growth budget policies, increasing needs and the intense competition for extrabudgetary resources for funding development and other activities. The strategy should clarify responsibilities within the secretariat, provide guidelines for communication with donors, identify the main focus areas and targets, and provide projections. The implementation of the following recommendations is expected to enhance the effectiveness of WMO in meeting the needs of its members.

Recommendation 13

The Secretary-General should prepare a resource mobilization strategy for the consideration of the Executive Council.

Recommendation 14

The Secretary-General should assist countries and/or regions to prepare high-impact regional or multi-country projects based on the regional needs assessments.

D. Dissemination of best practices

54. Scientific and technological advances in meteorology and hydrology have the potential to improve living standards at the global level, be it gains in agricultural output and productivity, gains in preventive health care, early warning systems that save lives, or a host of other advantages that have been well documented by WMO. Against a background of rapid technological change, WMO is uniquely placed to track advances in technologies and methodologies that are being made in both the developed and developing countries, and has a responsibility to identify and disseminate best practices. To the extent possible, the secretariat should use the information gathered to initiate projects in developing countries and regions.

IV. GENERAL MANAGEMENT ISSUES

A. Regulatory framework

55. WMO has introduced many structural and procedural changes since 2004, but these are not sufficiently reflected in the regulations and rules. Standing instructions remain out of date and many changes have been handled by service notes and circulars, so that the regulatory framework remains fragmented and difficult to navigate. In particular, the Organization lacks formal policies and procedures for services and operations.

56. In its annual accountability report for 2006, IOO found that the regulatory framework of WMO was an area of internal control that still required significant attention of management.³⁸ However, in the interviews for this report, many secretariat officials accorded low priority to the updating of administrative instruments in their area of responsibility or pointed to resource constraints.

Table 2

Regulatory framework: perceptions of WMO staff

(per cent of responses)

| Survey question | Response options | | | |
|---|------------------|-------------|-------------|------------|
| | Yes | Some-what | No | Don't know |
| Do you find regulations, rules and other administrative instruments sufficient and clear enough for effective implementation? | 29.8 | 34.0 | 34.0 | 2.1 |
| Do you find regulations, rules and other administrative instruments easily accessible? | 44.1 | 31.2 | 24.7 | 0.0 |
| Do you find that respective responsibilities and work processes between departments are clear and well documented? | 8.5 | 34.0 | 52.1 | 5.3 |
| Do you find that the level of coordination and cooperation between departments is adequate? | 6.9 | 34.7 | 58.4 | 0.0 |
| Are WMO procedures for finance and procurement clear and user-friendly? | 9.6 | 23.4 | 54.3 | 12.8 |
| Are administrative tasks completed in a timely and efficient manner in WMO? | 14.0 | 36.6 | 48.4 | 1.1 |

Source: Responses to JIU survey of WMO staff.

57. For any organization, written internal procedures and workflows and a clear division of responsibilities between departments have paramount importance for operational efficiency,

³⁸ Cg-XV/Doc. 10.1(6), appendix B, para. 91.

internal control and accountability. WMO suffers from the lack of a set of internal procedures, guidelines and instructions regarding work processes, departmental responsibilities, and workflow. The Inspector found that this was particularly the case in the budget preparation process. WMO staff perceptions of these issues can be seen in table 2 above. While some 30 per cent of respondents thought that regulations, rules and other administrative instruments were sufficient and clear enough for effective implementation, 34 per cent thought the opposite. As for procedures for finance and procurement, the majority of respondents (54 per cent) thought that they were neither clear nor user friendly.

58. In dealing with cross-cutting issues, ambiguities in the division of responsibilities, coordination and work processes give rise to tension, and may entail conflicts between and within departments, posing risks for operational efficiency and effectiveness. The perception of the majority of survey respondents was that respective responsibilities and work processes between departments were not clear and well documented, and that the level of coordination and cooperation between departments was not adequate. It is also notable that some 48 per cent of respondents thought that administrative tasks were not completed in a timely and efficient manner, which reflects, at least in part, the weaknesses identified in the regulatory framework. The implementation of the following recommendations is expected to bring management improvements through enhanced controls and compliance.

Recommendation 15

The Secretary-General should ensure that a clear common regulatory framework is in place, bringing all administrative instruments up to date, and maintaining them so on a regular basis, and making them accessible on the WMO intranet.

Recommendation 16

The Secretary-General should compile a comprehensive set of internal procedures, guidelines and instructions setting out departmental responsibilities, work processes and workflows, and make it accessible on the WMO intranet.

Recommendation 17

The Secretary-General should establish a task force under his chairmanship to identify and address the problems in coordination and cooperation between departments.

B. Meetings

59. The scientific and technical nature of the work of WMO, its complex governance structure, and the lengthy decision-making processes mean that the Organization must budget for servicing a large number of meetings. Regular resources budgeted for this purpose amounted to 17.6 per cent of the total regular budget in the 2004-2007 financial period and 15.8 per cent in 2008-2011.³⁹ The Organization also budgets resources for third party travel to meetings amounting to some 7.7 per cent of total regular budget resources in both 2004-2007 and 2008-2011.⁴⁰ Of the 366 meetings proposed during the fifteenth financial period, almost half comprise panels, working groups, study groups and meetings of experts (table 3 below).

Table 3

Meetings proposed during the fifteenth financial period, 2008-2011

| | |
|---|------------|
| Constituent bodies and technical commissions | 22 |
| Implementations coordination meetings | 16 |
| Panels, working groups, study groups and meetings of experts | 179 |
| Symposia, technical conferences, seminars, workshops and training courses | 101 |
| Working groups, study groups and meetings of experts financed from the JCRF | 48 |
| Total | 366 |

Source: EC-LVIII/Doc. 5.2(1), annex A.

60. While recognizing the importance of meetings for conducting the business of the Organization, the Inspector has concerns related to the number of meetings and their productivity. During interviews, some representatives of Members expressed the view that some meetings were time consuming and unproductive, and that a four-week Congress was too long. Among the technical commissions, there was duplication on cross-cutting issues and scope for rationalization and streamlining that could reduce the number of meetings. The Inspector found the productivity of some of the working groups, particularly those of the regional associations, was questionable. In an effort to improve, some RAs had set up management groups to review working methods and monitor outputs.

61. The Inspector is of the view that WMO should assess the effectiveness of meetings and seek ways to reduce expenditure on meetings, releasing resources for programming, particularly for capacity development under the technical cooperation programme. A systematic review of the proposed meetings schedule for the fifteenth financial period should be undertaken as a matter of priority to identify potential efficiencies. Scheduling working group meetings conjointly, for example, could offer synergies, raise productivity and reduce costs. The Organization should fully exploit information technologies such as Internet facilities and videoconferencing. The implementation of the following recommendation is

³⁹ Computation includes regular resources budgeted for both Conferences, Printing and Distribution Department, and Linguistic Services and Publications Department and hence includes some costs not directly related to servicing meetings, such as publications (EC-LVIII/Doc. 5.2(1), annex B, table 6).

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, table 9.

expected to improve management through enhanced efficiency by reducing the overall costs of servicing meetings and raising productivity.

Recommendation 18

The Executive Council should request the Secretary-General to submit for its consideration a long-term strategy to reduce the cost of international meetings. The strategy should include proposals, inter alia, to increase the effectiveness and reduce the number and length of meetings, including reducing the number of working groups.

C. Budgetary issues

Transfers between budget appropriations

62. Under the financial regulations, transfers between budget appropriation parts may be authorized by the Executive Council, subject to the total amount of such transfers not exceeding 3 per cent of the total maximum expenditure authorized for the financial period, and a transfer between appropriation sections may be made by the Secretary-General subject to confirmation by the Executive Council.⁴¹ In adopting the programme and budget for 2006-2007, the Executive Council authorized the Secretary-General to make transfers between appropriation parts⁴² of the budget for the biennium, to deliver better the programmes in accordance with Financial Regulation 4.2.⁴³

63. The Inspector considers that inter-part transfers up to a total of 3 per cent of maximum expenditure for the financial period gives management too much flexibility to move resources between programmes. Basing the limit for transfers on a percentage of the four-year maximum expenditure rather than on a percentage of the biennial budget parts brings an inherent risk for transparency and accountability in the implementation of the approved programme budget. In this environment, there may be less incentive for the Secretary-General to prepare realistic budgets, which may result in a disconnection between the planned programme and its implementation, and less effective oversight and control by the Members.

64. In practice, inter-part transfers are authorized retroactively by the President of WMO acting on behalf of the Executive Council.⁴⁴ The Inspector finds such retroactive authorization to be useless. Furthermore, the magnitude of the transfer ceiling combined with retroactive authorization gives cause for concern that there can be significant deviations from the approved programme and budget without the knowledge or consent of the Executive Council.

65. The Inspector recognizes that within a four-year programme and budget period there is likely to be a disconnect between the initial budget appropriations and the actual needs of the Organization as they evolve during the period, which could account for the level of flexibility accorded under current regulations. With the move to biennial budgeting, however, as proposed in recommendation 4 above, the need for flexibility would be considerably reduced.

⁴¹ WMO Financial Regulations 4.2 and 7.7.

⁴² Under the new RBB format, expected results equate to appropriation parts.

⁴³ Resolution 13 (EC-LVII).

⁴⁴ WMO Standing Instructions 5.3.

The implementation of the following recommendations is expected to enhance the effectiveness of the programme and budget process.

Recommendation 19

The Executive Council should change the basis for transfers between budget appropriation parts from a percentage of the total maximum expenditure authorized for the four-year financial period to a percentage of the relevant biennial budget appropriation part.

Recommendation 20

The Executive Council should grant the Secretary-General authority to make transfers between budget appropriation parts limited to 5 per cent of the lesser appropriation amount. It should also require him to seek the prior approval of the President for any transfer above this limit, and to report to the Financial Advisory Committee the reasons for such transfers and the implications for the programme and budget.

Lapse factor

66. In any budget period, savings result from delays in both establishing new posts and filling existing posts. The potential savings arising from this staff vacancy rate – or lapse factor – can be estimated and the proposed staff costs budget reduced accordingly, releasing resources for other programme activities. For the 2000-2003 programme and budget, a lapse factor of 15 per cent was applied, but at its fifty-third session the Executive Council noted that the assumption of a high vacancy rate which did not reflect actual staff turnover had adverse effects on the programme cost budget and might hamper full implementation of planned activities.⁴⁵ For the 2004-2007 programme and budget, a lapse factor of 3 per cent was assumed, which was considered to be consistent with the practice of other United Nations system organizations.⁴⁶ Nevertheless, for the 2006-2007 programme and budget, the lapse factor was reduced to nought.⁴⁷ The Inspector was informed that a nil lapse factor was also assumed for the 2008-2011 programme and budget.

67. With a nil lapse factor, savings accrue from recruitment delays, giving the Secretary-General additional flexibility in the use of resources which may not accord with the programme and budget as approved by the Members. The Inspector is of the view that the programme and budget should reflect realistic assumptions. Vacancy rates should be continuously monitored so that the lapse factor applied to a given budget is based on experience. Furthermore, a realistic lapse factor would increase the accuracy of expenditure reports and make monitoring and assessment more meaningful. The implementation of the

⁴⁵ CG-XIV/Doc. 8(1), annex B, paras. 20-22.

⁴⁶ Ibid.

⁴⁷ EC-LVII/Doc. 5(1), annex A, para. 11.

following recommendation is expected to improve management through enhanced efficiency of the programme and budget process.

Recommendation 21

The Executive Council should request the Secretary-General to prepare programme and budget proposals based on a realistic lapse factor.

Support costs

68. The current programme-support cost policy is embodied in a 2004 resolution of the Executive Council, which established programme-support cost recovery rates as follows:

- Rate of 13 per cent for technical cooperation projects, including VCP projects, but with flexibility in certain circumstances;
- Rate of 7 per cent for funds-in-trust financing normative activities which supplement regular budget programmes;
- Rate of 12 per cent for funds for Junior Professional Officers;
- Rates for United Nations Development Programme projects as set by its Executive Board.⁴⁸

Different rates may pose risks for the Organization since donors may negotiate to further lower rates, which can lead to subsidization from the regular budget to extrabudgetary activities.

69. In 2006, the Executive Council endorsed the view of its Advisory Group of Experts on Technical Cooperation that the identified direct costs, such as the project development cost and reasonable expenditures for implementation, should be recovered. It agreed on the need to review and revise the current support costs policy, in particular the level of the overhead charge, with a view to the establishment of a WMO direct cost recovery policy.⁴⁹ In this regard, it should be noted that the working group on support costs of the Finance and Budget Network of CEB has concluded that cost recovery policies should encompass both programme support costs and direct costs and that both of these costs should be fully recovered from extrabudgetary projects.⁵⁰ The CEB working group on support costs is working towards the harmonization of support cost recovery policies in the United Nations system, and in its recent report on voluntary contributions, JIU recommended that executive heads expedite this work.⁵¹

D. Information systems

70. The Inspector recognizes that WMO has taken significant initiatives in the area of information systems, including the establishment of the Information Systems Strategy Advisory Committee (ISSAC) and the development of an information technology and information management strategy for the secretariat. In 2006, the Integrated Resource

⁴⁸ Resolution 19 (EC-LVI).

⁴⁹ Ibid.

⁵⁰ CEB/2005/5, paras. 48-54.

⁵¹ JIU/REP/2007/1, recommendation 4.

Management (IRM) project using the Oracle e-business suite (IRM/Oracle) was implemented in two phases — financial systems and human resources management system.

71. During his interviews with WMO staff, the Inspector heard frequent complaints about the IRM/Oracle system, particularly that it was time consuming, created confusion and was not user-friendly. There was clear resistance to using the system to the extent that established procedures might be overridden, posing internal control risks. These observations were borne out by the responses to the staff survey (table 4 below).

72. The Inspector was particularly concerned that nearly 40 per cent of staff did not believe that implementation of the IRM/Oracle system would enable their work unit to perform more effectively overall. Some 39 per cent thought that there was a clear need to develop detailed guidelines for using the new system, and some 53 per cent considered that they had not received sufficient training. The survey also showed that staff working in the substantive/technical areas of the secretariat were experiencing the most difficulties with the new system, hence any training strategy should take account of the needs of different groups. It was also a concern that some managers were not able to attend training sessions because of their busy schedules.

Table 4
IRM/Oracle system: perceptions of WMO staff

(per cent of responses)

| Survey question | Response options | | | |
|---|------------------|-----------|-------------|------------|
| | Yes | Some-what | No | Don't know |
| Is there a clear manual/guidelines on the use of the Oracle system? | 12.5 | 28.1 | 38.5 | 20.8 |
| Do you consider that you have received sufficient training on the new Oracle system? | 10.6 | 25.5 | 53.2 | 10.6 |
| When a problem arises in the Oracle system related to your work, do you know where to go for help? | 44.1 | 22.6 | 23.7 | 9.7 |
| Will the implementation of the Oracle information system enable your work unit to perform more effectively overall? | 18.5 | 17.4 | 39.1 | 25.0 |

Source: Responses to JIU survey of WMO staff.

73. IOO has undertaken a comprehensive audit of the new system and has made a number of recommendations for improvement that focus on specific details. The Inspector concurs with these findings, but further believes that senior management has the responsibility to demonstrate the benefits of the new system to the staff at large and should play a more active role in this regard. He also notes that IOO will undertake a post-implementation review of the ERP/Oracle system using an external contractor, and commends the Secretary-General for this initiative. Implementation of the following recommendations is expected to enhance the effectiveness of the IRM/Oracle system.

Recommendation 22

The Secretary-General should ensure as a matter of urgency that clear guidelines and instructions for the new IRM/Oracle system are available to all users.

Recommendation 23

The Secretary-General should ensure as a matter of urgency that all users of the new IRM/Oracle system receive adequate training.

V. HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGEMENT

A. Strategy, policies and practices

74. The Inspector was informed that the WMO secretariat had established a task force to review the human resources management strategy and align it with the new strategic plan of the Organization. This is a work in progress that should be expedited, particularly in view of the responses of the WMO staff to the questions on human resources management in the JIU survey (see table 5 below).

Table 5

Human resources management: perceptions of WMO staff

(per cent of responses)

| Survey question | Response options | | | |
|--|------------------|-------------|-------------|------------|
| | Yes | Some-what | No | Don't know |
| Does WMO have clear written HR policies and procedures? | 33.3 | 29.2 | 29.2 | 8.3 |
| In general, are WMO HR policies implemented in a consistent and fair manner? | 17.7 | 27.1 | 38.5 | 16.7 |
| In general, is WMO's recruitment policy transparent? | 14.6 | 31.3 | 42.7 | 11.5 |
| Are promotions in your office based on objective performance-related considerations? | 17.7 | 19.8 | 42.7 | 19.8 |
| Does WMO adequately reward staff members who show outstanding performance? | 5.2 | 13.5 | 62.5 | 18.8 |
| Is under-performance detected and appropriately addressed? | 4.2 | 15.6 | 58.3 | 21.9 |
| Are there effective mechanisms for WMO staff to resolve conflicts and have grievances heard? | 20.8 | 32.3 | 24.0 | 22.9 |
| Are conflicts dealt with openly and fairly? | 11.6 | 16.8 | 36.8 | 34.7 |

Source: Responses to JIU survey of WMO staff.

75. The staff's general perceptions of the management of human resource are far from positive, which may adversely affect organizational performance. The Inspector considers that WMO management should consult closely with staff representatives in order to address the specific concerns of the staff, particularly the transparency of recruitment, the fairness of promotions and performance related issues. A more positive work environment is essential to increase the engagement of staff and hence organizational performance.

B. Composition of the secretariat: selected issues

Gender distribution

76. In the last decade, WMO has sought to promote equal opportunities for women in meteorology and hydrology through international conferences (1997 and 2003), two global surveys, and an expert meeting in 2007 which drafted the WMO policy on gender mainstreaming that was approved by the fifteenth Congress.⁵² Congress requested the Executive Council to establish an advisory panel of experts to oversee WMO activities on this issue. It also requested the Secretary-General to establish a gender expert function within the approved budget for 2008-2011 to assist with the implementation of the gender policy within the secretariat and by Members, technical commissions and regional associations, and to monitor and evaluate progress.

Table 6

Gender distribution in the WMO secretariat: Professional level and above

(per cent of total)

| | 2000 | 2001 | 2002 | 2003 | 2004 | 2005 |
|---|------|------|------|------|------|------|
| All Professional level and above | | | | | | |
| Female | 25.0 | 25.7 | 23.7 | 25.4 | 26.4 | 27.7 |
| Male | 75.0 | 74.3 | 76.3 | 74.6 | 73.6 | 72.3 |
| P-5 and above | | | | | | |
| Female | 11.1 | 12.7 | 16.1 | 19.2 | 19.6 | 22.6 |
| Male | 88.9 | 87.3 | 83.9 | 80.8 | 80.4 | 77.4 |

Source: Data provided by WMO.

77. The Inspector commends these efforts to develop a comprehensive gender mainstreaming policy and framework of action, but finds progress disappointing in respect of gender balance at the Professional level and above in the WMO secretariat. In 2005, only 27.7 per cent of staff at the Professional level and above were women, and at the P-5 level and above, women accounted for only 22.6 per cent of staff (table 6 above). The slight improvement between 2003 and 2005 at the Professional level and above indicates very slow progress towards gender parity, if it represents a trend at all. Progress appears stronger at the P-5 level and above, but the distribution in 2005 was still far below the gender parity goal set

⁵² Cg-XV/PINK 7.5.

by the General Assembly in 1997.⁵³ WMO also lags far behind most of the other United Nations system organizations in this regard.⁵⁴

78. In the JIU survey of WMO staff, 62 per cent of male respondents but only 38 per cent of female respondents thought that men and women received equal treatment in WMO. Furthermore, 71 per cent of male respondents but only 34 per cent of female respondents thought that WMO encouraged the advancement of women. The gender distribution statistics presented in table 6 would seem to suggest that the female perception is closer to the reality.

79. Data provided by WMO on the gender distribution of new recruitment in the secretariat show that, in every year since 2000, male recruitment at the Professional level and above has far exceeded female recruitment. In the period 2000-2005, on average only 28 per cent of a total of 75 staff recruited at the Professional level and above were women, while at the P-5 level and above, only 24 per cent were women. If this situation persists, the Organization has little chance of improving gender distribution in the secretariat in the foreseeable future. The Inspector believes that the lack of a gender policy that is specific to the secretariat, including the absence of written instructions and time-bound targets, is contributing to this problem.

80. The Inspector was informed that the gender distribution at the Professional level and above was partly a reflection of the situation in the NMHSs, which were a major source of recruitment for WMO. To alleviate this situation in the longer term, WMO should encourage the recruitment and career development of women in the NMHSs by giving priority to equally qualified women in its fellowship programme and other training activities. The implementation of the following recommendation is expected to improve management through enhanced effectiveness of WMO in meeting its commitments to gender mainstreaming.

Recommendation 24

The Secretary-General should launch a policy that proactively pursues gender balance in the secretariat to increase the proportion of women at the professional level and above, and particularly at the senior management level. As part of this policy, Members should be encouraged to put forward more female candidates for fellowship and training programmes.

Geographical distribution

81. The Inspector was informed that there is no formal policy for geographical distribution, and that senior management considered that tight quotas would be inappropriate in a secretariat that had fewer than 150 posts at the Professional level and above. There had been some discussion in the house about setting regional targets but no further action. Almost half

⁵³ The General Assembly reaffirmed the goal of 50/50 gender distribution by the year 2000 in all categories of posts within the United Nations system, especially at the D-1 level and above (General Assembly resolution 52/96 of 12 December 1997).

⁵⁴ As at 31 December 2004, WMO ranked 25th out of 31 United Nations organizations for the proportion of female staff in total staff at the professional level and above; the ratio of 26 per cent for female professional staff in WMO compares with an average of 37 per cent for the 31 organizations (CEB/2005/HLCM/29, table 11c).

of all staff at the Professional level and above came from Europe in 2005-2006, and this has been an increasing trend (table 7 below). The proportion from Africa has been declining in the period reviewed, as was the case for South-West Pacific up to 2005. Other data show that while some countries are represented by a significant number of their nationals, some other countries are not represented at all.⁵⁵

Table 7
Geographical distribution in the WMO secretariat:
Professional level and above

(year end, per cent of total)

| | 2002 | 2003 | 2004 | 2005 | 2006 ^a |
|--|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------------|
| Africa | 21.8 | 21.4 | 19.6 | 19.3 | 15.7 |
| Asia | 11.8 | 12.8 | 13.4 | 11.8 | 13.2 |
| South America | 6.7 | 6.8 | 7.2 | 6.7 | 6.6 |
| N. and C. America and Caribbean | 10.9 | 10.3 | 10.7 | 9.3 | 10.8 |
| South-West Pacific | 7.6 | 6.0 | 4.5 | 4.2 | 5.8 |
| Europe | 41.2 | 42.7 | 44.6 | 48.7 | 47.9 |

Source: Data provided by WMO.

^a *As at end November and excluding linguistic staff for November 2006.*

82. The Inspector recognizes that it would be inappropriate to set ranges for representation at the country level, given the small size of the secretariat. He believes, however, that the Secretary-General should prepare indicative reasonable ranges for the representation of regions. The implementation of the following recommendation is expected to improve management through enhanced effectiveness of WMO in moving towards equitable geographical representation.

Recommendation 25

The Secretary-General should launch a policy that proactively pursues geographical balance in the secretariat to increase representation from under-represented regions, with priority in recruitment given to candidates from countries that are not represented.

⁵⁵ CEB/2005/HLCM/29, table 12.

VI. OVERSIGHT

A. Internal oversight

83. Following the discovery of fraud in the WMO secretariat in 2003, internal oversight was strengthened with the establishment of the Internal Oversight Office (IOO) mandated to provide the full range of oversight services. IOO has carried out detailed audits and made comprehensive recommendations in many areas such as treasury functions, fellowship operations, procurement services, payroll operations, the IRM/Oracle project, publications and printing, travel management, and results-based budgeting. These audits have been shared with JIU in the course of the current review. The Inspector commends IOO for the high quality of audit work that it has performed in a short time period and for its constructive recommendations. Analysis of the implementation status of these recommendations suggests that the rate of implementation could be faster and the Inspector urges senior management to identify and address the reasons for slow progress.⁵⁶

84. In its recent report on oversight lacunae in the United Nations system, JIU recommended that minimum standards for the reporting responsibilities of the internal oversight services of the United Nations system should encompass reporting to both the executive head and the oversight board of the organization, with unimpeded access to the latter, including in instances where disagreements arose with the executive head.⁵⁷ The Institute of Internal Auditors believes strongly that to achieve the necessary independence, the head of internal audit should report functionally to the audit committee, while reporting administratively to the head of the organization. The Inspector was therefore concerned to learn that the WMO Audit Committee was not receptive to the proposal that IOO should report to it directly, and considers that this may jeopardize the independence of internal oversight in the Organization.

85. The Inspector is also of the view that independence of the oversight function is not best served by having management provide secretariat services to the Audit Committee, as is currently the case, since there is a clear conflict of interest. In the absence of a dedicated secretariat for this purpose, such services should be provided by IOO which has a measure of independence from management. The implementation of the following recommendation is expected to improve management through enhanced effectiveness of oversight in WMO.

Recommendation 26

The Secretary-General should ensure that secretariat functions for the Audit Committee are provided by IOO.

B. Ethics function

86. Following the fraud, ethical standards in the secretariat came under closer scrutiny, and a formal Code of Ethics was developed by a task force with the participation of staff and issued in 2006. Staff are required to attend a workshop on the Code. The JIU survey of WMO

⁵⁶ Cg-XV/Doc. 10.1(6), para. 11.

⁵⁷ JIU/REP/2006/2, recommendation 11.

staff posed several questions on values in the Organization and the overall responses are shown in table 8 below. It is a cause for concern that 30 per cent of staff had seen conduct in recent months that they thought violated the WMO Code of Ethics and that nearly one third thought people did not trust each other. It is also of concern that women had more negative perceptions in their answers to these questions than men.

Table 8
Values: perceptions of WMO staff
(per cent of responses)

| Survey question | Response options | | | |
|--|------------------|-------------|-------------|------------|
| | Yes | Some-what | No | Don't know |
| Are cultural differences respected in WMO? | 53.1 | 36.5 | 4.2 | 6.3 |
| If you witnessed an incident of harassment or discrimination in your work unit, would you feel comfortable reporting it? | 47.4 | 15.8 | 25.3 | 11.6 |
| In recent months, have you seen conduct that you thought violated WMO's Code of Ethics? | 30.2 | 7.3 | 51.0 | 11.5 |
| In general, do people trust each other in WMO? | 11.6 | 46.3 | 32.6 | 9.5 |

Source: Responses to JIU survey of WMO staff.

87. The Code of Ethics includes a section on conflict of interest that requires officials holding senior positions and all officials with responsibilities in the areas of procurement and the management of financial assets to make financial disclosures at least annually. However, there is no mechanism in place to review the financial disclosures or to oversee the implementation of the Code of Ethics. JIU, in its recent report on oversight lacunae, recommended that each organization should establish an ethics function, with smaller organizations such as WMO possibly incorporating this in a dual-function post.⁵⁸ The Inspector is of the view that the Secretary-General should assign this function to an existing post on a dual-function basis. Alternatively, a committee could be formed for this purpose. The establishment of a formal ethics function in line with best practice would strengthen the implementation of the Code of Ethics. Therefore implementation of the following recommendation is expected to strengthen accountability in the WMO secretariat.

Recommendation 27

The Secretary-General should establish a formal ethics function to promote and oversee the implementation of the WMO Ethics Code.

⁵⁸ Ibid., recommendation 15.

VII. STAFF SURVEY: OTHER KEY FINDINGS

88. The Inspector found that the online survey of WMO staff provided useful insights into many aspects of the Organization. Many of the key findings have been incorporated in the previous chapters of the report, while some others are shown in table 9 below.

Table 9

Other perceptions of WMO staff

(per cent of responses)


| Survey question | Response options | | | |
|---|------------------|-------------|-------------|------------|
| | Yes | Some-what | No | Don't know |
| Are you treated with consideration at work? | 61.1 | 27.8 | 9.3 | 1.9 |
| Are you satisfied with your job? | 47.8 | 37.0 | 15.2 | 0.0 |
| Are you optimistic about WMO's future? | 35.9 | 30.4 | 32.6 | 1.1 |
| Does WMO management lead by example? | 14.0 | 30.0 | 45.0 | 11.0 |
| Do you have confidence in WMO top management (Secretary-General, Deputy Secretary-General and Assistant Secretary-General)? | 33.3 | 39.2 | 25.5 | 2.0 |
| Do you have confidence in the Director of your department? | 46.4 | 28.9 | 23.7 | 1.0 |
| Do you have confidence in your supervisor? | 57.1 | 23.8 | 19.1 | 0.0 |
| Does WMO management encourage open discussion? | 16.5 | 41.8 | 35.9 | 5.8 |
| Are important matters communicated through formal channels? | 40.7 | 40.7 | 15.7 | 2.8 |
| Do you receive sufficient information about what is going on in your work unit/office? | 42.6 | 33.3 | 24.1 | 0.0 |
| Are you satisfied with the level of support that your supervisor provides to you in order for you to meet your work objectives? | 50.5 | 28.6 | 21.0 | 0.0 |

Source: Responses to JIU survey of WMO staff.

89. The responses to the first three questions in the table above indicate that the staff feels quite positive about working in WMO, suggesting some sense of pride in and belonging to the Organization. Nevertheless, 45 per cent of respondents were of the view that WMO management does not lead by example, some 25 per cent did not have confidence in WMO top management, and some 42 per cent thought that management did not encourage open discussion. These responses, combined with the responses to the questions on human resources management policies, raise concerns about the corporate culture of the Organization as it relates to integrity, transparency, trust and cooperation. It may reflect a disconnect and lack of communication between top management, its policies and the rest of the staff. It is encouraging, however, that the level of confidence in departmental directors and, particularly, supervisors is relatively high, and that staff are quite positive about the flow of pertinent information.

90. A full set of the aggregated results of the survey is being provided to WMO management and staff representatives for their further assessment, consultation and follow-up actions for improvement. As high levels of staff engagement correlate strongly with positive organizational performance, staff surveys should be held regularly to identify the areas for corrective action by management, and progress should be measured against previous results and benchmarks.

| | Intended impact | United Nations, its funds and programmes | | | | | | | | | | | Specialized agencies and IAEA | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------|-----------------|--|--------|-------|------|------------|-------|-------|------|-------|--------|-----|-------------------------------|-----|-----|--------|------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|------|-------|-------|------|
| | | United Nations* | UNCTAD | UNODC | UNEP | UN-HABITAT | UNHCR | UNRWA | UNDP | UNFPA | UNICEF | WFP | OTHERS | ILO | FAO | UNESCO | ICAO | WHO | UPU | ITU | WMO | IMO | WIPO | UNIDO | UNWTO | IAEA |
| Recommendation 15 | d | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | E | | | | | |
| Recommendation 16 | d | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | E | | | | | |
| Recommendation 17 | d | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | E | | | | | |
| Recommendation 18 | g | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | L | | | | | |
| Recommendation 19 | e | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | L | | | | | |
| Recommendation 20 | e | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | L | | | | | |
| Recommendation 21 | g | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | L | | | | | |
| Recommendation 22 | e | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | E | | | | | |
| Recommendation 23 | e | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | E | | | | | |
| Recommendation 24 | e | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | E | | | | | |
| Recommendation 25 | e | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | E | | | | | |
| Recommendation 26 | e | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | E | | | | | |
| Recommendation 27 | a | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | E | | | | | |

Legend: **L:** Recommendation for decision by legislative organ
 E: Recommendation for action by executive head
 : Recommendation does not require action by this organization

Intended impact: **a:** enhanced accountability **b:** dissemination of best practices **c:** enhanced coordination and cooperation **d:** enhanced controls and compliance
e: enhanced effectiveness **f:** significant financial savings **g:** enhanced efficiency **o:** other

* Covers all entities listed in ST/SGB/2002/11 other than UNCTAD, UNODC, UNEP, UN-HABITAT, UNHCR, UNRWA.