UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC
AND
SOCIAL COUNCIL

UNITED NATIONS LIBRARY
NATIONS UNIES
BIBLIOTHÈQUE
GENEVA

Distr.
GENERAL

E/5594/Add.1
31 October 1974

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

REPORTS OF THE JOINT INSPECTION UNIT

Report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case

(JIU/REP/73/5)

Addendum

Comments of the Administrator of UNDP

Taking into account the subject-matter of the report by Inspectors E. Ferrer-Vieyra and J. A. Sawe on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case, and the prime responsibility of the United Nations Development Programme in that area, the Secretary-General requested the Administrator of UNDP to assume responsibility for the preparation of the related comments. These, as received, are attached.

74-29176

/...

6 September 1974

REPORTS OF THE JOINT INSPECTION UNIT

REPORT ON THE NEED FOR A REVISED CONCEPT ON UNDP REGIONAL TRAINING PROGRAMME IN THE LEAST DEVELOPED COUNTRIES: THE EAST AFRICAN CASE

(JIU/REP/73/5)

Comments of the Administrator of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)

(Amended text)

1. Inspectors Ferrer-Vieyra and Sawe have prepared a report on a subject which constitutes one of the main activities of the United Nations family of organizations. The report is timely as it is presented when the United Nations organizations are reassessing the impact of their development assistance operations in the light of the International Development Strategy. The report is to be submitted to the ACABQ in the first instance and thereafter to ECOSOC and the Governing Council of the UNDP.

Planning and Administration of the Regional Training Projects (Paras. 31, 32, 33, 34, 39, 40, 76, 77, 78, 140, 144, 145, 158)

2. The Inspectors have been rightly concerned with project priorities, but it is not the case that prior to the establishment of the country programming procedures the initiative for establishing regional projects was the responsibility of the concerned Executing Agency. Before the Community came into being, the East African Common Services Organization submitted requests to UNDP and established its own priorities.

3. One of the fundamental objectives inherent in all the projects under discussion has been the training of nationals for the more responsible posts in the Community's services. Therefore, a strong case existed for making an early start in establishing institutional support for the development of personnel for senior posts in the Community's services. If these personnel are to be available to take control in a foreseeable future, there was much in favour of commencing their training at the earliest possible stage.

4. The comment of lack of cohesiveness in UNDP representation vis-a-vis the EAC is not shared. As indicated in the report, the UNDP has had for the

/...

last two years a Representative in Arusha. Prior to this, a UNDP Programme Officer was assigned to the Headquarters of the EAC. Furthermore, coordination among the regional projects has been, and is, ensured on the UNDP side by periodic meetings of the Resident Representatives based in the three Community countries.

5. UNDP and the EAC are in close contact, as they have been for some time, on the question of a sub-regional IPF for the Community (recommendation 5 on page 38). A decision on this matter would be for the Governing Council to take, and would have to be reviewed along with similar questions affecting other sub-regions of Africa and of all other regions of the world.

6. The regional programme for Africa for the period 1974-76 was finalized by the Regional Bureau after consultations with ECA, OAU, EAC and the UN Specialized Agencies. These consultations proved to be an effective way of coordinating regional projects.

7. The UNDP, in assisting the regional projects in East Africa, has followed the priorities established by the Community. The interest in the regional projects inspected by the mission is shown by the fact that the EAC has requested $6 million from Africa Bureau regional funds for the continuation of some of the projects which the Inspectors felt might not be entirely relevant to the sub-region. In the utilization of the regional IPF, the UNDP has a comprehensive approach, considering the region as a whole after focussing on the countries separately. The UNDP finances a regional training project when there is evidence that a country alone could not provide the necessary inputs to support a country project and that there is continuing need for such services. In responding to the EAC priorities, it should be noted that the UNDP does not have any mandate for establishing the priorities and also that the UN assistance is only part of the total international assistance received by the EAC, bilateral assistance covering other numerous fields. In this connexion, it should be noted that UNDP has no choice but to take exception to the part of the sentence in paragraph 144 stating that "some projects are objected to by the same countries", since it implies that UNDP has supported projects objected to by the Governments concerned. In fact, UNDP cannot support unwanted or objectionable projects because of the very nature of its basic legislation, which requires that projects are launched only at request of Member Governments. The UNDP and the Executing Agencies have had many years to experience in assisting training projects and particularly the training of trainers. The achievement of such a multiplier effect through the projects is one of the cardinal principles of UNDP assistance. But it has to be pointed out that to focus only on the training of trainers exclusively through institution building projects is not enough, and in some cases will not bring the expected results in the time permissible. Confronted with the urgent needs of the developing countries, more emphasis is being given in the UN system to less formal education and other forms of training.

8. The opinion is given in paragraphs 39 and 76 of the report that the project RAF/71/201, Vocational Training Centre, would not have qualified for

/...

the support of international community, and that the project was a wrong choice given the East African Community's top priorities in training. On the other hand, in paragraphs 77 and 78, an UNDP/ILO review mission is critized for having proposed radical changes which would amount to dropping the project, and it is noted that the Community's officer responsible for the project specifically requested its continuation. It is not clear why the report supports the continuation of a project which is believed to have been "a wrong choice" in the first place. UNDP is convinced that the project responded to a genuine need of the Community for clerical personnel. The request for its continuation supported by the inspectors tend to confirm UNDP's position that the project has been fully justified despite many weaknesses and difficulties.

9. The need for a coordination of training effort throughout the Community is certainly accepted; and in the particular case of the postal and telecommunications project, essential linkages with other existing institutions are being consciously developed (e.g. in the field of management training), to ensure that no duplication of effort occurs. It is agreed that this project could be of use to the radio and television broadcasting services of the participating countries. However, for the moment there exist administrative difficulties, inasmuch as these services are operated by national organizations rather than by the Community. It will be a metter for the Governments to take up with the Community authorities if they wish to have broadcasting personnel trained within the EAP & T's training system.

10. Closer cooperation and more intensive contacts between the Inspectors and the local UNDP and Agencies representatives in East Africa would have contributed to clarification of certain problems and issues raised in the report.

Counterpart Personnel (Paras. 42 to 44, 133, 148, 149)

11. The Inspectors have also rightly been concerned with the availability of counterpart personnel. The complete problem encompasses also the preparation of African nationals for senior posts in the various organizations which the training projects are designed to service. In developing the various projects, we have necessarily had to be satisfied with the best possible assurances that the Community and its subsidiary organs and corporations were making the maximum practicable effort to provide suitably qualified counterpart staff. In almost every case such people have been in extremely short supply and there has naturally been a desire to groom some of the few who were available for operational posts, as well as for training activities.

12. One approach to the problem is for a project to produce its own counterpart staff from among early groups of trainees. This admittedly is a lengthy process, but in some cases may be the only practicable alternative to the continued employment of expatriates for an indefinite period. The Soroti

/...

Flying School, like that at Zaria in Nigeria, provides an example of this. (Parenthetically it should be mentioned, in reference to para. 133 of the Inspectors' report that UNDP and ICAO are very conscious of the need to involve the East African Airways Corporation in the Soroti project and are currently doing everything in their power to promote such an involvement).

13. To wait to implement a project until all the fundamental information is available for rational development planning, including principally, the inventory of the country's human resources and of its natural resources is hardly practicable, and would not, in any case, be acceptable to governments. UNDP has endeavoured to solve the problem of counterparts by implementing fellowships programmes well in advance of the projects becoming operational or, as mentioned above, by obtaining from the Governments the "earmarking" of a sufficient number of personnel to be upgraded and trained at the available institutions in the respective countries and then at the project. However, the development of a rational and generally lengthy plan for training counterparts is not always possible, due to the urgency of the demand for personnel that Governments need to fill positions in their cadres and projects have had to do the best they could with the counterpart available and to train them on the march.

14. Training projects, having an institution building character, often present difficulties to the key questions of counterpart support, and these difficulties are frequently magnified in the case of regional training activities which require such support from a number of governments. The Joint Inspection Unit report describes many of these problems in the East African context. The search for solutions to these problems has been, for many years, a pre-occupation for UNDP and its participating and executing agencies, and while we believe that the record of performance shows progress, there is no reason for complacency. UNDP shares fully the views of the Inspectors that the training projects are of high importance and that these counterpart problems must receive constant attention at all stages of project formulation and delivery. As a matter of fact, the UNDP and the Executing Agencies exercised consistent, continuous and persistent efforts to attract, train and retain counterparts for all six regional projects which have been the object of this inspection. The results achieved vary from project to project. In some cases, like in the E.A. School of Aviation, Nairobi, the counterpart personnel has been well-trained so that is running the institution after the departure of the international (ICAO) experts. Equally successful in terms of qualified counterpart is the meteorological project in Nairobi. Good results were achieved in most other projects. However, in a few cases - like the E.A. Flying School in Soroti - the project is in its initial stages and it is simply too early to expect similar results now, but nothing precludes that equally good results will be achieved in the future. In view of these facts, how could the report state that UNDP and the Agencies knew about the problem of counterparts and did nothing to solve it. (Paragraph 42 of the report)? Thus UNDP must, like most of the Agencies, take exception to this statement unsupported by facts.

/...

Utilization of Training Institutions on a Multi-country Basis (Paras. 61, 86, 95, 150)

15. UNDP and the various agencies would certainly find common cause with the Inspectors in their desire to promote the utilization of training institutions, in all appropriate cases, on a multi-country basis. Best results in this respect have been achieved by WMO in the field of meteorology training, as confirmed in the paragraph 61 of the report. ICAO, for its part, has for a number of years endeavoured to develop a regional vocation for selected national training centres. In the telecommunication field, the concept of a regional programme of training institution development projects for the countries of East Africa has been carefully fostered by UNDP and ITU for quite some time. The meeting referred to in paras. 151 and 152 of the Inspectors' report took place within the framework of this total concept. However, the international organizations decided, with the concurrence of the governments concerned, to concentrate firstly upon building and consolidating institutions within the Community, with the development of their wider vocation being considered as a secondary objective to be promoted at a later stage. Under these circumstances it is difficult to understand and even more difficult to accept the statement in the paragraph 150 of the report that "regional cooperation has received only lip service".

The Supervisory Machinery (Para. 93)

16. There is no doubt that a strong governing body is in the best interest of any training institution. It is, however, a matter of debate what is the best composition of such a governing body.

Second Phases of Training Projects (Para. 50)

17. The experience of both UNDP and the Agencies does not bear out the statement that "... a properly conceived and executed-project seldom requires a 'second phase'. The second phase is, in many ways, proof of the failure of the first phase...". In the case of the six inspected training projects of the E.A. Community the UNDP and the Agencies were called to help the establishment of training and research institutions in technically, rapidly advancing and increasingly sophisticated fields starting virtually from the scratch. It takes four to five years to upgrade a high school graduate to an university level engineer or scientist. It takes even longer to train an instructor at this level and often, as in the case of flying instructors, long practical flying experience is indispensable for any person to which pilot training can be entrusted. And it takes even longer time to train a scientist researcher at postgraduate or doctorate level in a field like meteorology. Since UNDP is for financial and administrative reasons unable to finance projects which last more than five years, it is obvious that a multi-phased approach is unavoidable in all cases of assistance to the establishment of training institutions in advanced technical and scientific fields. Thus UNDP considers that the above-mentioned inspectors' conclusion in the paragraph 50 of the report cannot be applied to the six projects inspected.

/...

A revised Concept of Training - Conclusions and Recommendations

18. The point made by the Inspectors about the need for training projects to be development-oriented is well taken. If the technical assistance purpose of developing national talents is to be effectively achieved, the tasks performed by the international staff of a project should be oriented to "developing", rather than "doing", unless the staff are provided specifically to serve in an operational and executive (OPAS) capacity. In other words, the role of advisory personnel should be to collaborate with the national staff in carrying out the project's activities in such a manner that, even while the objective of the project is being achieved, they have transmitted to, or developed in, the national staff (and related personnel) the knowledge, skills, and attitudes that they require to carry on the tasks by themselves. "Staff development" projects are being recognized by an increasing number of countries as a desirable alternative to traditional forms of counterpart training. Staff development implies the training of teams, rather than single counterparts. It requires a "project approach" that is, the definition of the scope, substance and modalities of staff training, whether for an educational institution, a service, or otherwise. The Inspectors recognize the importance which UNDP has given to the training of trainers and recommend that this criterion by adhered strictly in the selection of projects. It is believed that, in addition to training of trainers, the training of key personnel and of what may be called "agents of change" has equally great importance for development. The training of key personnel and agents of change implies more than selecting candidates of the right level. Qualified nationals of developing countries often find themselves, after returning to their home countries, faced with responsibilities and managerial tasks for which their technical studies have not prepared them. Hence, the importance of management education for developing countries' technicians and the establishment of programmes to accelerate the growth of experience. It is within this broader concept that UNDP concurs with the emphasis given by the Inspectors to management training.

19. UNDP must take exception to the statement that "UNDP regional training programmes in East Africa" could be considered to have had 33% success, and 66% failure". UNDP does not think that such highly complex projects can be classified in such a mechanical and quantitative way. In UNDP's view, none of the six projects could be considered as a failure, and even for the weakest among them (RAF/71/201) the Inspectors have supported a continuation of UNDP assistance. What is essential in this context is that all parties concerned realize that training projects, and particularly establishment of training institutions, often encounter many difficulties, especially when the projects are on a regional basis. It should be noted that Governments, the Agencies and UNDP have all shared the preoccupations with these problems, noting that the record shows progress, but leaves no room for complacency.

20. UNDP is in full agreement with the statement in the report that "The training programme should be adapted to the special socio-economic ... set up of the countries concerned" (para. 159). A majority of developing countries' nationals whose training is financed from technical cooperation sources are in technical disciplines and do not receive sufficient exposure to analysis of the socio-economic aspects of development nor, as a rule, any training which might help them to adapt the technology of the industrialized countries to the specific situation of their country of origin. A similar bias

/...

appears to be typical also of the education imparted within many of the developing countries. As far as the priorities are concerned, it should be repeated again that the UN system cannot, and should not, usurp the countries' role and it is up to the governments to evolve the priorities for the regions' social and economic development.

21. The UNDP shares the Inspectors' preoccupation about the need for better training and briefing, not only of the Project Managers, but of the projects' international staff also. Agency briefing of experts should focus clearly on the inherent technical assistance purpose of building up national staff capabilities in assisted countries and on the modalities of realizing this objective. In addition, at the project level, the staff of each project should be required to establish a framework for effective interaction between national and international project personnel. Typically, the framework should define against each project activity and sub-activity, what the national and international personnel would do and what would be the terminal objective of their working together on the project activity, not only in terms of the activity's outputs but, more importantly, in terms of the knowledge, skills and attitudes that the national staff would attain. The UNDP has introduced, since the Inspectors' visit to its Headquarters, several new concepts and measures to improve the briefing and training of its own staff. It is not felt, however, that it would be appropriate to discuss them here, since the UNDP staff has no direct responsibility in the execution of training projects.

22. As to recommendations, there is no general disagreement with recommendation number one. In fact, it is followed wherever there is an existing institution. However, where no suitable institution already exists it may, from time to time, be essential to develop a new one from the ground up. The East African Community Staff Institute, on which the Inspectors comment favourably, is one example of this. There is also an agreement with recommendation number two, provided the countries show a genuine interest in the multi-national training institution, and within the limitations set by the regional IPF. As to the third recommendation, the format and content of the project document is under revision and some of the Inspectors' suggestions will, undoubtedly, be taken into account. However, UNDP must take exception to Recommendations 3(b) and 3(e) since they are contrary to the basic legislation defining UNDP's relationship with Member Governments and no Government would permit a project manager to appoint counterpart personnel. Nor could the final responsibility for ensuring the appointment of the counterpart personnel be vested in the resident representative, since this is an exclusive responsibility of each Member Government.

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

Distr.
GENERAL

E/5594/Add.2/Corr.1
3 December 1974

ENGLISH ONLY

REPORTS OF THE JOINT INSPECTION UNIT

Report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case

Addendum

Observations of the Advisory Committee on Administrative and Budgetary Questions

Corrigendum

Paragraph 4 (a), first line

For objections read objectives

74-33582

/...

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

Distr.
GENERAL

E/5594/Add.2/Corr.1
3 December 1974

ENGLISH ONLY

REPORTS OF THE JOINT INSPECTION UNIT

Report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case

Addendum

Observations of the Advisory Committee on Administrative and Budgetary Questions

Corrigendum

Paragraph 4 (a), first line

For objections read objectives

74-33582

/...

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

Distr.
GENERAL

E/5594/Add.2
31 October 1974

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

REPORTS OF THE JOINT INSPECTION UNIT

Report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case

Addendum

Observations of the Advisory Committee on Administrative and Budgetary Questions

1. The Advisory Committee on Administrative and Budgetary Questions has considered the report of the Joint Inspection Unit on the above subject (E/5594) and the related comments of the Administrator of UNDP (E/5594/Add.1).

2. The Joint Inspection Unit report is based on a recent survey of six subregional training projects in East Africa. Each project is examined under the following headings: (a) legal status; (b) operations; (c) project achievements and short-comings.

3. The report advocates the need for a revised concept of regional training programmes, using as a starting point, primarily, a critical evaluation of methods and procedures of planning and administration of existing large-scale projects of technical assistance in the developing countries.

4. According to the report, the principal short-comings of project planning and management can be summarized as follows:

(a) Loose definition of the objections of the projects, which often lack consistency, integration and concreteness;

(b) Administrative delays at all the stages of planning and implementation of projects, and, resulting from those delays, diminished relevance of project objectives to national development needs and lack of adaptability to changing requirements;

(c) Inadequate provisions for the recruitment, training and retention of capable counterpart staff;

(d) Failure to take advantage to the full of the potential of regional co-operation.

5. The Inspectors refer to instances of wastage and duplication. They cite the case of an aviation school in which no less than half of the manpower was lost either during or after training. According to the Inspectors, this creates a situation calling for a thorough investigation (para. 121 (b)).

6. The Inspectors also state that they "could not understand the reasons for making two separate projects for the civil aviation training at two separate sites 300 miles apart. Experience elsewhere shows it is possible to have a comprehensive unified programme of training in civil aviation under one roof" (para. 132).

7. The major flaw, however, according to the Inspectors, has lain with the recruitment and training of counterparts. In the particular case of the East African Institute for Meteorological Training and Research (RAF-71-199) the Inspectors mention "lack of drive" in this respect as the project's "biggest weakness" (para. 65). In the East African Railways and Harbours Project they note the finding of an interagency review mission sent to East Africa in 1972: "satisfactory provision of counterpart staff by Corporations concerned but complete lack of counterparts for the Arusha Centre" (para. 107 (e)).

8. More systematic training of project managers and UNDP experts has also been recommended by the Inspectors.

9. The Joint Inspection Unit's revised concept of the UNDP training programme is based on the distinction between the differing needs of the least developed and the developing countries. The regional approach is favoured by the Inspectors as offering more scope for small least developed countries with common training needs.

10. The Inspectors express the view that priority should be given to the training of: "(a) government personnel able to fulfil the essential administrative functions; (b) government personnel and technicians well qualified to prepare the inventory of human, natural and institutional resources as basic data for any rational developing programme" (para. 160).

11. The Inspectors focus attention primarily on two areas: the training of trainers and public administration training. On the former the Inspectors observe: "The urgency, the quality and the quantity of the training of trainers required for the least developed countries are unique, and unique methods of approach are called for and, specifically, very close supervision is needed" (para. 139). In connexion with the latter, they see "a great future for the EAC Management Institute and a similar institution in each country (para. 142).

12. To obviate delays in the appointment of national counterparts, the Inspectors recommend that UNDP consider the possibility of financing the training of two or three nationals for each vacancy in the national administration caused by the detachment of the counterparts (para. 149). They also stress the need for more effective pooling of scarce training resources in the framework of regional projects.

/...

13. Making an over-all assessment, the Inspectors express the view that "The UNDP regional training programmes in East Africa could ... be considered to have had 33 per cent success and 67 per cent failure" (para. 156).

14. The Inspectors' report has met with a mixed reception. Most of the United Nations agencies concerned have expressed their appreciation of the report. By contrast, the Administrator of UNDP, who, at the request of the Secretary-General of the United Nations, assumed responsibility for the preparation of comments, clearly has serious reservations about some of the Inspectors' conclusions and recommendations (E/5594/Add.1). In particular, the Administrator calls into question the over-all assessment mentioned in the preceding paragraph.

15. In paragraphs 4 to 6 of his observations, he answers the critique regarding "lack of cohesiveness of UNDP authority vis-à-vis the EAC", by pointing to the existence of machinery for co-ordination and consultation on regional projects. In paragraphs 7 to 9, the problems of securing administrative cohesiveness in regional activities are dwelt upon. In paragraph 9 mention is made, specifically, of difficulties in the way of wider linkages for the postal and telecommunications project. These difficulties are attributable to the fact that radio and television broadcasting services of the participating countries are operated by national organizations rather than by the community.

16. The problems of recruitment, retention and training of counterpart personnel are examined in paragraphs 11 to 14 of the Administrator's observations. While indicating that the practice of selecting and building up such cadres through project training programmes and through the award of fellowships has yielded some results, the Administrator concedes that the results achieved in attracting, training and retaining counterparts vary from project to project. But the Administrator is unable to endorse the Inspectors' recommendations on counterpart personnel (E/5594, Recommendations, para. 3 (b) and (e)) on the grounds that "they are contrary to the basic legislation defining UNDP's relationship with Member Governments" (E/5594/Add.1, para. 22).

17. As regards phasing, the Administrator questions the Inspectors' belief that "a properly conceived and executed project seldom requires a second phase" (E/5594, para. 50). He points to the length of time required for adequate training in the increasingly sophisticated technical fields and the difficulty, given the UNDP financial and administrative procedures, of accommodating that training within a single phase.

18. The Administrator endorses the principles of regional co-operation and innovation in training which have been advocated by the Inspectors. He also accepts the substance of their recommendations regarding project planning and implementation.

19. In the Advisory Committee's opinion, the Inspectors' report provides a useful indication of the kind of difficulties which arise in the implementation of projects of technical assistance in the least developed countries. Caution should, however, be exercised in drawing general conclusions and prescribing

/...

new principles from a relatively small sample of six projects. Due weight must also be given to the undoubted constraints imposed by political considerations which are further complicated in multinational projects. Nevertheless, the Committee agrees with the Inspectors that there is need for greater emphasis on administrative efficiency in the management of projects.

UNITED NATIONS LIBRARY
UNITED NATIONS
BIBLIOTHEQUE
GENEVA

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC
AND
SOCIAL COUNCIL

Distr.
GENERAL

E/5594/Add.3
4 December 1974
ENGLISH
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH/FRENCH/
RUSSIAN/SPANISH

REPORTS OF THE JOINT INSPECTION UNIT

Report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case (JIU/REP/73/5)

Addendum

Preliminary comments of the Director-General of the World Health Organization and action taken by the Executive Board of WHO

A. Preliminary comments of the Director-General

Although none of the regional training projects referred to by the inspectors is executed by WHO or has a health component, the constraints and short-comings outlined in this report are similar to the problems encountered by WHO in the execution of the projects it assists.

The Director-General therefore agrees with the inspectors that, while the recommendations contained on pages 37-38 are mainly based on their findings after inspecting some UNDP regional training projects in East Africa, they can, nevertheless, be applicable to other training projects in developing countries. He proposes, therefore, to comment on these recommendations and outline WHO's experience and policy vis-à-vis each of them.

Recommendation 1 - WHO strongly supports the concept of strengthening existing institutions rather than establishing new ones; it has endeavoured to do so as far as may be practicable.

In Africa, WHO has increased its efforts over the past few years in training professional staff by assisting existing medical schools, university centres for health sciences and other establishments concerned with the training of health personnel. Emphasis is being placed on the training of national teachers, particularly in basic sciences and public health.

Recommendation 2 - The Director-General endorses the views that multinational training institutions should be encouraged in developing countries. This is particularly valid in the field of health. Education in the medical and allied health sciences is a very expensive undertaking especially for developing countries. It is therefore essential, whenever possible, to bring together related teaching

programmes, faculties and facilities. Such multinational schemes, utilizing a multidisciplinary teaching approach, should be closely integrated with the local health services in the respective countries and thus related to the whole range of institutions providing health promotion and care.

Recommendation 3 - The specific provisions recommended by the inspectors which should be foreseen when preparing project documents, such as evaluation of terminated projects, training of counterpart personnel and the early recruitment of project managers, etc. are, in the opinion of the Director-General, well taken. The Director-General agrees with the importance of the follow-up on completed projects. This is a normal practice in WHO which is followed through by the organization's regionalized structure and the institution of WHO representatives who are expected to review annually the health situation in their respective countries.

The appointment of counterpart personnel in time, their co-operation from the start in the execution of projects and ultimate take-over when international assistance phases out, is no doubt a sine qua non for the success of any project. The training of counterpart personnel is therefore recognized by WHO to be of paramount importance. Nearly all WHO-assisted projects have built-in training components. WHO endeavours to use to the maximum extent possible training facilities in neighbouring countries. In appropriate circumstances, local awards are also encouraged. The Director-General takes exception, however, to the Inspectors' recommendation under 3 (e); this seems to him to be out of keeping with the sovereignty of the requesting Government in the administration of projects and with the technical responsibilities of the executing agencies.

Regarding project managers, WHO considers the project to be operational on the arrival of the project manager in the field. The organization has, therefore, endeavoured to recruit the project managers from the very early stages of the project and associate them with projects since the preparation of the plan of action.

Recommendation 4 - The Director-General concurs with this recommendation but believes that the time when technical assistance projects were "sold" to Governments is over. As far as the health sector is concerned, there is a continuing sharpening of priorities in national planning bodies and a healthy pruning of projects of less direct relevance to national development plans. There is also a growing emphasis on thorough programme dialogues with national health authorities with a view to reaching a better definition of countries' health problems and to increasing WHO's impact on solving these problems. One of the new mechanisms being developed by WHO to assist countries in identifying national priorities is country health programming by which health problems of a country are assessed systematically in their proper context, taking into account the resources that are or could be available, with the aim of pinpointing areas susceptible to change. Country health programming is followed by project formulation which describes the measures to be adopted and the detailed use of resources for their implementation in the priority areas. Suitable management techniques and evaluation procedures are then applied in the implementation. This new mechanism has already been experimented and is now being carried out in several countries at their request.

/...

Recommendation 5 - This recommendation is addressed to UNDP and the Director-General has therefore no comments thereon.

Recommendation 6 - The Director-General concurs with the Inspectors' views on the importance of providing adequate briefing to project personnel including project managers. WHO organizes at headquarters briefing courses to that purpose. Project staff receive further briefing at the seat of regional offices before departing to their project site. Consistent support is thereafter provided by WHO representatives located in most of the countries involved.

B. Action taken by the Executive Board of WHO

The Executive Board,

Having considered the Joint Inspection Unit's report on "The need for a revised concept on UNDP Regional Training Programmes in the Least Developed Countries: the East African Case" and the Director-General's report thereon,

1. Thanks the Inspectors for their report;

2. Concurs with the comments and observations of the Director-General on this report;

3. Requests the Director-General to transmit his report and this resolution to:

(i) The Secretary-General of the United Nations for transmission to the Economic and Social Council through the Committee for Programme and Co-ordination;

(ii) The External Auditor of the World Health Organization; and

(iii) The Chairman of the Joint Inspection Unit.

Third meeting, 28 May 1974
EB54/SR/3

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

Distr.
GENERAL

E/5594/Add.4
4 December 1974
ENGLISH
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH/FRENCH/RUSSIAN/SPANISH

REPORTS OF THE JOINT INSPECTION UNIT

Report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case (JIU/REP/73/5)

Addendum

Comments of the Secretary-General of the International Civil Aviation Organization and action taken by the ICAO Council

A. Comments of the Secretary-General

The report makes interesting comments and suggestions concerning the problems of regional training institutes in general and on the East African Community in particular. However, certain of the statements and conclusions with regard to the ICAO projects require elaboration, and these are commented on below, using the paragraph numbers or page numbers of the report as references:

Para. 40)
Para. 132) These paragraphs question why the Community decided to split the civil aviation training requirements into two schools at Nairobi and Soroti. ICAO would have preferred to have both schools at Nairobi but, as the inspectors point out in paragraph 129, there was a Community decision to share UNDP projects among the three countries. Subsequently, the Community proposed that the two schools be merged, but political problems arose, and the matter is now in abeyance.

Para. 42 This deals with the lack of counterpart personnel, and criticizes the Agencies for doing little about it. In actual fact, this was not a problem with regard to the East African School of Aviation (which project terminated at the end of 1972) where, although there were initial recruitment delays, more counterpart personnel than were provided for in the Plan of Operation were ultimately recruited. In respect of the Flying School in Soroti, the problem definitely exists, and ICAO has made continuing efforts to overcome it. There has been considerable correspondence, to the Secretary General of the Community or others; the Director of the ICAO Technical Assistance Bureau visited the Community twice in 1973, to discuss the matter. It is an item which preoccupies the Project Manager, the Agency and specifically the Resident Representatives.

Para. 44 The problem of retention of trained instructional staff is always both important and difficult, and usually outside of Agency hands - certainly so after the project is completed. Retention incentives certainly need to be increased; on the other hand, it is very difficult to tell a competent staff member that he cannot be promoted to another position in the Community service because he is so valuable where he is. It therefore becomes a requirement for the Training Centre to continue to train counterparts even after the UNDP assistance is completed.

Para. 45 ICAO has some difficulty with this, which relates to the need for more thorough briefing of experts. The point is well taken but does not apply to ICAO. For example, the Project Manager of the Soroti Flying School spent two months of attachment to ICAO Headquarters before going out to the field. We have a policy of annual visits to Headquarters of all Project Managers to consider and accelerate project implementation.

Para. 50 This expresses concern at the possibility of second or third phases of UNDP assistance to a project, assuming, quite wrongly in the case of ICAO, that a second phase implies failure of the first phase. For example, the Soroti project was originally - and is still - envisaged to have two phases, the first four-year phase of a limited type of operation followed by a second three-year phase in which all flying training would be conducted at Soroti; it is particularly incorrect to speak here of a second phase being required because the first phase was a failure, as the expanded phase will only be agreed to if the first phase is successful (the inspectors themselves make this point clear in para. 125). Furthermore, the inspectors are of the opinion that the civil aviation training programme is in its second phase; this is a misunderstanding, as the Nairobi project had only one phase of 5 1/2 years, and was handed over to the Community in 1972, and the Soroti project is still in its first phase.

Pages 27-29 Nairobi Centre It is recognized that there is an accomodations problem at the Centre - currently perhaps adequate, but more room needed for expansion. The inspectors' comments concerning the quality of training received by the instructors is encouraging to us. With regard to the question of retention of instructors, I refer you to the comments in paragraph 44 above. Finally, the question of wastage of trained manpower: we have been informed that, in 1973, this wastage was reduced to below 10 per cent, a very considerable improvement over the early years.

Pages 29-31 Soroti Centre The "considerable delays" described by the inspectors in processing project documents and in building programmes actually resulted in the first pilot course beginning four months later than first planned. Again the remarks in paragraph 131 are encouraging. The comment in paragraph 134 seems somewhat confused: the inclusion of a training provision in aircraft purchase agreements is in no way applicable to basic pilot or mechanic training, but is related solely to conversion of qualified pilots or mechanics from one aircraft type to another.

/...

What we consider of greater importance in this project is the lack of counterpart personnel, a problem which is our primary concern.

Para. 148
Para. 149

In a general context, these paragraphs again bring up the cricical question of counterparts. The suggestion is made that the UNDP pay twice, once to train the counterpart instructor and once to provide an expert to take the counterpart's place in his original job. For Soroti at least, we do not consider this to be the real problem; men exist, either already within the Community staff or available for recruitment, but the location of Soroti far from any large city makes service there not too attractive.

pp. 36-38

Conclusions and Recommendations

It is difficult to comment on a statement (para. 156) which characterizes East African training programmes as "33 per cent success and 67 per cent failure". Certainly ICAO considers that the East African School of Aviation in Nairobi has been a success, and that the East African Civil Flying School in Soroti, despite political problems and a lack of counterparts - the second problem now hopefully on the way to solution - is well established and also likely to be successful by the time Phase I is ended. Comments by the inspectors in paragraphs 119, 130 and 131 indicate that they are fundamentally in agreement with the above.

B. Action taken by the ICAO Council

At its meeting on 16 May 1974 the Council considered the report and agreed that it contained a number of useful recommendations and observations. The Council also noted the Secretary-General's comments thereon.

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

Distr.
GENERAL

E/5594/Add.5
4 December 1974
ENGLISH
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH/FRENCH
RUSSIAN/SPANISH

REPORTS OF THE JOINT INSPECTION UNIT

Report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case (JIU/REP/73/5)

Addendum

Comments of the Secretary-General of the World Meteorological Organization and action taken by the Executive Committee of WMO

A. Comments of the Secretary-General

General

1. The main purpose of the report is indicated in paragraph 3 as evaluation of the training programmes in East Africa to see:

(a) If these really meet the regional or national needs of the countries;

(b) If the UNDP could improve the use of the resources in these programmes.

It is considered that the report has covered these two points very thoroughly and most of the general observations and conclusions on the UNDP-assisted training activities in East Africa contained in the report are very well taken.

2. Among the six training projects which the inspectors have reviewed and commented upon in the report is included one project executed by WMO, namely, "The East African Institute for Meteorological Training and Research (RAF-71-199)". The comments of the inspectors on this project are generally complimentary and some of their observations regarding deficiencies in the training projects in East Africa in general do not apply to this project. The inspectors' detailed comments on this project are contained in paragraphs 52-66 of the report. This project has also been referred to in other parts of the report.

Comments on the specific observations in the report on the project RAF-71-199 - East African Institute for Meteorological Training and Research

Project achievements and weaknesses

3. Summing up the project achievements (paragraphs 64 to 66) the inspectors have concluded that in spite of certain short-comings in the early part of implementation, the project would achieve its objectives and the countries that are members of the East African Community and many other African countries will acquire - at the termination of the project - the technical know-how for the teaching of meteorology by their nationals. It is also mentioned that the use by WMO of fellowships in the project for the training of students in meteorology in their own climatic setting so effectively is a great credit to WMO. It is clear that from these observations of the inspectors that this is a successful project.

4. The inspectors have commented that this project has successfully achieved the twin collaboration between the English- and French-speaking nations and between the East African Community and other English-speaking countries. Further it is mentioned that the project is a good example of regional collaboration and represents a positive drive to utilize fully regional institutions to meet regional needs at various levels of training (paragraphs 30 and 47). These comments are indeed gratifying. It should be mentioned that this is the first attempt of the Organization in bringing students from French-speaking countries for training in an institution with English as medium. Candidates had to be prepared in English in their own countries which was done through technical assistance experts in the countries concerned and facilities such as language courses were provided to them in order to achieve this. The result has been successful as commended by the inspectors.

Training of counterpart personnel

5. The report mentions that the fellowships for training counterpart personnel were not being used and the biggest weakness in the project therefore was the lack of drive to train East African counterpart trainers to work with the international staff (paragraphs 62 and 65).

6. It should be mentioned that when the project was formulated it was envisaged that the counterpart personnel to take over from the international instructors will have first to be trained in the Institute and the Nairobi University to get their basic degrees and then sent abroad for specialization using the fellowships in the project, since candidates with adequate basic degrees were not already available. On this basis only, in the Plan of Operation the implementation of the fellowships had been planned during the second half of the project. Several candidates for fellowships are at present following the M.Sc. and Ph.D. courses and it is hoped that the fellowships would be used according to the plan and the counterpart instructors would have been trained before the project is completed.

/...

Delay in signing of plan of operation

7. The report has pointed out that unreasonable delays in the signing of project documents by Governments of the partner States have produced considerable administrative and training difficulties which have reduced the potential value of the projects (paragraph 41). The WMO project is also mentioned in this connexion. Though the Plan of Operation of this project was signed only about two years after the project's approval by UNDP, the delay in the signing did not affect the implementation of the training activities since these training activities were already under operation in two different projects and the present project was only intended to combine these two into one and to expand the scope to include also applied meteorological research.

Project termination

8. The inspectors' proposal that the project should terminate in August 1977 rather than in 1976 is supported since this will give sufficient time for the fellows returning from training to work in parallel with the international staff for about a year before taking over from them.

Second and Third Phase projects

9. It has been observed in the report that a properly conceived and executed project very rarely requires a second phase and the second phase is in many cases proof of the failure of the first phase (paragraph 50). The Meteorological Institute for Training and Research project is also mentioned in this connexion. It is difficult to agree with this generalization. By its very nature a training project intended for the developing countries in Africa cannot be successfully completed in a single phase in a short period of time since the training has to start from scratch. Only after a minimum nucleus of personnel have been trained for the different countries would it be possible for these trained people to be trainers for their own nationals. A training project will, therefore, necessarily be of long duration and the so-called second phase is not really necessitated by the non-achievement of the objectives in the first phase.

Sectoral Conferences for Trainers (paragraphs 151-152)

10. The inspectors have commented upon the usefulness of organizing regional sectoral conferences in specific fields for trainers from different countries. WMO supports this recommendation and in fact, being cognizant of the usefulness of such conferences, WMO has already organized in Africa two such conferences, one for national instructors for Classes III and IV meteorological personnel (held in Cairo, 1966) and the other on meteorological education and training in developing countries in Africa (held in Algiers, 1970). In these conferences the participants were the nationals of different countries actually engaged in the training of meteorological personnel, and the conferences were found by the participants to be very useful in the further development of training activities in their own countries.

/...

Recommendation of the Inspectors

11. The six recommendations of the inspectors are fully supported. The organization of the Meteorological Institute for Training and Research, project RAF-71-199, is in full accord with Recommendations 1 and 2.

12. The inspectors' proposals contained in Recommendation 3 (a) concerning specific provision being included in the project document for the follow-up by the executing agency after the termination of the project are fully endorsed. WMO during discussions with the UNDP has often emphasized this point that UNDP should make financial provision in the project itself for small support on follow-up activities for a few years after the main project is finished.

B. Action taken by the Executive Committee of WMO

The Executive Committee,

Recalling the procedures for transmitting and handling the reports of the Joint Inspection Unit adopted by ECOSOC in its resolution 1457 (XLVII),

Noting that the following report of the Joint Inspection Unit has been formally referred to the World Meteorological Organization:

Report on the Need for a Revised Concept on UNDP Regional Training Programmes in the Least-developed Countries: The East African Case, by Inspectors E. Ferrier-Vieyra and J. A. Sawe (JIU/REP/73/5),

Having considered the observations of the Secretary-General on the report, as contained in the annex to this resolution,

Endorses the observations of the Secretary-General,

Expresses its appreciation to the inspectors for the valuable recommendations they have submitted,

Requests the Secretary-General to transmit this resolution to the Secretary-General of the United Nations for transmission to the Economic and Social Council through its Committee on Programme and Co-ordination drawing particular attention to the desirability of extending the termination date for project RAF-71-199, East African Institute for Meteorological Training and Research, until 1977.

Resolution 28 (EC-XXVI)

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

Distr.
GENERAL

E/5594/Add.6
4 December 1974
ENGLISH
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH/FRENCH

REPORTS OF THE JOINT INSPECTION UNIT

Report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case (JIU/REP/73/5)

Addendum

Comments of the Secretary-General of the Inter-Governmental Maritime Consultative Organization and action taken by the IMCO Council

A. Comments of the Secretary-General

IMCO has acquired a considerable amount of experience with training projects, which constitute the largest single component of its technical co-operation programme as a UNDP executing agency. In the light of this experience we are in agreement with a number of the recommendations contained in the report.

1. We agree that it is generally desirable to attach UNDP training projects to an already existing institution.

2. We agree that for a large number of small countries it is desirable to encourage multinational training institutions.

3. Project documents should be both more carefully drafted, and at the same time simplified, so that they focus on really important practical policy matters such as those listed in the report:

(a) Provision for follow-up by the executing agency after the termination of the project is highly desirable;

(b) The timely appointment of counterpart personnel is essential;

(c) There should be no undue delay in the signature of the project document;

(e) The resident representative should be responsible for ensuring that the Government makes timely designation of counterpart personnel.

On the other hand,

(d) IMCO has had no difficulty in establishing the stage at which its projects become "operational".

4. IMCO agrees that projects should not be approved which do not imply the good use of UNDP funds according to United Nations guidelines on development.

5. We consider that the question of Indicative Planning Figures for organizations of Member States is one for the Governing Council of the UNDP to determine.

6. IMCO considers that project managers should receive the most thorough feasible briefing before taking up their posts.

B. Action taken by the IMCO Council

The comments of the Secretary-General, together with the relevant report, were laid before the IMCO Council, when it met for its thirty-second session from 21 to 24 May 1974, and were approved by that body.

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

Distr.
GENERAL

E/5594/Add.7
6 January 1975.
ENGLISH
ENGLISH/FRENCH/
RUSSIAN/SPANISH

REPORTS OF THE JOINT INSPECTION UNIT

Report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case (JIU/REP/73/5)

Addendum

Preliminary observations of the Director-General of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization and action taken by the Executive Board of UNESCO

A. Preliminary observations of the Director-General

1. The Director-General has studied with interest the report of Inspectors E. Ferrer-Vieyra and J. A. Sawe. He notes that UNESCO was executing agency for none of the five training projects studied by the Inspectors. Nevertheless, he would like to make some observations on the general concern of the Inspectors regarding the need of a revised concept on such programmes.

2. He agrees that more emphasis should be placed on co-ordinated planning of regional projects, involving all the partners concerned. He believes, as the Inspectors do, that the quality of project documents is of vital importance in so far as they are realistic and take account of prevailing conditions. He recognizes that the problem of counterparts is almost always severe, particularly in the least developed countries, but he questions that there is an absence of real concern about this problem on the part of the agencies (para. 42) - or at least in relation to projects for which UNESCO is responsible.

3. The requirements of a more thorough preparation of the project personnel (para. 45) are well known to UNESCO. Several departments of UNESCO have significantly modified the briefing periods for Chief Technical Advisers (both in terms of content and duration). Retraining is also being provided periodically. Educational Planning experts meet every year for this purpose, and meetings of National Directors and Chief Technical Advisers of teacher-training projects are held every second year. A generalization of this practice to all sectors of the organization may be envisaged in the near future.

4. He welcomes the idea of guidelines for Member States concerning their co-operation in regional projects (para. 150). However, it should be recognized

that there have been recent developments in procedures and priorities for the approval of intercountry programmes, and it is now far less probable that projects which are unlikely to make good use of UNDP funds will be approved.

5. As a general observation, even though it is considered most desirable that special training projects should be organized for the "least developed countries", the validity of restriction to these countries must depend on geographical location. When several of them are contiguous, a special training programme for the group is feasible. However, if this is not the case, the planning of projects must be flexible enough to take into account the needs of neighbouring countries, even if they are not classified as "least developed".

6. Finally, the Director-General is gratified to note in paragraph 153 that the Inspectors make special mention of a pilot project on Functional Literacy for which UNESCO was the executing agency, as an example of how information on successful regional or national training institutions could be made more effectively available in neighbouring countries.

B. Action taken by the Executive Board of UNESCO

The Executive Board,

1. Having considered the report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case (document 95 EX/7) and the report of the Special Committee thereon (document 95 EX/5);

2. Takes note of the Joint Inspection Unit Report;

3. Notes also that UNESCO was Executing Agency for none of the five training projects studied by the Inspectors;

4. Considers that the lessons to be learned from the report are of marginal interest to UNESCO.

3.9.5. (95 EX/SR.7)

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

UNITED NATIONS LIBRARY BIBLIOTHÈQUE DES NATIONS UNIES

Distr.
GENERAL

E/5594/Add.8
16 December 1974
ENGLISH
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH/FRENCH

REPORTS OF THE JOINT INSPECTION UNIT

Report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case (JIU/REP/73/5)

Addendum

Preliminary comments of the Director-General of the Universal Postal Union

A. General considerations

1. The main purpose of report JIU/REP/73/5 is to evaluate the basic concept of UNDP-assisted training programmes and the practical steps which have been taken to determine whether:

(a) These programmes really meet the regional or national requirements of the least developed countries;

(b) The United Nations Development Programme can improve the way in which the funds assigned to these programmes are used.

2. In the view of the Universal Postal Union, the report gives an accurate analysis of the situation in the area under consideration. On the whole, the comments and recommendations on UNDP-assisted training activities deserve to be taken into consideration for the future programmes of the executing agencies.

3. Of the six regional training institutions inspected, the one concerned in project RAF/71/155 is of special interest to the Universal Postal Union as the agency associated with the International Telecommunication Union.

B. Central school of posts and telecommunications (RAF/71/155)

4. The remarks of the inspectors on the execution of this project prompt the following comments:

Delays in project approval procedure (para. 85)

5. The Universal Postal Union fully shares the views expressed in the report regarding the adverse effects of such delays on the training programme for postal staff in general and counterpart personnel in particular.

Training of personnel from countries that are not members of the East African Community (para. 86)

6. The Universal Postal Union welcomes the comments of the inspectors on the need to extend the activities of the Centre to nationals of the other East African countries. In fact it has already had occasion to stress this point when it considered the preliminary draft of the document. It would seem that the major obstacles to the desired expansion are due to the absence of adequate premises.

7. As regards the training of instructors from neighbouring countries, the Universal Postal Union feels that such an extension of activities in this area should be given thorough consideration, bearing in mind the number of staff to be trained and, above all, the need to adapt instructor-training activities to the specific needs of the least advanced postal administrations. In this connexion the Universal Postal Union is planning special action to promote accelerated training of teaching staff who are nationals of these countries, by organizing refresher courses or teacher-training courses (see comments under C).

Problem of regional co-operation (para. 95)

8. The Universal Postal Union shares the view of the inspectors with regard to the measures that should be taken by the agencies of the United Nations system to promote regional co-operation. The Union makes a point of involving all the countries of a given region in all the middle-grade and senior staff-training activities which it undertakes in that region.

9. In the particular case of the neighbouring countries of Kenya, however, it should be pointed out that for two of them, Burundi and Rwanda, any pooling of training facilities comes up against language obstacles, because the three members of the East African Community are English-speaking, while some of their neighbours use French.

C. Training programme for the postal staff of the least advanced countries (paras. 137-142)

Special measures undertaken or envisaged by the Universal Postal Union

10. For the last two years the Universal Postal Union has been endeavouring to implement a training programme suited to the specific needs of the least advanced countries. In this connexion, it has planned activities at the national and multinational levels.

/...

1. Training activities at the national level

11. Missions of specialists in postal development or consultants would make it possible to organize, on the spot, courses characterized by their pragmatism and duration. The primary purpose of the instruction which includes theoretical lectures and practical exercises is to improve the professional knowledge of officials performing certain duties. None of the countries concerned has yet asked whether it could make use of the opportunities thus offered by the Universal Postal Union.

2. Training activities at the multinational level

12. At the multinational level the Universal Postal Union has organized short training courses for middle-grade staff of the least advanced countries who are responsible for organizing the forwarding and delivery of mail.

13. Two projects financed by the United Nations Development Programme which are due to start in September and October 1974, respectively, will enable the least advanced postal administrations to identify the obstacles to the development of their services and to train a few officials in the techniques of postal organization and operation.

14. Moreover, owing to the "multiplier" effect of the training of instructors, the Universal Postal Union considers that it would be in the best interests of the least advanced countries to have a few instructors at their disposal who could, in turn, either improve the quality of the training given in the country or set up a training system that would meet the requirements of the country.

15. To this end, the Universal Postal Union plans to organize, at the regional or subregional level - so as to adapt the content of the course to the actual needs of the beneficiaries - instructor-training courses of short duration (six to eight weeks) intended primarily for personnel who are already employed in training but have not yet had the opportunity to attend the instructor courses held in Paris or London. This programme will be proposed shortly to the United Nations Development Programme under the regional programme for 1975.

D. Recommendations

Recommendation No. 1

16. The Universal Postal Union shares the view that training projects should be attached to an existing establishment (university or training centre). So far as the least advanced countries are concerned, however, it is often difficult to find an establishment which has the material facilities available and is situated in an intellectual environment conducive to achieving the objectives of a training project at the regional level. In such cases it should be possible to organize the training in a neighbouring country, even if the latter does not belong to the category of least advanced countries.

/...

Recommendation No. 2

17. For the training of middle- and senior-grade staff, the Universal Postal Union assists in strengthening the facilities available at regional and subregional level while the training of operational and junior-grade staff is organized at the individual country level.

Recommendation No. 3

18. For some time now, the documents relating to major projects submitted by the Universal Postal Union have provided for:

(a) Follow-up action permitting evaluation of the extent to which the recommendations have been applied after completion of the project; it should be made clear, however, that those projects which provide for such action are currently in progress and it will be some time before the Universal Postal Union can acquire experience in follow-up activities;

(b) The appointment of counterpart personnel; in general, such personnel are provided when the project starts.

Recommendation No. 4

19. The Universal Postal Union will undertake to give much more extensive briefing than hitherto to international personnel responsible for the execution of projects, particularly to project managers or experts entrusted with major assignments involving the organization of training at the multinational level.

20. The report in question, accompanied by these comments, will be submitted to the Executive Council of the Universal Postal Union at its session in May 1975.

UNITED NATIONS LIBRARY * VAGNEVA * UNITED NATIONS BIBLIOTHEQUE

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

Distr.
GENERAL

E/5594/Add.9
5 November 1975
ENGLISH
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH/FRENCH/SPANISH

REPORTS OF THE JOINT INSPECTION UNIT

Report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case

(JIU/REP/73/5)

Addendum

Comments of the Director-General of the International Labour Office and action taken by the Governing Body of the ILO

A. Comments of the Director-General

1. This report, prepared by Mr. E. Ferrer-Vieyra and Mr. J. A. Sawe of the Joint Inspection Unit, reviews the UNDP-assisted regional training institutions in East Africa for the purpose of evaluating "the basic concept and the practical steps that were consequently taken" in these programmes. The review included an inspection of six major regional institutions, for one of which, the Vocational Training Centre for the East African Community, the ILO is executing agency. The ILO has also been associated with another of these, the East African Railways and Harbours Training and Development Project. The Inspectors' report is addressed to the UNDP as well as to those organizations of the United Nations family participating in the regional projects. The report is appended to this paper. A summary of this report will be found in paragraphs 45-53 of the Sixth Report on the Activities of the Joint Inspection Unit, which is also being submitted to the Committee at the present session.

Vocational Training Centre for the East African Community

2. The Inspectors are critical of this ILO project, stating "that the drafting of the project document was not felicitous" (para. 76); that the document's vagueness has not helped "to achieve the desired goals" (para. 36); "that the appointment of counterparts has been subject to long delays" (para. 43); that the project was a wrong choice on the basis of top priorities for meeting the training requirements of the East African Community (para. 39); and that a representative of the East African Community was not included in the UNDP/ILO review team which recommended drastic changes in the project in early 1973 (paras. 77 and 78).

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

Distr.
GENERAL

E/5594/Add.9
5 November 1975
ENGLISH
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH/FRENCH/SPANISH

UNITED NATIONS LIBRARY * VAINEVA * BIBLIOTHEQUE DES NATIONS UNIES GENEVE

REPORTS OF THE JOINT INSPECTION UNIT

Report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case

(JIU/REP/73/5)

Addendum

Comments of the Director-General of the International Labour Office and action taken by the Governing Body of the ILO

A. Comments of the Director-General

1. This report, prepared by Mr. E. Ferrer-Vieyra and Mr. J. A. Sawe of the Joint Inspection Unit, reviews the UNDP-assisted regional training institutions in East Africa for the purpose of evaluating "the basic concept and the practical steps that were consequently taken" in these programmes. The review included an inspection of six major regional institutions, for one of which, the Vocational Training Centre for the East African Community, the ILO is executing agency. The ILO has also been associated with another of these, the East African Railways and Harbours Training and Development Project. The Inspectors' report is addressed to the UNDP as well as to those organizations of the United Nations family participating in the regional projects. The report is appended to this paper. A summary of this report will be found in paragraphs 45-53 of the Sixth Report on the Activities of the Joint Inspection Unit, which is also being submitted to the Committee at the present session.

Vocational Training Centre for the East African Community

2. The Inspectors are critical of this ILO project, stating "that the drafting of the project document was not felicitous" (para. 76); that the document's vagueness has not helped "to achieve the desired goals" (para. 36); "that the appointment of counterparts has been subject to long delays" (para. 43); that the project was a wrong choice on the basis of top priorities for meeting the training requirements of the East African Community (para. 39); and that a representative of the East African Community was not included in the UNDP/ILO review team which recommended drastic changes in the project in early 1973 (paras. 77 and 78).

3. The Director-General agrees with the Inspectors' observations on the project document. Objectives were insufficiently precise, owing largely to the failure to resolve satisfactorily differences of opinion among the parties concerned as to the types of training to be offered at the Centre. For this, the ILO must bear some measure of responsibility. The Director-General cannot, however, agree that the project represented a wrong choice of priorities. The report does not indicate why the Inspectors reached this conclusion, except to say that the training of typists "should be left to the governments themselves" (para. 76). In fact, the main training provided has been for senior secretarial staff and instructors. Moreover, the report notes the strong interest of the East African Community in the continuation of this project (para. 77). Delay in the appointment of counterparts is a continuing problem, particularly, as in the present case, in respect of the least-developed countries. It is not correct, however, to suggest there is "an absence of real concern on this problem by the executing agencies" (para. 42). In the case of the ILO, officials in the Dar es Salaam Office made frequent representations to senior officials of the East African Community concerning the appointment of counterparts. A possible solution, if only a partial one, consists of scheduling a project in such a way as to allow for the appointment of counterparts and completion of their training, through the granting of fellowships, before experts are sent to the country concerned. It is regrettably true that no East African Community representative was included in the UNDP/ILO review mission.

4. The Director-General is convinced that despite the acknowledged difficulties with this project it has met with a fair degree of success, particularly in secretarial and instructor training. It is expected that the Centre will continue under the auspices of the East African Community after all international assistance is wound up by the end of this year.

East African Railways and Harbours Training and Development Project

5. This project is also one with which the ILO has been associated but for which the executing agency is the United Nations Office of Technical Co-operation. The Director-General concurs largely with the views expressed by the Inspectors. Indeed, the report of the 1972 Joint UNDP/United Nations/ILO Review Mission (referred to in paras. 107 and 108) highlighted the same deficiencies noted by the Inspectors (in particular, delays in getting the project fully operational on the basis of clearly stated objectives and time-table, dispersed location and control of training resulting in failure to complete training of enough counterparts). It is worth recalling in regard to paragraph 111 that the initial project request contained very specific objectives, but that subsequently these became increasingly obscured at successive stages of project development.

Revised concept of the UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries

6. Chapter IV of the report discusses lessons to be learned for UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries from the experience

/...

of the six projects surveyed in East Africa. Most of the conclusions are addressed to UNDP and, within the context of country programming, to the countries themselves. It is the latter which must determine national priorities and the specific sectors in which UNDP assistance will be sought. So far as practices for the briefing of project managers (para. 146) are concerned, these can undoubtedly be improved upon. ILO practices have in fact changed considerably over the years. The proposed means of further improving briefing practices are currently being studied, taking account of a recent thorough analysis of this question by an external collaborator.

Comments on the recommendations

7. The Inspectors' recommendations are to be found at pages 37 and 38 of the report. The Director-General's comments on them are as follows:

Recommendation 1 states that UNDP training projects in developing countries should be attached to an already existing institution, university or government training centre. The Director-General agrees that this is desirable, wherever appropriate arrangements can be made.

Recommendation 2 proposes that the setting up of multinational training institutions be encouraged as the most effective means of meeting the national requirements of a large number of small developing countries. This has been a matter of concern to the ILO, the UNDP and other agencies for many years. Any progress towards the creation of multinational training institutions, however, depends on the degree of commitment shown by the countries concerned, on the prospects for long-term viability of such institutions, on the degree to which they are meshed with national programmes and services and on the availability of resources. Although the existing distribution of UNDP resources leaves little room for intercountry projects despite a high demand for them, there are prospects of a significant upward revision in the indicative planning figures for regional, subregional and global projects in the next UNDP programming cycle.

Recommendation 3 enumerates various ways in which the contents of project documents could be improved, among other things, by making provision for certain contingencies. The UNDP, together with the agencies, has been giving particular attention to this matter in the light of the experience gained in recent years. Currently a working party set up by the UNDP is examining all the issues related to improved drafting of project documents. Without prejudice to the final outcome of this examination and the resulting modifications in procedures, the ILO would see no difficulty in subscribing to subparagraphs (a), (c) and (d). Subparagraphs (b) and (e) regarding counterpart personnel may prove impractical, as such arrangements may impinge upon matters within the scope of national sovereignty.

Recommendation 4 calls for the resident representatives and the executing agencies not to accept projects from Governments which do not imply a good use of UNDP funds according to United Nations guidelines on development. This is the kind of situation that country programming is designed to protect against.

/...

Recommendation 5 is addressed to UNDP.

Recommendation 6 regarding briefing has been commented upon in paragraph 6 above.

8. Submitted for information and observations.

Geneva, 29 August 1974.

B. Action taken by the Governing Body of the ILO

The Governing Body took note of the third report of the Programme, Financial and Administrative Committee at its 194th session, on 15 November 1974, which contained observations on the JIU report on the need for a revised concept on UNDP regional training programmes in the least developed countries: the East African case.

The observations were as follows:

Report on the Activities of the Joint Inspection Unit, July 1973-June 1974; Report on the Need for a Revised Concept on UNDP Regional Training Programmes in the Least Developed Countries: The East African Case

12. An employer member pointed out that certain observations included in the summary of the Report on the Use of Experts and Consultants in the United Nations (paras. 23 to 28 of the report on activities) coincided with complaints and comments often made by the employers about the sometimes doubtful success of missions carried out by outside experts and consultants. In the Inspectors' view, recourse to outside expertise had become excessive and could in future be substantially reduced without prejudicing essential and priority activities of the United Nations. Similar observations were also doubtless applicable in the case of the ILO, and he wondered to what extent ILO practices were reviewed and improved in the light of this kind of comment.

13. The spokesman of the employer members, referring to the summary of the Report on the Need for a Revised Concept on UNDP Regional Training Programmes in the Least Developed Countries, with reference to the East African case (paras. 46 to 53 of the report on activities) felt that the conclusion in paragraph 50 that the UNDP regional training programmes in East Africa could be considered to have had 33 per cent success and 67 per cent failure was over-severe. The failures were attributed by the Inspectors to the frequent lack of appointment of counterpart personnel; the poor quality of some projects; poorly drafted project documents; insufficient training and briefing of the project personnel and managers; and the weak institutional framework within which they operated. There was also the problem of fitting the programme into the real social and economic structure of the country or countries in which the projects were located. The ILO should take special note of the suggestions in paragraphs 50, 51 and 52, particularly the recommendation that executing agencies should brief project

/...

personnel, especially project managers, more thoroughly on the objectives of projects, the role of the project personnel in the execution of the projects and local conditions and national needs. Turning to the full text of the report referring to the East African case, he drew attention to annex I, which stressed the importance of the selection and preparation of the project manager and stated among other things that a systematic selection system seldom appeared to be applied in the appointment of these key persons. The ILO should make sure that it was not guilty of this or of submitting to political pressures in the appointment of project managers.