# USE OF RETIREES AND STAFF RETAINED BEYOND THE MANDATORY AGE OF SEPARATION AT UNITED NATIONS ORGANIZATIONS

Prepared by

Papa Louis Fall Cihan Terzi

**Joint Inspection Unit** 

Geneva 2014



**United Nations** 

JIU/NOTE/2014/1 Original: ENGLISH

# USE OF RETIREES AND STAFF RETAINED BEYOND THE MANDATORY AGE OF SEPARATION AT UNITED NATIONS ORGANIZATIONS

Prepared by

Papa Louis Fall Cihan Terzi

**Joint Inspection Unit** 



**United Nations, Geneva 2014** 

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

## Use of retirees and staff retained beyond the mandatory age of separation at United Nations organizations JIU/NOTE/2014/1

As part of its programme of work for 2013, the Joint Inspection Unit (JIU) conducted a review of the use of retirees and staff retained beyond the mandatory age of separation (MAS) in United Nations organizations. The review delivers a system-wide comparative analysis of overall policies and practices, based on the actual, versus the desirable, use of staff retained and retirees rehired and identifies commonalities and differences, as well as good practices that could be replicated and harmonized across the system.

The present note contains five recommendations addressed to the Secretary-General and executive heads of United Nations organizations concerning: flexi/phased retirement; knowledge-sharing practices to capitalize on the experience of staff due to retire and retirees rehired, policies regulating the use of staff retained and retirees rehired and their actual use, and the implementation of workforce planning with respect to posts occupied by staff due to retire. The recommendations aim at: disseminating good practices; improving the regulatory framework and compliance therewith; ensuring the effective use of retained staff and retirees rehired; and enhancing knowledge transfer and accountability of managers to maximize potential benefits and mitigate any negative impact. The main findings and recommendations are as follows.

#### Overall

The review found that a significant proportion of retirees have been retained beyond the mandatory age of separation (20 per cent) and/or rehired (71 per cent) at United Nations organizations, although not all resort to this practice to the same extent. While it has allowed organizations to benefit from a wealth of knowledge and experience to deliver the programme objectives in a more flexible and effective manner, it has an adverse impact on workforce rejuvenation and career development of staff at organizations where the age structure is old and there is a need for fresh talent. In 2010, only 26 per cent of the United Nations organizations' professional staff were young (< 40 years) against 38 per cent older (>50 years). If the proposed increase in MAS for current staff is approved, the proportion of older staff will grow.

The high proportion of staff retained and retirees rehired in D category and above and in general service positions to perform management and administration functions also adversely impacts accountability and goes against the claimed need for specialized skills that cannot be found among mentored/coached/trained staff at the organizations, with few exceptions.

If effective workforce/succession planning and knowledge transfer policies were developed and strictly enforced, the need to retain staff and rehire retirees would then be limited to specific exceptional cases, particularly if the proposed increase in MAS for current staff to 65 were approved. Since the bulk of retirees employed at most organizations are aged between 60 and 65, the experience and knowledge needed would then be available within the organizations.

#### Mandatory age of separation (MAS) (paras. 12-18)

MAS is not fully harmonized system-wide: there are three different main tiers (60, 62 and 65), depending on the entry on duty date of staff at the various United Nations organizations. At some organizations, this does not apply in the same way to staff appointed to technical

cooperation projects. Conditions should be set and exceptions documented/approved only for staff recruited to work on time-bound projects in the field for the duration of the project. Successive staff appointments to different projects and from regular budget to project-funded positions should be barred from exceptions. For high-level officials/political appointees without MAS, the terms of office should be clearly defined and the tenure should not exceed two successive periods of five years.

After the General Assembly's decision in early 2013 to increase MAS to 65 for newcomers, as of January 2014, other United Nations organizations followed suit and the International Civil Service Commission (ICSC) undertook to study the increase in MAS also for current staff. The proposal to apply the increase from January 2016 was submitted to the General Assembly for approval but no decision was taken. Staff representatives supported an optional increase; however Human Resources managers disagreed. The General Assembly requested ICSC to further study the issue and its implications and report to it at its sixty-ninth session.

#### Early retirement (paras. 19-24)

A significant proportion of retirees took early retirement (28 per cent) and early retirees were further rehired (23 per cent). More women than men took early retirement; yet the proportion of men was relatively high at organizations with field representation and rotation/mobility policies in place. Exit interviews as part of the normal separation procedures should be used as a management tool to determine the reasons for early separation. Early retirees rehired were mostly men.

#### Flexi/Phased retirement (paras. 25-32)

Phased retirement may ease the transition to retirement and contribute to enhancing the work-life balance, workforce planning and knowledge transfer. Only the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) and the World Food Programme (WFP) allow staff to work part time for a maximum period of one year during the three years preceding retirement but no staff take this option because of the negative impact on the pension benefits. To encourage this, part-time staff should be permitted to contribute to the United Nations Joint Staff Pension Fund (UNJSPF) on a 100-per cent basis, which would require a revision of its current regulations and rules, which already allow staff on leave without pay to contribute to the Fund.

The Inspectors recommend that UNJSPF bring to the consideration of the General Assembly the need to address the phased retirement scheme option and revise the relevant provisions of the UNJSPF Regulations and Rules to allow contributions to the Fund from staff working part time, including prior to retirement, under specific conditions (Recommendation 1).

#### **Staff retained beyond MAS** (paras. 33-50)

The regulatory framework for retaining staff beyond MAS is not equally strong and coherent across the system. The main condition for retaining staff is that it should be on an exceptional basis, in the interests of organizations and approved by the executive head: this is too general.

Good practices identified at the United Nations Secretariat that should be replicated throughout the system are as follows: identification of posts twelve months before the retirement of the incumbent and advertisement at least six months ahead of this, with no extensions granted without a substantiated explanation and no extensions exceeding six months.

Actual use varies across the system; on the basis of the information gathered, it is evident that the term "exceptional" is not necessarily interpreted in the same way at all organizations and exceptions do not apply equally to all categories, functions and genders of staff. A significant

proportion of staff retained were in management and administration and in D category and above. A majority were men.

#### Retirees rehired (paras. 51-83)

The conditions for hiring retirees are not consistent and can be quite dissimilar across the system; some organizations are more "demanding" than others. The main conditions applicable, the earnings and time limits per year, are different at some organizations and several do not have any limits. Since certain hiring modalities in place, such as the use of private companies, may make it possible to sidestep these limits, their use should be better regulated and conditions set. Other restrictive conditions exist at some organizations.

The regulatory framework was found to be quite strong at the United Nations and most funds and programmes that apply the same provisions; at the specialized agencies it should be aligned with good practices identified. Loopholes should be closed: for example, the practice of employing retirees through companies; hiring retirees to perform the same functions as those of the post occupied prior to retirement; insufficient break in service; the unlimited number of years over which retirees can be reemployed and the lack of a full medical check to confirm fitness for work for retirees over 65, prior to work and travel for each assignment, particularly to hardship duty stations.

Some organizations are more flexible than others in applying existing conditions and the use of retirees varies in many ways. A sizeable proportion of retirees rehired were in D and above positions at some organizations and in general services and management and administrative functions at many. Due to the shortage of qualified professionals to meet the increasing demand in conference services, a very high number of retirees were employed in language services at the United Nations Secretariat, where also the average number of days worked by retirees rehired exceeded the time limit of six months. Retirees were employed as consultants/individual contractors and/or in vacant posts and were mostly men. Very few organizations took geographical distribution/gender into account in hiring them. Some employed retirees above age 70, 75 and even beyond 80, as at the United Nations secretariat, mostly in language services.

#### **Reasons and impact** (paras. 84-114)

Experience, specialized skills and knowledge of the organization were the main reasons for hiring retirees; the specialized agencies tend to rate the need for specialized skills higher, whereas field agencies value experience and knowledge of the organization equally or more.

Staff representatives criticized the reasons provided as an excuse for farming out work to retirees in an unfair manner, but the numbers of cases reported do not really show a specific pattern. The reasons for hiring retirees are compelling when the specific professional knowledge required is not available in the organizations and clearly less valid to fill gaps/temporary positions due to inadequate workforce/succession planning and carry out routine administrative tasks for which replacements could be found in-house and trained in advance. Very few initiatives were identified to tap the knowledge of retirees and staff due to retire, who take away with them valuable and unshared knowledge, thereby perpetuating the need to continue employing retirees. The Inspectors recommend that:

Executive heads set up effective mechanisms to capitalize on the knowledge and experience of staff due to retire and retirees when rehired, through coaching and mentoring programmes, in line with good practices identified (Recommendation 2).

Hiring retirees and retaining staff due to retire may also have an adverse impact, notably on workforce rejuvenation and staff career development. When employed in vacant posts, the negative effect would be higher than when employed as consultants, but consultants should

not perform core functions that could be performed by the regular workforce. IFAD, as a policy, does not retain any staff beyond MAS or hire retirees, in order to renew and rejuvenate its workforce.

Retaining staff and employing retirees in D category and above managerial positions may also have a negative impact on staff career development, leadership and accountability. The General Assembly has called for these practices to be limited. The perception that there is a "club of selected officials" should be avoided. Inadequate performance assessment of retirees and lack of advance planning to ensure timely filling of posts and knowledge transfer are also accountability issues. The Inspectors recommend that:

Executive heads set a coherent regulatory framework for the approval of exceptions, regardless of the type of contract and funding, based on good practices identified in the United Nations and other system organizations, taking into account the specific needs of certain highly specialized technical agencies, and ensure strict compliance with this framework (Recommendation 3).

For the sake of harmonization and coherence across the system and to avoid unfair competition for talent, all organizations should adopt/apply similar conditions at least in terms of earnings, time limit and break in service.

Executive heads of organizations, particularly those with a large proportion of staff retained and retirees rehired should take immediate action to limit such cases to exceptions which are fully justified, regularly monitored and reported to legislative bodies; and ensure that their employment in senior executive and general service positions is restricted to instances where needs cannot be met by current staff, and that they are rehired as consultants, where applicable, with due regard to the specific needs of organizations (Recommendation 4).

Some organizations have workforce/succession planning initiatives for key senior level/managerial and other specific positions and forecast retirements. However, in many instances, posts due to become vacant are advertised too late, considering the length of the recruitment process. Significant departures of staff owing to retirement are expected in some organizations in the coming years and a lack of effective workforce/succession planning strategies would mean missed opportunities to correct structural imbalances and reprofile the workforce. The Inspectors propose that:

Executive heads of organizations which have not yet done so develop effective workforce/succession planning with respect to posts occupied by staff due for retirement, take action to advertise all relevant vacancies at least six months in advance and ensure timely recruitment (Recommendation 5).

#### A United Nations volunteer programme for retirees (paras. 115-120)

Rather than ad hoc volunteer initiatives for retirees at individual organizations, a structured system-wide programme to tap into the valuable experience of retirees from all United Nations organizations as necessary would better serve the purpose of enhancing coherence of practices.

The United Nations Volunteer (UNV) programme has employed retirees, but in very low numbers. To target retirees when their special technical expertise is needed for coaching/mentoring and humanitarian and other field emergencies, the United Nations organizations and UNJSPF should advertise such post-retirement opportunities on their websites. Organizations could make reference to them in their separation packages. Retirees could also be reached through FAFICS.

#### **CONTENTS**

			Page
	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY		iii
	ABBREVIATIONS		viii
	Chapter	Paragraphs	
I.	INTRODUCTION.	1-11	1
	A. Background	2	1
	B. Objective and scope	3-5	1
	C. Methodology	6-11	2
II.	MANDATORY, EARLY AND PHASED RETIREMENT	12-32	4
	A. Mandatory retirement	12-18	4
	B. Early retirement	19-24	5
	C. Flexi/Phased retirement	25-32	6
III.	RETENTION OF STAFF BEYOND THE		
	MANDATORY AGE OF SEPARATION	33-50	9
	A. Conditions	33-43	9
	B. Use of retained staff	44-50	11
IV.	EMPLOYMENT OF RETIREES	51-83	13
	A. Conditions	51-73	13
	B. Use of retirees	74-83	17
V.	REASONS AND IMPACT	84-114	20
	A. Reasons	85-94	20
	B. Impact	95-103	22
	C. Workforce/succession planning and forecasted retirements	104-114	24
VI.	TOWARDS A UNITED NATIONS VOLUNTEER		
, 1,	PROGRAMME FOR RETIREES	115-120	27
	ANNEXES		
I.	Organizations participating		29
II.	Early retirees and early retirees rehired (2006-2012)		30
III.	Conditions for retaining staff beyond MAS		31
IV.	Staff retained beyond MAS and rehired retirees (2006-2012)		32
V.	Conditions for rehiring retirees		33
VI.	Overview of actions to be taken on recommendations		34

#### **ABBREVIATIONS**

ACABQ Advisory Committee on Administrative and Budgetary Questions

ASG Assistant Secretary-General

CEB United Nations System Chief Executives Board for Coordination

DSA Daily subsistence allowance DFS Department of Field Support

DUNDEX Deployable UN-experienced Development EXperts

ERP Enterprise Resource Planning system

FAFICS Federation of Associations of Former International Civil Servants

FAO Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

HLCM High-level Committee on Management
IAEA International Atomic Energy Agency
ICAO International Civil Aviation Organization
ICSC International Civil Service Commission

IFAD International Fund for Agricultural Development

ILO International Labour Organization
IMO International Maritime Organization

ITC International Trade Centre

ITU International Telecommunication Union

JIU Joint Inspection Unit of the United Nations system

MAS Mandatory age of separation NRA Normal retirement age

OCHA Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
OECD Organisation for European Economic Co-operation

PAHO Pan American Health Organization

UN DESA United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs

UN Women United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women

UNAIDS Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS
UNDP United Nations Development Programme
UNEP United Nations Environment Programme

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

UNFPA United Nations Population Fund

UN-Habitat United Nations Human Settlements Programme

UNHCR Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund

UNIDO United Nations Industrial Development Organization

UNJSPF United Nations Joint Staff Pension Fund UNODC United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime

UNOG United Nations Office at Geneva

UNOPS United Nations Office for Project Services

UNOV United Nations Office at Vienna

UNRWA United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near

East

UNV United Nations Volunteers Programme

UNWTO World Tourism Organization of the United Nations

UPU Universal Postal Union
USG Under-Secretary-General
WFP World Food Programme
WHO World Health Organization

WIPO World Intellectual Property Organization WMO World Meteorological Organization

#### I. INTRODUCTION

1. As part of its programme of work for 2013, from February to December 2013 the Joint Inspection Unit (JIU) conducted a review of the use of retirees and staff retained beyond the mandatory age of separation (MAS) in United Nations system organizations. The topic was proposed by the United Nations Secretariat, endorsed by the International Civil Service Commission (ICSC) and the Chief Executive Board for Coordination (CEB) secretariats.

#### A. Background

2. Over the years, most United Nations system organizations have made use of the practice of the employment of retirees and retention of staff beyond MAS. This practice allows organizations to benefit from a wealth of knowledge and experience to deliver programme objectives in a more flexible and effective manner, at a time of budgetary constraints. However, some are concerned about the potential adverse impact on human resources succession planning, staff career development, knowledge transfer and workforce rejuvenation. Member States have also called for the employment of retirees to be practised on an exceptional basis and only where the operational requirements of the Organization cannot be met by existing staff, to ensure that it is not an obstacle for career planning or the mobility of other United Nations staff and to fill vacant posts at senior and decision-making levels through the established staff selection process, employing retirees in decision-making positions only in exceptional circumstances.<sup>1</sup>

#### B. Objective and scope

- 3. The present review examines the use of retirees and the retention of staff beyond MAS at United Nations organizations in the context of the diverse organizational needs and calls for harmonization across the system. It delivers a system-wide comparative analysis of overall policies and practices, based on actual versus desirable use and identifies commonalities and differences, as well as good practices that could be replicated.
- 4. The evaluation criteria and questions applied were:

#### Relevance

• Do the United Nations organizations have a clear regulatory framework for the use of retirees and retention of staff beyond MAS and, if so, how relevant and useful is it?

#### **Effectiveness**

• How consistently are relevant policies/conditions applied by organizations, including when facing emergency peacekeeping and humanitarian deployment needs or for senior officials being selected for appointments after MAS appointments? How is compliance with them ensured and exceptions authorized, monitored and reported? How significant is this practice? What are the reasons for it? What are its impact and adverse effects?

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> A/RES/53/221, VII; A/RES/57/305, VI; A/RES/59/266, XII, A/RES/63/250, XI, A/RES/65/247, IX.

- What are the arrangements, type and length of contracts, status, functions, category/level, age, gender, and nationality relevant to the hiring of retirees and to the retention of staff beyond MAS?
- Are effective mechanisms in place at United Nations organizations for workforce/succession planning, including forecast retirements and how to deal with these in connection with other Human Resources goals and the impact of the use of staff retained and retirees rehired? Are innovative methods/good practices in place in the United Nations system to tap into the experience and knowledge of staff due to retire and of retirees?

#### Coherence

- Is the United Nations system addressing the issue of retirement from a system-wide perspective?
- 5. The scope is system-wide, covering JIU participating organizations and the period 2006 to 2012 for data collection.

#### C. Methodology

- In accordance with JIU Norms and Standards for evaluation, internal guidelines and working procedures, the methodology followed in preparing the present note included: a preliminary desk review of information available online, an inception report with case studies for two organizations, questionnaires, interviews and an in-depth analysis of data collected. Detailed questionnaires were sent to all JIU participating organizations; three (UNEP, UN-Habitat and UPU) did not respond. More than 30 interviews in person and via videoconference were conducted with officials from United Nations organizations/offices and with staff representatives in various duty stations, the Human Resources Network of the High Level Committee on Management (HLCM) of CEB, ICSC, the United Nations Joint Staff Pension Fund (UNJSPF), the World Bank and the European Commission. A meeting was also organized with DUNDEX, a private company facilitating the deployment of former United Nations staff, including retirees, for short-term assignments with United Nations organizations. A survey among United Nations retirees could not be conducted as planned given the difficulties associated with administering such a survey, but the President of the Federation of Association of Former International Civil Servants (FAFICS) was interviewed in representation of retirees (see annex 1).
- 7. United Nations organizations were requested to provide relevant statistics, which have been included in the present note, where available. Obtaining information that would allow consistent comparisons was problematic due to lack of data and diverse methods of collection, reporting periods and modalities. Data gathered through questionnaires are presented in the annexes.
- 8. The review did not cover in-depth issues related to MAS and succession/workforce planning, which had recently been dealt with by HLCM/CEB, ICSC, JIU and UNSJPF, but considered relevant findings and recommendations of reports on those subjects<sup>2</sup> and took stock of organizations' practice in relation to retirees.
- 9. Comments on the draft note were sought from JIU participating organizations and have been taken into account in its finalization. In accordance with article 11.2 of the JIU statute,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> JIU/REP/2007/4, JIU/REP/2007/6, JIU/REP/2009/8, JIU/NOTE/2012/1, JIU/REP/2012/05; ICSC/75/R.4, ICSC/77/R.4, CEB/2009/HLCM/HR/11, CEB/2012/HLCM/5/Rev.1.

the present note has been finalized following consultation among the Inspectors so as to test conclusions and recommendations against the collective wisdom of the Unit.

- 10. To facilitate the handling of the note and recommendations, annex 6 contains a table indicating by organization whether the note has been submitted for action or for information and the relevant recommendations, specifying whether they require action by the executive head.
- 11. The Inspectors wish to express their appreciation to all who assisted them in the preparation of this review, particularly those who so willingly shared their knowledge and expertise.

#### II. MANDATORY, EARLY AND PHASED RETIREMENT

#### A. Mandatory retirement

Established by the staff regulations and rules at each organization, MAS is the age at which staff members are separated from active service.<sup>3</sup>

- 12. MAS concerns all staff, regardless of the source of funding, at most organizations except for ILO, ITU and UNWTO, where it does not apply in the same manner to staff appointed to technical cooperation (and time-bound) projects. MAS is applied more loosely for high level officials/political appointees.
- 13. MAS is not fully harmonized system-wide. Until recently, for most United Nations organizations, it was 60 years of age for staff whose service began prior to 1 January 1990 and 62 for those who joined on or after that date. At four organizations (FAO, IFAD, WFP and the World Bank) MAS was 62 for all staff, with the option for some to retire at 60 if they had joined before 1990 (FAO and WFP). Two organizations (UPU and WIPO) had 65 as their MAS, in addition to 60 and 62, depending on the date of appointment.
- 14. In July 2012, the UNJSPF Board recommended increasing the normal retirement age (NRA)<sup>4</sup> to 65 for new participants in the Fund from 1 January 2014. The decision was based on the need to ensure the long-term financial sustainability of the Fund, given the increased longevity of participants. ICSC supported the decision and recommended an increase in MAS to 65 for staff recruited on or after that date.<sup>5</sup> In April 2013, the General Assembly endorsed the recommended MAS increase, as of 1 January 2014.<sup>6</sup> Staff Regulation 9.2 has been amended accordingly.<sup>7</sup>
- 15. The endorsement by the General Assembly triggered further decisions during 2013 to increase MAS for newcomers across the United Nations system. All organizations interviewed reported being in the process of revising relevant staff regulations and rules with the approval of their respective governing bodies. As a result, there are currently three main tiers of MAS, depending on the entry on duty date, at most United Nations organizations.
- 16. The decision to increase MAS only for new staff would have little effect in the short run on the use of retirees and retention of staff beyond MAS. However, ICSC subsequently examined the possibility of extending MAS to 65 for current staff and decided to propose to the General Assembly that it be raised as of 1 January 2016, on the understanding that the acquired rights of current staff to retire at the normal age of retirement (to which they were subject upon entry on duty) are preserved. Staff who have served for many years and reached the maximum pension benefits and those serving in duty stations with difficult conditions may wish to retire earlier than at 65.
- 17. The ICSC optional proposal coincided with the position of most staff representatives, who issued a joint communication supporting it. However, CEB Human Resources Network members, in the course of the discussion at the Commission, expressed disappointment as to the quality and pertinence of the analysis and unanimously rejected the recommendation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> CEB/2012/HLCM/5/Rev.1, para. 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Age established in the UNJSPF Regulations and Rules at which staff members may qualify for an unreduced pension benefit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> A/67/30, para. 85.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> A/RES/67/257, OP A.4.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> A/68/129, annex 1, A/RES/68/252, OP.24.

They indicated that further analysis should be undertaken in consultation with the organizations and that any change had to be consensual, planned and phased, and should not impinge on employment contracts which had already been agreed. They also noted that any recommendation from the Commission could lead to reduced harmonization among common system organizations and add unnecessary administrative complexity. In the course of the review, managers questioned were generally of the view that they should have the last word on the option to retire at 65, based on staff members' past performance, health conditions (sick leave history) and the interest/liability to the organization.

Subsequently, the General Assembly decided to request the Commission to "undertake further analysis, in consultation with all relevant stakeholders, on the impact of the adoption of this recommendation on workforce and succession planning frameworks and all relevant human resources management policies, including performance management and appraisal, rejuvenation, gender balance and equitable geographic distribution, across the United Nations common system and to report thereon at its sixty-ninth session". Depending on the outcome of the process, the impact on the retention of staff beyond MAS and retirees rehired might be higher, subject to policies and practices at each organization. ICSC has indicated that raising MAS to 65 for current staff would "reduce the dependency on extended retirement contracts and retiree consultants in the system". 10 On the basis of the fact that the bulk of retirees employed at most reporting organizations are aged between 60 and 65, as discussed further in the present note the Inspectors agree with this ICSC statement and wish to underline that if the recommendation to increase MAS for current staff is approved during the forthcoming General Assembly session, the need to retain staff and hire retirees above this age should be limited to very exceptional cases, where the required expertise could not be found in-house. The Inspectors also stress the importance of harmonizing any decision across the system.

#### **B.** Early retirement

- 19. Currently, the age at which staff are entitled to early retirement is 55, as set by the relevant UNJSPF regulations. However, in the light of the increase in NRA to 65 for new participants, the UNJSPF Board, at its 60th session, held in July 2013, recommended increasing the minimum age for early retirement from 55 to 58 for new Fund members whose participation commences on or after 1 January 2014. As this requires changes to the Fund's regulations, the Board has recommended that it be approved by the General Assembly.
- 20. According to data provided by organizations for the period 2006-2012, at least 1,660 staff took early retirement during that period, representing 28 per cent of the average number of total retirees. Similarly, 315 early retirees were rehired, representing 23 per cent of the average number of total early retirees (annex 2). These percentages are quite significant. Numbers could be even higher had the United Nations, which has the highest number of retirees and retirees rehired system-wide, produced relevant records. Statistics made available by UNJSFP indicate that the number of retirees and early retirees for all United Nations organizations during this period was actually about 2.5 times higher than these figures and the proportion nearly the same.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> A/68/30, paras. 63-75.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> A/RES/68/253, OP.B.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> ICSC/77/R.4, para. 58 (e).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> The United Nations, UN-Habitat, UNIDO, UNRWA and UPU did not provide data on early retirees. Period may vary by organization.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> ILO, the United Nations, UNFPA, UN-Habitat, UNOPS, UNIDO, UNRWA, UPU and WHO did not provide data on early retirees rehired. Period may vary by organization.

- 21. Of the 20 organizations that provided data on early retirees, FAO, ITU, UNAIDS, UNHCR and WFP have the highest average number and/or percentage to average retirees (29-64 per cent). At four organizations, numbers were higher in specific years due to voluntary separation packages introduced with the purpose of cutting/reprofiling positions. Any subsequent rehiring may defeat the purpose of this. Accordingly, at IFAD and ITU, early retirees who have been compensated are not subsequently rehired.
- 22. Out of 16 organizations providing data on early retirees rehired, six (ITC, UNAIDS, UNDP, UNHCR, UN Women, UNWTO and WIPO) reported that they had not rehired any, while IAEA, UNESCO and WFP rehired the highest average number and/or proportion to average early retirees (36-93 per cent). In general, the employment of early retirees is regulated by the same conditions as those for other retirees rehired beyond MAS, as discussed below, except for those with separation packages whose reemployment is either fully prohibited or prohibited for a certain period, generally equivalent to the number of months' salary compensation. This explains why, among the four organizations that introduced separation packages, only one figured among those with the highest proportion of early retirees rehired during the period.
- 23. On the basis of data collected from 11 organizations,<sup>13</sup> it appears that there was near gender parity among early retirees. This is confirmed by UNJSPF data for all organizations. Since, according to CEB statistics, there were fewer women staff across the system during the period concerned, this means that more women took early retirement. In fact, in the case of specialized agencies, there were more women early retirees than at the United Nations and funds and programmes. Nonetheless, early retirees rehired were mostly men (see annex 2).
- 24. The reasons mentioned for there being more women early retirees were long service as general service staff, which allows maximum pension benefits to be accrued earlier, family considerations and lack of career opportunities. It is noted that the proportion of male early retirees was quite high at organizations with high field representation and rotation/mobility policies in place, such as UNDP, UNICEF and WFP. In these instances, hardship conditions at some duty stations and the family implications of constant rotation/reassignment might largely account for the decision to retire early. ICSC officials commenting on this pattern indicated they had requested organizations to conduct exit interviews with separated staff, which might help shed some light on the issue and allow meaningful conclusions to be drawn. Exit interviews are a good practice in terms of effective human resources management; the Inspectors encourage organizations to introduce them as part of normal separation procedures.

#### C. Flexi/Phased retirement

- 25. Flexi/phased retirement is part-time work near retirement time. According to a UN DESA publication citing an OECD study, a factor that may push older persons into retirement in some countries is the inflexible working rules that make it difficult to work part time.<sup>14</sup>
- 26. Most United Nations organizations have part-time arrangements in place, but only FAO and WFP have specific provisions for phased retirement, under which staff with at least five years of service can work part time at 50 or 80 per cent for up to one year during the three-year period preceding retirement.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> ILO, IMO, the United Nations, UNAIDS, UNFPA, UN-Habitat, UNHCR, UNIDO, UNOPS, UNRWA, WHO, WIPO and UPU did not provide data on the gender of early retirees. Period may vary by organization.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> World Population Ageing 2009, p. 3.

- 27. However, these phased retirement policies have had little result; no staff have applied, owing to the negative impact on pension benefits due to the drop in salary when working part time. To incite take-up, part-time staff should be allowed to contribute to the Fund on a 100-per cent basis, which would require revision of the current UNJSPF Regulations and Rules. Staff close to retirement would not be the only ones to benefit: staff in their 30s, 40s or early 50s would potentially be even more interested because of child-care needs or other family responsibilities.
- 28. Discussions on this issue have not brought about any change to the Fund regulations. The Inspectors were informed that the UNJSPF Board had accepted it in the past for reasons of fairness and flexibility and to demonstrate gender sensitivity, since the majority of part-time workers were female. It has however been turned down on the basis of arguments by the Advisory Committee on Administrative and Budgetary Questions (ACABQ) about its inconsistency with the principle of income replacement of the Fund. Subsequently, at its 67th session in 2012, the Pension Board was unable to reach a consensus on resubmitting the proposal to allow the purchase of years of contributory service by part-time staff.
- 29. The above arguments are counter-argued by the current Fund regulations, which allow staff on leave without pay to contribute to the Fund. Letting full-time staff work part time for a limited period of time and contribute to the Fund would support this principle. Staff working part time would pay in full both their contributions to the pension fund and the organization's contribution to avoid any financial loss for the latter. Modifying the existing regulation would not only contribute to enhancing work-life balance at United Nations organizations, but would also ease the transition to retirement and create an incentive for staff close to retirement age to apply for part-time work. This would partially free positions for recruiting/placing staff to carry out part or all of the functions of the departing staff member (on the understanding that provisions for partial incumbency of posts would be made), thereby enhancing workforce planning, coaching/mentoring and knowledge transfer at United Nations organizations.
- 30. Recently, HCLM/CEB supported the conclusion of its Working Group on MAS regarding the desirability of flexible retirement arrangements, such as part-time employment, with the possibility of voluntary contributions on a full-time basis, which helped both staff and organizations.<sup>17</sup> ICSC was also supportive in its report on the same subject, referring to the fact that the Second World Assembly on Ageing was in favour of flexible retirement policies and practices and citing relevant examples of private companies and governments.<sup>18</sup>
- 31. Phased retirement as an option would become even more meaningful in the light of the decision to increase MAS to 65 for new staff and, if approved, for current staff. Therefore, the Inspectors support reconsideration of this issue by the General Assembly.
- 32. The implementation of the following recommendation is expected to enhance more flexible and effective human resources management at United Nations organizations.

<sup>18</sup> ICSC/77/R.4, paras. 12, 17 and 19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> A/63/556, para. 20, A/65/567, paras. 24-25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> CEB/2012/HLCM/5/Rev.1, paras. 46-52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> CEB/2012/3, para. 66.

#### **Recommendation 1**

The UNJSPF Board should bring to the consideration of the General Assembly the need to address the phased retirement scheme option and revise the relevant provisions of the UNJSPF Regulations and Rules to allow contributions to the Fund from staff working part time, including prior to retirement, under specific conditions. Such an option would help enhance workforce planning and work-life balance, thereby easing the transition to retirement and improving gender sensitivity.

### III. RETENTION OF STAFF BEYOND THE MANDATORY AGE OF SEPARATION

Retention beyond the mandatory age of separation is the extension of active service of staff members who have reached MAS, on an exceptional basis in the interests of the organization.<sup>19</sup>

#### A. Conditions

- 33. The main condition for retaining staff beyond MAS across the system is that it should be on an exceptional basis in the interests of organizations and approved by executive heads, as laid out in the staff regulations and rules. At several organizations (FAO, IMO and UNIDO) extensions for up to one year are allowed for staff to attain the minimum five years of service to be eligible for pension benefits.
- 34. The condition as stated above is quite general. Certain organizations are more precise and have set a limit for extensions that could be age (65) or time (ranging from six months to three years for staff serving on peace operations or five years for project staff) (see annex 3). Limiting the duration of retentions is a good practice that should be introduced at all organizations to reduce negative impact on staff career development and rejuvenation and to enhance workforce planning, as discussed below. Ideally, assuming that effective succession/workforce planning is in place and that posts are advertised well in advance, to be filled by the time the incumbents are due for separation, there would be no need for extensions. In the case of unforeseen circumstances or specific needs, an acceptable time would be a maximum of six months, to allow any recruitment process to be completed.
- 35. Some organizations, such as ILO, ITU and UNWTO, are more flexible in the application of MAS for project staff and may have no conditions for their retention, there may be no MAS, or the staff concerned are exempted. Although the need for flexibility in certain cases is understandable, to avoid disruptions in project implementation, it is important that conditions be set and exceptions duly documented and approved solely for staff recruited to work on time-bound technical cooperation projects in the field (not at headquarters) for the duration of the project. Successive appointments of staff to different projects and staff movements from regular budget to project-funded positions should be barred from exceptions and MAS should stand. The limit of five years set by UNIDO for extensions of staff specifically engaged on technical cooperation projects stands out as a good practice.
- 36. It is understood that if MAS is increased to 65 for all current staff, the age limit of 65 for granting extensions at some organizations, as well as the five-year limit set by UNIDO for project staff, would no longer apply. In no case should extensions go beyond age 67, which is the highest mandatory retirement age in any country or organization, according to the ICSC report mentioned above.<sup>20</sup>
- 37. As for high-level officials/political appointees (executive heads and deputies, USGs, ASGs or equivalents), to whom MAS does not apply, the conditions should be that their terms of office are clearly defined and that tenure cannot exceed two successive periods, as recommended for executive heads in a recent JIU report.<sup>21</sup>

<sup>20</sup> ICSC/77/R.4, paras 29-35, and annex II.

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> ST/AI/2003/8, para. 1.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> JIU/REP/2009/8, paras. 71-75.

- 38. The United Nations Secretariat has developed specific provisions for retaining staff serving in peace operations, who represent more than half of the secretariat workforce, for up to three years or more. Other humanitarian agencies which deal with emergencies, such as UNHCR, UNICEF and OCHA, do not have specific procedures. The existence of rosters/pools of "pre-approved" candidates at these organizations for posts to become available due to rotation or emergency may obviate the need for specific procedures.
- 39. It was at the United Nations Secretariat that the Inspectors found that the regulatory framework was strongest and the criteria, conditions and procedures to approve extensions better defined, covering all regular staff appointed up to and including D-2 level.<sup>22</sup> **These good practices, set out in box 1 below, should be replicated at other organizations.**

## Box 1 Good practices at the United Nations Secretariat for approving exceptions to retention of staff beyond MAS

- When it has not been possible to identify a qualified candidate to discharge the functions of the post in a timely manner;
- For the minimum time required for replacing the staff member concerned, not exceeding six months after MAS:
- Departments/offices are requested to regularly identify staff due to retire within a period of twelve months and to take all steps to ensure that such vacancies are advertised at least six months before the anticipated vacancy occurs. No extension is granted if that requirement is not met
- If, within a six-month period after the post has been advertised, circumstances beyond the control of the department or office concerned have made it impossible to replace a staff member due to retire, that department or office may request, on an exceptional basis, that the staff member be retained, explaining why he or she could not be replaced in a timely manner, and providing information necessary to determine whether conditions set out are met;
- No retention at any level is approved unless the request fulfills all the requirements and conditions set.
- 40. The authority to approve exceptions to MAS normally lies with the heads of organizations, although in some cases it is partially delegated to other high-level officials (e.g. at FAO, for extensions of less than three months, at the United Nations Secretariat and at UNDP). At ILO, the Joint Negotiating Committee is consulted with regard to any official below the grade of P-5 or informed with regard to any other official. However, the conditions for exceptions are not clearly defined and are therefore subject to interpretation, which opens the door to possible inconsistencies in their application.
- 41. At ICAO and WMO, extensions for staff in D positions, and in the professional category and above, respectively, require the approval of their governing bodies. At the United Nations, such exceptions are regularly reported to the General Assembly, at the request of Member States, which exercise close oversight.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> ST/AI/2003/8. According to ST/SGB/2002/11, the United Nations Secretariat also includes UNCTAD, UNEP, UN Habitat, UNODC, OCHA, OHCHR, UNHCR, UNRWA and the five Regional Economic Commissions.

- The Inspectors found that the degree of delegation of authority and the fact that the decision is taken by a single individual or by a committee/body has little bearing on how exceptional such "exceptions" are.
- In summary, the regulatory framework for retaining staff beyond MAS is not equally 43. strong, comprehensive enough or consistent across the system and should be strengthened where applicable in line with good practices cited. However, the issue is not solely one of how strong the regulatory framework is but of how effectively it is applied. In this regard, practices are quite diverse across the system. The tone set at the top of the organization is important to ensure that such cases become really exceptional. The United Nations is a good example, where clear instructions by the Secretary-General, close monitoring through the Compact and regular reporting to governing bodies have resulted in a drastic reduction of the number of exceptions in recent years, although there is still room for improvement.

#### B. Use of retained staff

According to data provided by 21 organizations for the period 2006-2012, at least 1,537 staff were retained beyond MAS. They represented 20 per cent of the average retirees of all organizations during these years. Compared with the average organizations' workforces, the proportion was less than half a per cent<sup>23</sup> (see annex 4). Organizations retained staff to varying extents. Some, such as FAO, ITC, ITU, and WFP, make little use of these exceptions, whereas others do so more regularly, as discussed below.

#### Numbers

- 45. In absolute numbers, the following organizations rank among the highest: IAEA, ICAO, the United Nations, UNDP, UNESCO, and UNHCR. They retained on average between 12 staff and as many as 105, at the United Nations Secretariat, per year (see annex 4). Except at the latter, where there was a marked downward trend, and at UNDP, where the opposite was the case, no specific trend was observed during this period at other organizations.
- However, these numbers/averages alone do not indicate as to whether or not they are in proportion to the number/average of retirees and workforce. When these parameters are taken into account ICAO, UNDP and UNESCO are definitively among the major users, both in absolute numbers and in proportion to average retirees and the workforce. Seven other organizations (IMO, UNAIDS, UNFPA, UNOPS, UNWTO, WIPO and WMO) also rank above average in proportion to average retirees and workforce, although in absolute numbers they are not among the highest. The United Nations Secretariat ranks high in absolute numbers and in proportion to average retirees (see annex 4).

#### **Category and functions**

A further review by function and category revealed that a high proportion of staff retained were in management and administration and in the D category and above among the 16<sup>24</sup> and 21<sup>25</sup> organizations which provided data. At half of the organizations, these managerial positions accounted for more than 25 per cent of retainees, notably at FAO, ITC,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> ILO, UN-Habitat, UPU, and WHO: no data available. UNIDO did not provide the number of retirees. Period may vary according to organization.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> IAEA, ILO, UNDP, UNFPA, UN-Habitat, UPU, WFP, WIPO and WHO: no data available. Period may vary according to organization. <sup>25</sup> ILO, UN-Habitat, UPU, and WHO: no data available. Period may vary according to organization.

UNICEF, WFP and WIPO. The proportion is even higher in view of the limited number of these positions.

12

#### Gender and geographical distribution

- 48. No data was generally available on the geographical distribution of staff retained, which in the opinion of officials interviewed would mirror the geographical distribution of staff at the organization.
- 49. As for gender, the majority were men in most of the 21 organizations that provided data<sup>26</sup> with the exception of ITC, and notably at half of them (FAO, IAEA, ITU, UNHCR, UNICEF, UNIDO, UNOPS, UNRWA, UN Women, WFP, WIPO and WMO). This does not necessarily reflect the gender imbalances at these organizations, as compared with CEB statistics.
- 50. To summarize, based on the information gathered it is evident that the term "exceptional" is not interpreted in the same way by all organizations and that exceptions do not involve all categories, functions and gender of staff equally.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> ILO, UN-Habitat, UPU, and WHO: no data available. Period may vary according to organization.

#### IV. EMPLOYMENT OF RETIREES

A United Nations retiree is "a former staff member 55 years of age or older who, consequent upon service exceeding five years, is in receipt of a pension benefit from the United Nations Joint Staff Pension Fund".<sup>27</sup> This definition applies to both early retirees and retirees separated upon reaching MAS.

#### A. Conditions

- 51. Unlike the retention of staff beyond MAS, the conditions for employing retirees are not laid out in the staff regulations and rules, and organizations may or may not have specific directives dealing with these.
- 52. IMO and WIPO do not have written regulations. The United Nations Secretariat has a quite comprehensive administrative instruction specifically dealing with the hiring of retirees, <sup>28</sup> which is also used by other funds and programme. FAO and UNHCR have specific administrative circulars; IAEA, UNFPA and WHO deal with the matter in relevant Human Resources policies and procedures or administration manuals, whereas ICAO, UNDP, UNICEF and UNIDO refer to it in policies and guidelines dealing with types of appointments and contracts. At WMO, retirees engaged as consultants are subject to standing instructions for individual contractors.
- 53. Conditions for hiring retirees are not harmonized and may be quite dissimilar across the system; some organizations are more demanding than others (see annex 5). There are two main conditions applicable to retirees rehired at most United Nations organizations with few exceptions: the earnings and time limits per year. They do not apply to non-United Nations retirees and consequently are seen as discriminatory by some interviewees.
- 54. Officials questioned generally indicated that these limits were strictly applied; some admitted that waivers were occasionally approved.

#### **Earnings limit**

- 55. Currently in existence at 17 organizations, the earnings limit is US\$22,000 per year<sup>29</sup> at most of them, but at IAEA and WHO it is higher (EUR 45,000 and US\$30,000 respectively); and at FAO, which has a maximum daily honorarium, by category of staff, that may exceed the US\$22,000 of most organizations. This limit does not concern retirees employed in language services, for which it is the equivalent of 125 days per calendar year, at the United Nations and UNESCO. As such, the earnings limit of a retiree employed in language services could be much higher than that of any other retiree (see annex 5).
- 56. Six organizations (ICAO, ILO, IMO, UNAIDS, WIPO and WMO) do not have an earnings limit; UNESCO does not apply it to retirees hired as consultants. They make no distinction between United Nations and non-United Nations retirees.

UNCTAD, UNEP, UN Habitat, UNODC, OCHA, OHCHR, UNHCR, UNRWA and the five Regional Economic Commissions

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Report of the Secretary-General A/53/526, para. 4, endorsed by General Assembly resolution 53/221. <sup>28</sup> ST/AI/2003/8 and Amend.1. According to ST/SGB/2002/11, the United Nations Secretariat also includes

 $<sup>^{29}</sup>$  Set at US\$12,000 by A/RES/37/237 (VIII, para. 3) of 21 December 1982. Increased to US\$22,000 by General Assembly decision 51/408 of 4 November 1996.

- 57. Several officials consider that the earnings limit of US\$22,000 is too low, since it is insufficient to hire a seasoned professional for more than two months on a full-time basis. They argue that it was set a considerable time ago and should be revised.<sup>30</sup> Two organizations/entities (UNFPA and UN/DPKO/DFS) of the 15 abided by this limit pledged in their comments to the draft report to a readjustment of the amount. The Inspectors consider that the current limit should be maintained since it is aimed at preventing potential abuses and enhancing workforce/succession planning. The specific needs of organizations/entities could be dealt with through exceptions, as appropriate.
- 58. There are no effective interagency controls in place to verify whether retirees have been previously employed within the same year by any other organization and the earnings limit reached. Some organizations ask the retirees themselves to declare/certify this at the time of employment. Ideally, a common system roster/database could solve this problem, if the cost of such control would not exceed by far any benefit, given the lack of commonality in the Enterprise Resource Planning systems (ERPs) of United Nations organizations. In the absence of any other check, self-certification appears appropriate.

#### Time limit

- 59. Currently in place at 17 organizations (see annex 5), the time limit for hiring retirees is six months per year at most of them, except at WHO, where it is three months, at WMO, where it is nine months, and at IAEA, where an additional six months can be granted. Again, six organizations (ILO, IMO, UNAIDS, UNESCO, UNOPS and WIPO) have no time limit per year.
- 60. Nor is there a limit to the number of years throughout which a retiree can be repeatedly re-employed. After six continuous months in service, retirees may re-enter the pension fund and continue working. In such instances, both the earnings and time limits no longer apply. No relevant data could be obtained from UNJSPF to ascertain to what extent this is practised.

#### Other modalities

- 61. A number of modalities have been set up that may overcome the earnings/time limits. One of them is that United Nations retirees establish their own companies, which allow them to be employed as individual contractors through a "competitive bidding" procurement process. In some instances, these companies may be only a one-/two-man business.
- 62. Another modality is DUNDEX, which stands for Deployable UN-experienced Development EXperts, a company managed by a group of former UNDP senior officials to provide short- to medium-term capacity support worldwide to United Nations offices facing capacity gaps because of external emergencies (e.g. natural disasters or conflict), prolonged vacancies and/or unexpected staff movements. DUNDEX operates on the basis of an extensive roster that covers hundreds of former United Nations staff including retirees<sup>31</sup> and works with five organizations: UNDP, UNICEF, UNFPA, UN Women and WHO. According to information provided, UNICEF awarded contracts to the company for more than US\$800,000 in one year.<sup>32</sup>

<sup>32</sup> UNICEF 2012 supply annual report: supply chains for children. Available from: www.undp.org/content/dam/rwanda/docs/operations/Procurement/RW\_operations\_procurement\_contracts\_award. pdf.

 $<sup>^{30}</sup>$  US\$22,000 of 2013 are worth US\$16,000 of 1996, http://sttats.areppim.com/calc/calc\_usdlrxdeflator.php.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> http://dk.linkedin.com/pub/j%C3%B8rgen-lissner/38/661/276?trk=pub-pbmap.

- 63. Other organizations also apparently use private companies or organizations and entities to hire "non-staff", who may include retirees, as a procurement action. FAO has set conditions for concluding personal service agreements with "lending employers", which require that no other suitable person be available to carry out the task required or that direct contractual arrangements are not feasible; that the lending employer be of satisfactory legal and financial standing, have a relevant and appropriate previous record of activities; and in number of employees should not be a one- or two- person company; all of the above being subject to the approval of the Assistant Director-General for Management for registration and to an earnings limit of US\$650 per day or US\$100,000 overall, and, above this limit, should be reported to the Director-General. Although the concept of "lending employers" may serve to bring staff "through the back door" without any competitive assessment of competences and potentially to the disadvantage of the core workforce, the Inspectors recognize that it has some merits in attempting to introduce certain relevant controls.
- 64. Another modality could be the so called "one-dollar-a-year contracts", whereby no salary is paid, but daily subsistence allowance (DSA) is paid instead, a practice for which the United Nations General Assembly has recently called to be disclosed and regulated. The Inspectors were unable to determine the extent of this practice among United Nations retirees given the lack of relevant information. Officials interviewed denied its existence. They admitted however that DSA is paid to non-locally hired retirees in addition to salaries/fees and that DSA does not count towards the US\$22,000 earnings limit, although the sum involved could at times be significant. In these instances FAO has decided to pay a living allowance instead of DSA. The living allowance ranges between US\$2,500 for its Rome headquarters and an amount representing 30 per cent of the DSA accommodation portion plus 10 per cent of the remaining portion of the DSA rate (first 60 days). This is a good practice that could be replicated by other organizations.
- 65. Retirees rehired via these modalities would generally not appear in data provided. To avoid the proliferation of such modalities, clear criteria should be set at all organizations along the lines of FAO conditions for "lending employers" and "living allowance" mentioned above.

#### Other conditions

66. Box 2 below sets out other conditions for hiring retirees, which may exist at some, but not all organizations (see Annex 5). No specific conditions or exceptions have been set for the employment of retirees in peace and humanitarian operations

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> A/RES/67/255, OP V.63.

## **Box 2**Other conditions for rehiring retirees at United Nations organizations

- ✓ Not to perform the functions of the post from which they retired;
- ✓ Not to be reemployed at a higher level than at the time of separation;
- ✓ Not to be remunerated at a higher level than that at which regular staff are remunerated for the same function;
- ✓ Not acting in an executive capacity that commits the Organization;
- ✓ Not adversely affecting the career development or redeployment of other staff members;
- ✓ Operational requirements cannot be met by staff to perform the required function;
- ✓ It is a cost-effective and operationally sound solution to meet the needs of the service;
- ✓ Subject to a competitive process;
- ✓ Due regard is given to the requirement of geographical distribution;
- ✓ Due regard is given to the requirement of gender balance; and
- ✓ A break in service after retirement is required before re-employment for a period, which is often three months, but may vary between one month and one year.
- 67. Of these conditions, the first, which exists only at one third of the respondent organizations, is important to avoid the perception that needs are "farmed out" for retirees to come back to their jobs and to prevent retirees being rehired as consultants when posts are abolished, to the disadvantage of the core workforce, staff career development and knowledge transfer. The competitive bidding requirement is also important to enhance the fairness and transparency of the process and to avoid the perception of favouritism existing at some organizations where positions are not openly advertised, to give equal chances to all potential candidates and obtain best value for money.
- 68. There is no requirement concerning the age limit for hiring retirees; only FAO and ILO have set this at 70 and 65, respectively, although waivers are occasionally granted. Generally, organizations require a medical check-up for retirees hired as consultants, which does not necessarily assess on a case-by-case basis the health conditions of the person together with the working and health/medical conditions in the country of assignment and travel. Therefore, it is strongly recommended that after age 65 full medical clearance for each assignment be obtained to confirm fitness for work and travel, particularly for hardship duty stations, since this may entail risks for the person's health and important liabilities for the organizations. No assignment should commence without clearance by the United Nations Medical Services.
- 69. Officials interviewed were not generally in favour of tightening existing conditions. However, the Inspectors concur with the increase in the break in service of six months at UNIDO and one year at the World Bank introduced recently to enforce workforce planning during this "cooling" period. Setting a limit to the number of years over which a retiree can be employed may also "force" managers to carry out effective workforce planning and establish mechanisms for knowledge transfer and mentoring.
- 70. Finally, these conditions are not applied to the letter at all organizations; some are more flexible than others and exceptions are granted, as pointed out by staff representatives and officials questioned. The Inspectors consider this to be in line with good management practices and executive heads should set the appropriate tone at the top by sending the right message with regard to limiting the employment of retirees to the strictly necessary, in exceptional cases and within existing conditions.

- 71. To summarize, the regulatory framework for the reemployment of retirees is quite strong at the United Nations and most funds and programmes that apply the same provisions. There are, however, loopholes in procedures that should be closed, such as the employment of retirees through unsuitable companies without clear criteria or proper screening based on FAO practices (see para. 63). Other conditions to be introduced are: no employment to perform the functions of the post from which they retired, a longer break in service, a limit to the number of years over which retirees can be reemployed and a full medical check and a statement of fitness for work and travel, particularly for hardship duty stations, over age 70.
- 72. The regulatory framework was found to be in need of improvement at several specialized agencies, such as FAO, ILO, ITC, IMO, UNIDO, UNWTO, WIPO, WMO and UN Women, either because no specific or very limited conditions have been set up or because they are not consistently applied. On the basis of good practices and conditions existing at other organizations, the regulatory framework should be better designed and controlled, notably at those organizations mentioned in subchapter B below, which make frequent use of retirees.
- 73. Moreover, notwithstanding the specific needs of some very specialized agencies, such as IAEA, where expertise is not readily available or scarce and highly prized in the market, it is important that, for the sake of coherence and to avoid unfair competition across the system, all organizations have/apply similar conditions at least in terms of earnings, time limit and break in service, except when it is justified by specific needs of the organization. Consistent application of medical clearance across the United Nations system is also recommended, taking into account the risks for, and potential liabilities to, the organizations.

#### B. Use of retirees

- 74. Based on figures provided for 2006-2012, at least 5,388 retirees were rehired in 20 organizations,<sup>34</sup> representing 71 per cent of the average number of retirees for all organizations, which is quite significant. Compared with the average workforce of the organizations, the proportion is slightly above 1 per cent (see annex 4).
- 75. United Nations organizations use retirees to varying extents. A few, such as IMO, UNOPS and UNRWA, make little use of them. IFAD does not employ retirees as a matter of policy, to rejuvenate its staff, whereas at other organizations it is a more regular practice. The use of retirees varies not only in numbers, but also by category, function, contractual arrangement and gender, as described below.

#### Number

- 76. The following organizations rank among the highest users in absolute numbers: FAO, IAEA, the United Nations, UNESCO and UNICEF. They hired on average between 66 and as many as 473 retirees at the United Nations Secretariat per year (see annex 4). No specific increasing or decreasing trend in the number of retirees rehired by an organization was observed.
- 77. The number/average alone may not indicate as to whether or not it is in proportion to the number/average of retirees and workforce. In this regard, FAO, IAEA, the United Nations, UNESCO and UNICEF are definitively among the major users, both in absolute numbers and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> ILO, UNFPA, UN-Habitat, UNIDO and UPU: no data available. UNAIDS, UNDP, UNHCR, UNICEF and WHO reported only retirees recruited in posts and not as consultants or under other contractual arrangements. Period may vary by organization. The actual number of retirees may be much higher.

in proportion to average number of retirees and workforce. Three other organizations (ICAO, UNAIDS and UN Women) also rank above average in the proportion of retirees to the average number of retirees and to the average workforce (see annex 4).

#### Categories, functions and contractual arrangements

78. Nineteen organizations provided data by category,<sup>35</sup> 15 by function,<sup>36</sup> 18 by contractual arrangements,<sup>37</sup> 11 by number of days worked<sup>38</sup> and 18 by location.<sup>39</sup> This data was complemented with further information gathered. The following is noted:

- Above one-third of the organizations reporting by contractual arrangements employed retirees as consultants/individual contractors only (FAO, UNOPS, WFP), or in a high proportion (IAEA, ICAO, ITU, UN Women, WMO). Six organizations (UNAIDS, UNDP, UNHCR, UNICEF, UNWTO and WHO) did not include retirees rehired as consultants in data provided. The United Nations, IMO and ITC notably employed more retirees in posts than under other contractual arrangements.
- A high proportion of retirees rehired were in D category and above at four organizations (UNDP, UNHCR, UNICEF and WIPO); also, in a lower proportion, but which was still significant considering the limited number of such positions, at two others (IMO and UNAIDS).
- At half of the organizations providing data by category and function a sizeable proportion of retirees rehired were in general services (GS) and in management and administrative functions (notably at ICAO, IMO, ITC, the United Nations, UNAIDS, UNHCR and UNWTO).
- At the United Nations Secretariat a very high proportion of retirees rehired were for language-related services and employed against funds for general temporary assistance for meetings (44 per cent in 2010-2011). This was explained by an increasing demand in conference services and the scarcity of highly qualified, experienced professionals with knowledge of the organization and of the technical language required, who could be employed at short notice, with a high level of productivity. Other organizations also employed retirees for language services but in much lower proportions.
- At the United Nations, the average number of days actually worked by retirees rehired during the past four biennia exceeded the number of working days authorized within a period of six months (120 days). This may also be the case at other organizations where data was not provided.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> FAO, ILO, UNFPA, UN-Habitat, UNIDO and UPU: no data available. At the United Nations no distinction made between D and P categories. Period may vary.

FAO, IAEA, ILO, UNDP, UNESCO, UNFPA, UN-Habitat, UNIDO, UPU and WFP: no data available. Period may vary.
 ILO, UNFPA, UN-Habitat, UNESCO, UNICEF, UNIDO and UPU: no data available. Period may vary.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> AIEA, ILO, UNAIDS, UNDP, UNFPA, UN-Habitat, UNIDO, UNOPS, UPU, UNRWA, WFP, WHO, WIPO and WMO: no data available. Period may vary.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> IAEA, ILO, United Nations, UNFPA, UN-Habitat, UNIDO and UPU: no data available. Period may vary.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> A/67/329/Add.1, table 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> A/67/319/Add.1 and A/65/350/Add.1, table 6.

About the same proportion of retirees were rehired at headquarters and in the field.
 Agencies with significant field representation tend to employ a much higher proportion in the field (UNDP, UNICEF, UNOPS, WFP and WHO).

#### Gender and geographical distribution

- 79. Data on the geographical distribution of retirees rehired was not available, but officials interviewed were generally of the opinion that there was no reason to think that it would be different from the pattern for existing staff.
- 80. As for gender, in two-third of 17 organizations providing relevant data,<sup>42</sup> there was an imbalance in favour of men (notably at FAO, IAEA, ITU, UNDP, UNICEF, WFP and WIPO). Given the proportion of women at these organizations, the actual imbalance is even higher.
- 81. Only four organizations (the United Nations, UNDP, UNESCO and UN Women) indicated that geographical distribution/gender was taken into account in the employment of retirees.

#### Age

- 82. Based on data provided by 19 organizations, <sup>43</sup> the bulk of retirees employed are aged between 60 and 65; except at ITC and UNRWA, which hired the same proportion between 65 and 70, and FAO, which hired more within the latter range. Accordingly, the increase in MAS to 65 for new staff, and potentially as an option for current staff if approved, may have an impact on the number and age structure of retirees rehired.
- 83. It should be noted that six organizations (FAO, IAEA, ITC, the United Nations, UNAIDS and UNESCO) hired retirees above the age of 70 and four organizations (FAO, IAEA, UNESCO and the United Nations) above 75. The United Nations employed retirees even over the age of 80, mostly in language services. The employment of retirees above the age of 65 should be reduced to a minimum and be subject to the conditions mentioned in paragraph 68 above.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> ILO, IMO, UNESCO, UNFPA, UN-Habitat, UNIDO, UPU and WMO: no data available. Period may vary.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> ILO, UNFPA, UN-Habitat, UNICEF, UNIDO and UPU: no data available. Period may vary.

#### V. REASONS AND IMPACT

84. This chapter summarizes and expands on the reasons for, and impact of, retaining staff beyond MAS and hiring retirees at United Nations organizations.

#### A. Reasons

85. The reasons for hiring retirees across the system were rated by organizations<sup>44</sup> as follows:

• Experience: rated by 100% of organizations

• Knowledge of the organization: 95%

• Specialized skills: 95%

• Availability at short notice: 91%

Easier to recruit: 77%More cost-effective: 68%

- 86. Experience,<sup>45</sup> specialized skills and knowledge of the organization ranked as the main reasons. In general, agencies highly operational in the field rated the need for experience and knowledge of organizations higher than or equally with specialized skills. At IAEA, ICAO and WMO the main argument was the need for highly specialized technical skills. Availability at short notice may rank high for those organizations that do not have rosters/pools system in place; IMO and WMO rated it the highest. However, this need may also exist at organizations with rosters/pools systems in place for long-term employment rather than short-term assignments.
- 87. Officials interviewed reported the need to retain staff and bring retirees back to fill gaps in recruitment, particularly in the case of new heads of field offices, while waiting for the agreement of the host Government, which at times may take several months. In other instances, newly appointed executive heads had taken the decision to retain key high-level officials during a "transition" period. These latter cases are occasional and may be justifiable. In other circumstances, the need to fill gaps may be simply be the result of inadequate workforce/succession planning.
- 88. Similarly, the retention of staff and rehiring of retirees in GS and administrative functions was justified by their knowledge of information management systems, support during peak periods and conferences, and temporary replacements for maternity leave. It may be also the result of untimely planning and poor knowledge transfer, except when due to unplanned absences and unforeseen circumstances.

#### **Knowledge-sharing**

- 89. With regard to knowledge-sharing, in the course of this JIU review, organizations were asked about any initiative in place to tap the experience and expertise of staff due to retire and retirees. Very few were identified, as shown in box 3 below.
- 90. Retirees take with them valuable knowledge that is not shared and is lost if other staff cannot benefit from it. The lack of established knowledge-sharing and mentoring programmes at United Nations organizations perpetuates the need to employ retirees.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> UN-Habitat and UPU are excluded.

<sup>45</sup> Except ITC.

91. A major constraint on knowledge transfer that was pointed out in interviews was the impossibility of pre-empting the results of any recruitment process subject to competition. This was combined with the lack of provisions/funding for double post incumbency, which limits opportunities for outgoing staff to train incoming staff. However, it does not prevent promoting work teams that include both younger and older workers close to retirement and mentoring younger employees. <sup>46</sup> Effective flexi-retirement policies may also help.

## Box 3 Good practices in United Nations organizations to tap the experience of retirees

**UN/DFS**: Retirees are used as mentors by the Policy Evaluation and Training Unit for its Senior Mission Administration and Resource Training programme (SMART), whereby a pool of Chief Administrative Officers and Senior Administrative Officers are identified, trained and prepared to move to a field mission.

**WFP**: An Alumni programme (web-based network) was set up in early 2013 to capture the knowledge of former staff, and some retirees mentor middle managers. With time and a strategy, this initiative can be better structured and become effective as a knowledge transfer tool.

**FAO**: The 2013 revised instructions for the employment of retirees require that the terms of reference for retirees hired include a knowledge transfer component.

**PAHO**: As part of the separation process for key managerial positions, it is required to prepare a report to pass on critical information.

**IFAD**: From 2013, for posts identified as critical for operational business continuity, a period of overlapping (double incumbency) of four weeks is planned between outgoing staff and incoming appointed candidates, which, for staff critical to the delivery of major corporate objectives, would be up to six weeks; a list will be provided each year of those in critical positions who are due to retire.

**Other:** Retirees are members of recruitment and assessment panels. UNFPA intends to use retirees as rapporteurs for rebuttals cases.

92. It is important that United Nations organizations set up procedures to capitalize on the experience of staff due to retire, and of retirees when rehired, along the lines of the examples cited above, and establish solid knowledge transfer systems, particularly while staff are still in employment, through standard operating procedures, including mentoring programmes, crosstraining and other knowledge capturing and recording methodologies. Resources should be allocated for this purpose, targeting management and administration functions, which were found to be more likely to utilize retirees and retain staff beyond MAS. With respect to forecast retirements, it was previously recommended (see JIU/REP/2007/4) that executive management should take adequate measures to ensure proper knowledge transfer and safeguard institutional memory.<sup>47</sup> This was also referred to in JIU/REP/2007/6.<sup>48</sup> The following recommendation is intended to enhance dissemination of knowledge and best practices, reiterating the recommendations in previous JIU reports.

<sup>47</sup> Recommendation 5 in the present report.

<sup>48</sup> See para. 3 above.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> ICSC/77/R.4, paras. 10 and 17.

22

#### **Recommendation 2**

Executive heads should set up effective mechanisms to capitalize on the knowledge and experience of staff due to retire and of retirees when rehired through coaching and mentoring programmes, in line with good practices identified.

- 93. Some staff representatives interviewed criticized the reasons given at their organizations as an excuse to "farm[] out work for retirees in an unfair manner". While this may be true in some cases, the numbers reported at some organizations are so low that it barely qualifies as a practice and does not show a specific pattern.
- 94. The reasons may be compelling, particularly when specialized skills or specific professional knowledge are required which are not available in the organization. In this regard, the Inspectors were unable to verify complaints about retirees rehired as consultants to perform core functions while posts are cut or unfilled to the disadvantage of the regular workforce. No argument is valid in these latter instances, or when it is to fill gaps/temporary positions due to inadequate workforce/succession planning, or to carry out routine administrative tasks, for which replacements could be found in-house and trained in advance.

#### **B.** Impact

95. Hiring retirees may also have an adverse impact. The negative impact of hiring retirees was rated by organizations as follows:

• Rejuvenation of workforce: 100% of organizations

• Career development: 89%

Leadership: 68%Accountability: 68%Mobility: 63%

• Gender: 63%

• Geographical distribution: 58%

- 96. Out of 19 respondent organizations,<sup>49</sup> 18 rated workforce rejuvenation as the highest adverse impact and 16 also rated staff career development among the two highest. Mobility, leadership and accountability followed in importance for some organizations.
- 97. Concerning workforce rejuvenation and staff career development, IFAD, as a policy, does not retain any staff or hire retirees, in order to be able to renew and promote talent. Employing retirees as consultants also has fewer adverse effects than when they are recruited in posts; therefore the latter practice should be discontinued for professional staff. This is valid as long as consultants are not used to perform core functions as replacements to freeze/cut professional posts to the disadvantage of the regular workforce, as pointed out by staff representatives and recognized by managers at some organizations.
- 98. Retaining and employing retirees in D category and above managerial positions may have adverse effects on career development, leadership and accountability. The General Assembly has called for this practice to be limited.<sup>50</sup> Assuming that gaps in filling positions are not due to poor planning, the fact that senior officials are retained/rehired in a high proportion may give the impression that there is a "club of selected officials", as pointed out

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> ILO, UNDP, UN-Habitat, UPU and WMO are excluded.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> A/RES/57/305 and A/RES/59/266.

by various staff representatives. Some interviewees also rightly said that managers should be accountable for what they do - or do not do - to plan in advance, hire replacements on time for staff due to retire and ensure that the knowledge of the latter is shared.

- 99. The fact that the performance of retirees recruited as staff in posts for less than six months and as consultants is not thoroughly evaluated is an accountability issue. The JIU "Review of Individual Consultancies in the United Nations system" (JIU/REP/2012/5) deplores the fact that "no sanction mechanism is used in cases of poor performance; partially or fully retaining payment is extremely rare. It also seems that managers are reluctant to acknowledge poor or unsatisfactory services". The report recommends strengthening oversight of the use of consultants through effective performance evaluation. <sup>51</sup>
- 100. Finally, non-compliance with gender and geographical distribution requirements may have an impact on the diversity of organizations when retirees are rehired, subject to the number of cases and length of employment at each organization.
- 101. In general, any negative impact would be limited at organizations where the number of retained staff and retirees rehired is quite low. The highest negative impact would be in cases where they are retained or employed in posts for lengthy and recurrent periods of time. This impact could be greater in small organizations with little field presence or rotation and a static workforce where the age structure of staff is high and promotion opportunities are very limited. It should be noted that, in 2010, only 26 per cent of the workforce of United Nations organizations in the Professional category were young (<40 years) and 38 per cent were older employees (> 50 years).<sup>52</sup> If MAS is increased for current staff, the proportion of older staff will increase. Organizations need to diversify and renovate skills and the intake of younger personnel serves this purpose.
- 102. ICSC has examined the potential impact of increasing MAS in geographical distribution, gender balance, workforce rejuvenation and career development and concluded that it would be more limited in the first two areas than in the latter two. As mentioned above, the General Assembly recently requested ICSC to further study this issue and report to it. The results of the ICSC analysis may apply to the employment of retirees to the extent to which it concerns the retention/employment of an older workforce.
- 103. The following recommendations may contribute to enhancing controls and compliance with relevant policies and procedures for the retention of staff beyond MAS and employment of retirees at United Nations organizations, thereby leading to a more rational and coherent use and one that will mitigate adverse effects.

#### Recommendation 3

Executive heads should (a) set up a coherent regulatory framework for the approval of exceptions, to retain staff beyond the mandatory age of separation and for the employment of retirees, regardless of the type of contract and funding, based on good practices identified in the United Nations and other system organizations, taking into account the specific needs of certain highly specialized technical agencies; and (b) ensure strict compliance with this framework.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Paras. 155, 173, recommendation 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> ICSC/75/R.4, para. 21.

24

#### **Recommendation 4**

Executive heads of organizations, particularly those with a large number/proportion of staff retained beyond MAS and retirees rehired, should: (a) take immediate action to limit such cases to exceptions which are fully justified and regularly monitored and reported to legislative bodies; and (b) ensure that their employment in senior executive and general service positions is restricted to instances where needs cannot be met by current staff, and that they are rehired as consultants, when applicable, with due regard to the specific needs of organizations.

#### C. Workforce/succession planning and forecasted retirements

- 104. ICSC in a recent study on the subject refers to workforce planning as:
  - "... understanding how the workforce is changing in terms of demographics, skills, interest and potential for performance; how changes will affect job requirements and how well the current workforce is prepared for future job requirements and developing appropriate recruitment, retention and training policies... Workforce planning, including succession planning, will help organizations to deal with the potential loss of continuity, intellectual capital and leadership at the managerial level that will result from retirements. It will also manage the effects of inter-agency mobility or voluntary separation from the organization; enable individual career planning and growth; ensure that all critical positions are filled on time with the best people; retain and motivate talented individuals; enhance knowledge-sharing; and contribute to the implementation of the organizations' strategic plans.<sup>53</sup>
- 105. Timely forecasting of retirements due serves to evaluate and re-profile positions in accordance with needs, reduce staff costs, enhance the organizational structure, correct existing imbalances in gender and geographical distribution, open opportunities for workforce rejuvenation and staff career development and reduce the need for retaining staff beyond MAS and employing retirees.
- 106. The importance of workforce/succession planning to forecast retirements has been underlined in previous JIU and CEB reports.<sup>54</sup> In particular, JIU/REP/2007/4 recommended that executive management submit regular reports showing retirement forecasts, establish performance indicators to forecast replacement needs and monitor their implementation.<sup>55</sup> This was reiterated in JIU/NOTE/2012/1<sup>56</sup> and JIU/NOTE/2012/2.<sup>57</sup> Benchmark 8 of this latter note sets:
  - "(a) Workforce planning is undertaken beforehand to determine which posts will be opened, when and how, and to define the ratio of external recruitment to internal placement or promotion;
  - (b) All vacant posts are advertised, including senior-level posts. The recruitment process is initiated at least six months in advance in the case of known vacancies such as retirement, newly created posts or posts subject to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> ICSC/75/R.4, paras. 31 and 34.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> JIU/REP/2007/4; CEB/2009/HLCM/HR/11; JIU/NOTE/2012/1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Recommendation 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Benchmark 5, paras. 43-64.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Benchmark 8, paras. 4-10.

25

rotation, but in any case, no later than the month in which the post becomes vacant."

- 107. In its recent analysis ICSC highlights the lack of progress made in developing relevant policies.<sup>58</sup> In the course of this review, the Inspectors confirmed that, in general, organizations have no comprehensive workforce/succession planning policies or practices. Some do however have Human Resources plans and initiatives to forecast retirements and to deal with the recruitment, placement and development of staff, particularly for key senior level/managerial and other specific positions, such as rosters, talent pools and training programmes, etc.; many of which are related to their mobility/rotation policies.
- 108. Although the majority of organizations responded that workforce/succession planning had been very effective or effective in ensuring timely filling of foreseen vacancies due to retirement (79 per cent), to prevent the need to extend staff beyond MAS (78 per cent) and to reduce the rehiring of retirees (69 per cent), it has only a moderate effect at some. The proportion of staff retained in vacant posts exceeded a quarter of such posts at 61 per cent of the organizations that provided relevant data (ICAO, IMO, UNAIDS, UNDP, UNHCR, UNFPA, UNIDO, UNOPS, UNRWA, UNWTO and WMO). At two organizations (ICAO and UNESCO) retirees were hired for two-thirds of the vacant posts.
- 109. In many instances, the advertising of posts due to become vacant happens too late, considering the length of the recruitment process at most United Nations organizations. For instance, in the United Nations Secretariat, there is a requirement to advertise positions six months in advance. Compliance is monitored through scorecards within the Human Resources Action Plan as part of the Secretary-General's Compact to enhance accountability of senior managers. However, the average recruitment time was 171 days by mid-2012, on-boarding excluded.<sup>59</sup> In this regard, the Inspectors were informed that this 6-month period was to be extended to 12 months, which is not the most effective way to shorten the recruitment process.
- 110. Several organizations have also set periods for advertising posts in advance, but it is unclear how compliance is monitored and whether it is adequate to fill vacancies on time. Other organizations have not even set deadlines for advertising posts in advance, or else the decision to post is taken only after the position become vacant. These are clear examples of poor workforce/succession planning. Solutions are often not complicated: for example, IAEA indicated that its forthcoming vacancies arising from retirement were monitored but that it would focus on early advertisement through an online alert system in its ERP.
- 111. Certain officials said that no matter how timely and effective the forecasting and recruitment and placement process was, there would be always grounds to justify the need to retain staff and hire retirees to fill gaps, for example, in cases of delay in obtaining the local Government's agreement for field positions.
- 112. The review also noted that from 2013 to 2017 some organizations will face significant departures of staff due to retirement, which may reach one fifth or more of the workforce of 2012 (FAO, ICAO, IMO, UNOPS and WMO). In these instances, the lack of effective workforce/succession planning and strategies will represent missed opportunities to correct structure imbalances and re-profile the workforce. WMO commented that its efforts were concentrated on speeding up recruitment and, once this was achieved, workforce/succession planning would show its advantage.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> ICSC/75/R.4, para. 33.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> A/67/324, table 4, p. 13.

- 113. While they realize that the investment required in systems and tools to conduct proper workforce/succession planning and skills inventories is not always justified in terms of cost-effectiveness at small- and medium-sized organizations, the Inspectors underline the importance of having policies in place to deal more strategically with the opportunities created by the retirement of staff to better shape the workforce in line with organizational needs and they reiterate the recommendations and benchmarks proposed in the above-mentioned JIU report/notes.
- 114. The implementation of the following recommendation is expected to enhance the effectiveness of workforce/succession planning at organizations by reducing the need to retain staff beyond MAS and employ retirees.

#### **Recommendation 5**

Executive heads of organizations which have not yet done so should develop effective workforce/succession planning with respect to posts occupied by staff due for retirement, take action to advertise all relevant vacancies at least six months in advance and ensure timely recruitment.

### VI. TOWARDS A UNITED NATIONS VOLUNTEER PROGRAMME FOR RETIREES

- 115. The idea of a creating a structured system-wide retirees volunteer programme to tap as necessary the valuable experience of retirees from all United Nations organizations who are willing to contribute and serve under certain conditions either free of charge or for a living allowance was explored in interviews with human resources officials, staff and FAFICS representatives.
- 116. Some staff representatives were concerned at the potential risk of employing retirees as "cheaper labour" which may entail some "competence" for the core workforce in times of budget cuts, given the increasing dependence on non-staff to perform critical functions of the organizations. Other than this opinion, the feedback obtained was positive overall, with references to specific examples of retirees who have served pro bono in response to specific needs and emergencies or organized themselves at no cost to make their services available, such as the self-maintained web-based "1818 Society" of the World Bank and its sector-specific groups. These are good initiatives that can be replicated by the existing United Nations retirees associations under FAFICS.
- 117. In December 2012, UNESCO introduced its own volunteer programme for those between 20 and 62 years, including former staff members and retirees, working pro bono to carry out work of an intellectual nature, studies, reports, translation, IT development and training. Although it is somewhat premature to assess the success of this volunteer programme and the participation of retirees in it, considering the age limit of 62, the Inspectors appreciate it as a good initiative. At the same time, they consider that a system-wide programme for emergency and other specific needs would better serve the purpose of enhancing coherence and harmonization of practices among United Nations organizations in the employment of retirees.
- 118. The Inspectors consider that the United Nations Volunteer programme (UNV) could be an ideal structure for promoting and administering the engagement of volunteer retirees, given its experience and success in mobilizing some 7,000 volunteers per year, among whom about 5,000 are international, serving for 35 United Nations entities agencies in 127 countries, plus about 11,000 online volunteers. UNVs work in field assignments on regular development and post-crisis peacekeeping and humanitarian assistance. While enjoying the same allowances regime entitlements of United Nations staff, they receive instead a living allowance ranging between US\$2,000 and US\$2,500 a month, which is lower than a salary and does not count as such, and can serve from 3 to 24 months. In this regard, DUNDEX can be seen as a "more interesting option" for retirees.
- 119. UNV officials said that they have had no difficulties in attracting candidates since their roster is open to the public and candidates enrol themselves. Nonetheless, they are short of volunteers in some areas and are interested in attracting retirees who have experience and knowledge of the system. However, they have employed retirees in very limited numbers. Part of the problem, they believe, is related to outreach and knowledge of the programme, but it could be also a question of mandate, which is confined to field missions.
- 120. To target retirees when their special technical expertise is needed for coaching/mentoring and humanitarian emergencies, United Nations organizations and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> UNV Annual Report 2012: Creating Lasting Impact.

UNJSPF should advertise post-retirement opportunities on their websites. Organizations could refer to them in their separation packages and staff about to retire could be asked whether they would like to join the UNV roster and receive advice on how to proceed accordingly. However this would require concerted action, which could be set out in memorandums of understanding between UNV and individual organizations. Another possibility would be to reach out directly to retirees through FAFICS, which has 56 associations of retirees under its umbrella worldwide and some 20,000 members.

**Annex I: Organizations participating** 

	Int	erviews	Que	stionnaire	Comments on draft report						
Organization or entity	HR & other officials	Staff representatives	Sent	Responded	Sent	Responded					
	United Na	tions common system									
СЕВ	X				X	_					
FAFICS	X				X	X					
FAO	X	X	X	X	X	X					
IAEA	X	X	X	X	X	X					
ICAO			X	X	X	X					
ICSC	X				X	X					
IFAD	X				X						
ILO	X	X	X	X	X	X					
IMO			X	X	X	X					
ITC			X	X	X	X					
ITU	X	X	X	X	X	X					
OHCHR	Λ	A	X	X*	X	X					
UN	X	X	X	X	X	X					
UN/DFS	X	Λ	Λ	Λ	X	X					
UN/DM	X				X	X					
UN/OCHA	X				Λ	Λ					
	X										
UN/OIOS	Λ		v	V	v	V					
UNAIDS			X	X	X	X					
UNCTAD	37	77	X	X*	X	X					
UNDP	X	X	X	X	X	X					
UNEP			X	**	X						
UNESCAP	X	X			X	X					
UNESCO	X	X	X	X	X	X					
UNFPA	X	X	X	X	X	X					
UN-HABITAT			X		X						
UNHCR	X	X	X	X	X	X					
UNICEF	X	X	X	X	X	X					
UNIDO	X	X	X	X	X	X					
UNJSPF	X				X	X					
UNODC/UNOV	X	X	X	X*	X	X					
UNOG	X										
UNOG/Language Service	X										
UNOPS		X	X	X	X	X					
UNRWA			X	X	X	X					
UNV	X				X						
UN Women	X	X	X	X	X						
UNWTO			X	X	X	X					
UPU			X		X						
WFP	X	X	X	X	X	X					
WHO	X	X	X	X	X	X					
WHO/PAHO	X				X						
WIPO	X	X	X	X	X						
WMO	X	X	X	X	X	X					
		Other									
DUNDEX	X				X	X					
European Union	X				X						
World Bank TOTAL	X <b>34</b>	19	29	26	X 42	31					
IUIAL	34	17	49	20	44	31					

<sup>\*</sup> Respondents follow United Nations Regulations and Rules. Relevant data included in United Nations statistics.
\*\* UNEP did not respond but relevant data is included in United Nations statistics.

**Annex II: Early Retirees and Early retirees rehired (2006-2012)** 

Organization	Period (A)	Total number of retirees (B)	Awerage retirees (C=B/A)	Number of Early Retirees (D)	Average Early Retirees (E=D/A)	Number of Early Retirees Women (F)	Number of Early Retirees Rehired (G)	Average Early Retirees Rehired (H=G/A)	Number of Early Retirees Women Rehired (I)	Percentage of Average Early Retirees to Average Retirees (J=E/C)	Percentage of Average Early Retirees Rehired to Average Early Retirees (K=H/E)	Percentage of Early Retirees Women to Early Retirees (L=F/D)	Percentage of Early Retirees Women Rehired to Early Retirees Rehired (M=I/G)
FAO	2007-2012	675	135	226	38	142	41	7	17	29%	18%	63%	41%
IAEA	2006-2012	563	80	106	15	50	97	14	16	19%	93%	47%	16%
ICAO	2006-2012	190	27	44	6	29	6	0.9	4	22%	15%	66%	67%
ILO	2006-2010	429	86	121	24	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	28%	n/a	n/a	n/a
IMO	2006-2012	90	13	15	2	n/a	1	1	n/a	15%	7%	n/a	n/a
ITC	2006-2012	38	5	5	0.7	3	0	0	0	14%	0%	60%	0%
ITU	2006-2012	204	29	68	10	41	6	0.9	3	34%	9%	60%	50%
UNAIDS	2008-2012	61	12	23	5	n/a	0	0	n/a	42%	0	n/a	n/a
UNDP	2008-2012	489	98	83	17	42	0	0	0	17%	n/a	51%	0
UNESCO	2008-2012	491	98	127	25	25	44	9	19	26%	36%	20%	43%
UNFPA	2006-2012	163	23	27	4	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	17%	n/a	n/a	n/a
UNHCR	2006-2012	487	70	315	45	n/a	0	0	n/a	64%	0%	n/a	n/a
UNICEF	2006-2012	725	104	180	26	88	32	5	17	25%	19%	49%	53%
UNOPS	2010-2012	39	6	5	2	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	22%	n/a	n/a	n/a
UNWOMEN	2011-2012	1	0.5	1	0.5	1	0	0	0	100%	0%	100%	0
UNTWO	2006-2012	26	4	5	0.7	n/a	0	0	n/a	18%	0%	n/a	n/a
WFP	2006-2012	227	32	136	19	68	84	12	33	59%	63%	50%	39%
WHO	2006-2012	826	118	120	17	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	14%	n/a	n/a	n/a
WIPO	2007-2012	175	29	40	7	n/a	0	0	n/a	24%	0%	n/a	n/a
WMO	2006-2012	83	12	13	2	11	4	1	4	17%	50%	85%	100%
TOTAL	2006-2012	5982	299	1660	83	500	315	20	113	28%	23%	51%	36%

Source: Responses to JIU questionnaires. Averages by organization calculated based on the years provided. Averages for all organizations calculated based on the number of organizations that provided data. L, M and N do not include organizations that have not provided data required to calculate percentages. The United Nations, UNIDO and UNRWA have not provided data on early retirees. IMO rehired retirees only for 2008 and WMO for 2006-2009. FAO data on retirees provided only for 2008-2012 and the percentage of average early retirees to average retirees was adjusted to this later period. Averages and percentages rounded up.

#### Annex III: Conditions for retaining staff beyond MAS

Organization	Conditions other than "when in the interest of the organization" on exceptional basis, per SR&R	Approval authority
FAO	<ul> <li>SR&amp;R 301.9.5. Extensions 1 year at a time</li> <li>Email of 27/3/2013 from Director Office of Strategy, Planning and Resources Management:</li> <li>Staff continued employment is established as essential;</li> <li>Staff has less than the 5 years' services required to qualify for UNJSPF benefit and will not have any other source of pension benefit</li> <li>Maximum of 12 months</li> </ul>	Executive Head. HR director for extensions up to 3 months
ICAO	SR 9.15 For up to a maximum of one year in total	Secretary-General. The endorsement of the President of the Council is required, prior to a decision by the SG for D-1 and of the Council itself for D-2 positions.
ILO	SR&R, article 11.3: Retentions possible until the end of last day of the month in which the official reaches age 65.	Executive Head. Joint Negotiating Committee consulted for staff below P-5 and informed above this level
IMO	<ul> <li>ADMIN/11/55 of 2 August 2011 on extension of appointment beyond retirement age:</li> <li>Extensions for staff who joined prior to 1 January 1990 and are within a year of retirement and wish to work beyond 60 can be granted exceptions up to 62;</li> <li>To take into account competence and skills available within the Organization and any material or adverse effects on outputs due to lack of those skills, period of training for alternative staff, any adverse consequences on the reasonable career prospects of other staff and the budgetary situation.</li> </ul>	Secretary-General
UN	<ul> <li>ST/AI/2003/8<sup>61</sup> paras. 3.1, 3.2, 3.3:</li> <li>Identify regular staff due to retire 12 months in advance</li> <li>Advertise vacancies at least 6 months in advance</li> <li>Reasons must be given as to why he/she cannot be replaced.</li> <li>SOP on Recruitment of candidates to UN operations of April 2008, para. 3.5:</li> <li>DFS/FPD has the authority to extend contracts for a continuous period of up to 1 year</li> <li>Such extensions to be renewed one year at a time, not exceeding 3 years beyond MAS. Specific needs should be recorded.</li> <li>Requests for more than 3 years to be submitted to OHRM with reasons.</li> </ul>	Secretary-General for ASG USG for Management for D2 staff. ASG/HRM for P and GS staff at headquarters, Head of offices for Regional Commissions and offices away from HQ
UNIDO	SR 10.2: Extension not granted normally for more than two years for all staff, except for staff specifically engaged with technical co-operation projects for which the limit is five years.	Executive head
UNFPA	Policies and procedures: Human Resources, Retention in service beyond MAS, 1 January 2007:  • When not possible to identify a qualified candidate to discharge the functions of the post in a timely manner;  • Should not normally exceed 6 months after MAS	Executive head following recommendation of Director HR
UNWTO	SR 28: Extensions by one or two years in exceptional cases.	Secretary-General
WHO	SR 1020.1: No more than a one-year extension granted at a time and in no case beyond 65.	Executive head
WMO	SR 9.5	Secretary-General. Executive council authority required for extensions of the age limit for P category and above staff.
WIPO	SR 9.10 (c): Extensions up to the age of 65	Executive head

<sup>61</sup> According to ST/SGB/2002/11, the United Nations Secretariat also includes UNCTAD, UNEP, UN Habitat, UNODC, OCHA, OHCHR, UNHCR, UNRWA and the five Regional Economic Commissions.

Annex IV: Staff retained beyond MAS and Rehired Retirees (2006-2012)  Remarkees of Remarkees Parameters Parame															
Organization	Period (A)	Total workforce (B)	Average workforce (C=B/A)	Number of retirees (D)	Average retirees (E=D/A)	Period (F)	Number of staff retained beyond MAS (G)	beyond	Percentage of average staff retained beyond MAS to average retirees (I=H/E)	Percentage of average staff retained beyond MAS to average workforce (J=H/C)	Period (K)	Number of rehired retirees (L)	Average rehired retirees (M=L/K)	Percentage of average rehired retirees to average retirees (N=M/E)	Percentage of average rehired retirees to average workforce (O=M/C)
FAO	2006-2012	23856	3408	675	135	2006-2012	17	2	1%	0.1%	2006-2012	540	77	57%	2.26%
IAEA	2006-2012	15457	2208	563	80	2006-2012	99	14	18%	0.6%	2006-2012	582	83	104%	3.76%
ICAO	2006-2012	5096	728	190	27	2006-2012	160	23	85%	3.2%	2006-2012	162	23	85%	3.16%
IMO	2006-2012	2097	300	90	13	2006-2012	21	3	23%	1.0%	2006-2012	7	1	8%	0.33%
ITC	2006-2012	1741	249	38	5	2006-2012	4	0.6	12%	0.2%	2006-2012	10	1	20%	0.40%
ITU	2006-2012	5392	770	204	29	2006-2012	14	2	7%	0.3%	2006-2012	26	4	14%	0.52%
UN	2006-2011	191946	31991	2418	403	2006-2011	628	105	26%	0.3%	2006-2011	2839	473	117%	1.48%
UNAIDS	2008-2012	2591	518	61	12	2008-2012	18	4	33%	0.8%	2008-2012	33	7	58%	1.35%
UNDP	2008-2012	30526	6105	489	98	2008-2012	118	24	24%	0.4%	2008-2012	11	2	2%	0.03%
UNESCO	2008-2012	10158	2032	491	98	2008-2012	117	23	23%	1.1%	2008-2012	331	66	67%	3.25%
UNFPA	2006-2012	10317	1474	163	23	2008-2012	41	8	28%	0.5%	2006-2012	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
UNHCR	2006-2012	38038	5434	487	70	2006-2012	82	12	17%	0.2%	2006-2012	15	2	3%	0.04%
UNICEF	2006-2012	47268	6753	725	104	2006-2012	51	7	7%	0.1%	2006-2012	610	87	84%	1.29%
UNIDO	2012	666	666	n/a	n/a	2012	8	8	n/a	1.2%	2012	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
UNOPS	2006-2012	4477	640	39	6	2006-2012	49	7	117%	1.1%	2010-2012	4	1	11%	0.14%
UNRWA	2006-2012	1250	179	12	2	2006-2012	4	0.6	30%	0.3%	2006-2012	2	0.3	15%	0.17%
UNWOMEN	2011-2012	877	439	1	0.5	2011-2012	2	1	200%	0.2%	2011-2012	41	21	4200%	4.78%
UNWTO	2006-2012	680	97	26	4	2006-2012	7	1	25%	1.0%	2006-2012	4	1	15%	0.60%
WFP	2006-2012	28473	4068	227	32	2006-2012	26	4	13%	0.1%	2006-2012	90	13	41%	0.32%
WHO	2006-2012	38531	5504	826	118	2006-2012	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	2006-2012	57	8	7%	0.15%
WIPO	2007-2012	5768	961	175	29	2006-2012	39	6	21%	0.6%	2007-2012	12	2	7%	0.21%
WMO	2006-2012	1964	281	83	12	2006-2012	32	5	65%	1.8%	2006-2012	12	2	17%	0.71%
Total		467169	21235	7983	380		1537	73	20%	0.36%		5388	269	71%	1.17%

Source: Responses to JIU questionnaire. Averages rounded up. Total staff: CEB/2013/HLCM/HR/12, CEB/2012/HLCM/HR/12, CEB/2011/HLCM/HR/12, CEB/2010/HLCM/HR/12, CEB/2009/HLCM/HR/12, CEB/2008/HLCM/HR/12 and CEB/2007/HLCM/HR/12. This table does not include retirees hired as consultants or other contracts at UNAIDS, UNDP, UNHCR, UNICEF, UNWTO and WHO. Consequently, actual numbers and percentages could be much higher. I, J, N and O do not include organizations which have not provided data required to calculate percentages. IAEA: Figures include staff retained to enable them to qualify for a pension entitlement and retirees re-hired on multiple occasions. FAO: number of retirees for 2008-2012, staff retained for 2006-2012 and rehired retirees for 2008-2012. The percentage of average staff retained and rehired retirees for 2006-2012 was calculated based on average retirees for 2008-2012 and retirees for 2006-2011. United Nations Secretariat (includes also UNCTAD, UNEP, UN-Habitat, UNODC, OCHA, OHCHR, UNHCR and the five Regional Economic Commissions as per ST/SGB/2002/11): number of retirees for June 2006-June 2012 and number of staff retained beyond MAS for 2006-2011. The percentage of average staff retained beyond MAS for 2006-2011 was calculated based on average retirees for June 2006-June 2012 and average workforce for 2006-2011. UNIDO: number of staff retained beyond MAS only for 2012. No data on retirees or on rehired retirees provided. UNFPA: number of retirees for 2006-2012 and staff retained beyond MAS for 2008-2012. The percentage of average staff retained beyond MAS for 2008-2012 was calculated based on average retirees for 2010-2012 (145/5=29) and on average workforce for 2008-2012 (27802/5=1560). UNOPS: Number of retirees was provided only for 2010-2012. The percentage of average rehired retirees for 2010-2012 was calculated based on average retirees for 2007-2012 and average workforce for 2007-2012 was calculated based on average retirees for 2007-2012 was calculated based on average retirees for 2007-2012

33

#### **Annex V: Conditions for rehiring retirees**

Affica V. Conditions for Tentring Tetrees																								
CONDITIONS	FAO	IAEA	ICAO	ILO	IMO	ITC	ITU	UN	UNAIDS	UNDP	UNESCO	UNFPA	UNHCR	UNICEF	UNIDO	UNOPS	UNRWA	UNWOMEN	UNWTO	WFP	МНО	WIPO	WMO	Total by condition
Earnings limit of US\$22,000 per year	X	45 000 euros				X	X	X		X	X <sup>62</sup> .	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	\$30,000			17
6 months of work per year	X	$X^{63}$	X			X	X	X		X		X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X <sup>64</sup>	$X^{65}$		X <sup>66</sup>	17
Not to perform the functions of the post from which they retired	X							X	X	X				X					X		X			7
Not reemployed at a higher level than at the time of separation		X	X	X <sup>67</sup>	X		X	X		X	X	X	X	X					X	X	X		X	15
Not remunerated at a higher level than that at which regular staff are remunerated for the same function		X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X							X <sup>68</sup>		X	14
Not acting in an executive capacity that commits the Organization	X		X	X			X			X											X		X	7
Not adversely affecting the career development or redeployment of other staff members		X			X		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X					X			12
Operational requirements cannot be met by current staff		X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	X			X	X			X	X			15
A cost-effective and operationally sound solution to meet the needs of the service		X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X		X				X			X	X			13
Subject to a competitive process								$X^{69}$		X	X			X	X		X				X			7
Due regard is given to the requirement of geographical distribution								X		X	X	X												4
Due regard is given to requirement of gender balance								X		X	X							X					X	5
A break in service is required after retirement before reemployment (figures in months)	6	1	3		3			3	4	3	3	3	3 <sup>70</sup>	3	6	3		3		3	4			16
Total by organization	5	8	6	5	6	2	8	11	6	13	10	8	8	8	4	4	5	4	4	6	11	0	5	

Source: Responses to the JIU questionnaire.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup>UNESCO: The earnings limit does not apply to retired UNESCO/United Nations staff members hired as individual consultants or to other specialist contracts (e.g. authors).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> IAEA: 6-month initial contract; may be extended by further periods each not exceeding six months.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> WFP: retirees engaged in order to tap their experience and their knowledge of operational reality at WFP and most commonly to perform functions that are similar in nature to those ones they performed while on active service. They are however not hired to occupy the post they held prior to retirement.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> WHO: 3 months per calendar year, except for language services staff.

<sup>66</sup> WMO: time limit is nine months per year. Except for time limit and gender (which are regulated by standing instructions for individual contractors applicable to retirees rehired as consultants), the other three conditions are not specifically stipulated in WMO standing instructions but are applied in practice.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> ILO: Although not stated in any policy, it is practised.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> WHO: WHO/UN staff retired staff are rehired at step one of the position they occupied.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> United Nations: When retirees are engaged as consultants/individual contractors at least three candidates should be reviewed and for temporary job openings of more than three months, an announcement has to be issued for the vacancy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> UNHCR: break may exceptionally be reduced to 1 month.

### Annex VI: Overview of actions to be taken by participating organizations on the recommendations of the Joint Inspection Unit JIU/NOTE/2014/1

			U n	nited Nations, its funds and programmes													e s	S p	e c	i a	liz	z e d	l a	g e	n c	i e	s a	nno	i I	A E	E A
		Intended impact	CEB	United Nations*	UNCTAD	ITC	UNDP	UNEP	UNFPA	UN-Habitat	UNHCR	UNICEF	UNODC	UNOPS	UNRWA	UN Women	WFP	FAO	IAEA	ICAO	IL0	IMO	ITU	UNAIDS	UNESCO	UNIDO	UNWTO	UPU	WHO	WIPO	WMO
ort	For action			X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Report	For information																														
Recomm	endation 1	f		X																	X										
Recomm	endation 2	b		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Recomm	endation 3	с		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	Х
Recomm	endation 4	f		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	Х
Recomm	endation 5	f		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

Intended impact: a: enhanced transparency and accountability b: dissemination of good/best practices c: enhanced coordination and cooperation d: strengthened coherence and harmonization e: enhanced control and compliance f: enhanced effectiveness g: significant financial savings h: enhanced efficiency i: other.

<sup>\*</sup> Covers all entities listed in ST/SGB/2002/11 other than UNCTAD, UNODC, UNEP, UN-Habitat, UNHCR, UNRWA.